

1996

## Abigail v. Harvey

Lee Nash

Follow this and additional works at: [http://digitalcommons.georgefox.edu/truths\\_bright](http://digitalcommons.georgefox.edu/truths_bright)

 Part of the [Christian Denominations and Sects Commons](#)

---

### Recommended Citation

Nash, Lee, "Abigail v. Harvey" (1996). *Truth's Bright Embrace: Essays and Poems in Honor of Arthur O. Roberts*. Paper 21.  
[http://digitalcommons.georgefox.edu/truths\\_bright/21](http://digitalcommons.georgefox.edu/truths_bright/21)

This Chapter is brought to you for free and open access by the College of Christian Studies at Digital Commons @ George Fox University. It has been accepted for inclusion in Truth's Bright Embrace: Essays and Poems in Honor of Arthur O. Roberts by an authorized administrator of Digital Commons @ George Fox University.

## *Abigail v. Harvey*

### *Sibling Rivalry in the Oregon Campaign for Woman Suffrage*

LEE NASH

In the regular statewide election of June 4, 1900, Oregon's all-male electorate voted on the issue of woman suffrage for the second time. President Abigail Scott Duniway of the Oregon State Equal Suffrage Association, completing 30 years of active leadership for women's rights, stood at the height of her considerable powers. For three years she with her cohorts had prepared with particular care for this election. They arranged a systematic network of private correspondence that directed thousands of timely letters to strategic destinations. They took pains to disassociate themselves from the prohibition cause, perceived as an extraneous liability. They worked closely with the Red Cross Society. They sought and received endorsements from the Oregon Pioneer Association, the Oregon State Grange, the local segment of the Grand Army of the Republic, and leading male citizens. They courted the sympathy and support of several labor unions and secret and fraternal orders. They prepared and distributed an immense quantity of leaflets and varied papers. A four-page "Open Letter" summing up their case was published in 220 of the 229 newspapers of the state, and they enjoyed much editorial support.<sup>1</sup>

All this activity was kept as unobtrusive as possible—marches with tambourines would have hurt the cause in conservative Oregon. Yet Mrs. Duniway accompanied these effective, prudent promotions with an even

---

1. Abigail Scott Duniway, "History of Equal Suffrage in Oregon," *The Campaign Leaflet* 1 (1900), 1-6.

more delicate, sub rosa campaign. She deeply coveted the support, or at least the quiet neutrality, of the most powerful opinion-maker in the region, her brother Harvey Scott, crusty editor of the Portland *Morning Oregonian*. For the sixteen months between the legislature's decision to submit a woman suffrage amendment to the people, and the 1900 election, her intimate correspondence regularly reports her anxieties about the fluctuating barometer of brotherly love. "The only thing we fear," she wrote her son Clyde in February, 1899, "is Scott's pup—Al. Holman, and Aunt Maggie [Scott's wife] has her pry under *him*. He's an *ass*."<sup>2</sup> The previous month, assistant editor Holman had lobbied in the legislature against the suffrage amendment, which occasioned one of the periodic tense Abigail-Harvey confrontations. As appears to have been usual in those interviews, the participants carried from it differing perceptions. "Your uncle and I have an understanding," she reported, "and the *Oregonian* will be held as [a] great reserve force till I say the word."<sup>3</sup> Yet four months later Scott was telling his sister that he would "*oppose and whip*" the amendment. She then took summer courage from *Oregonian* Publisher Henry L. Pittcock's prediction that Scott would be all right on the suffrage question "when he goes to the hot springs and gets cured of rheumatism and dyspepsia." In July, also, there was a hopeful rumor that Holman would be fired.<sup>4</sup>

So it went month by anxious month through fall and winter, Abigail wary and worried privately, but cheerful in her relations with her brother, more careful than usual to avoid antagonism and cultivate harmony. In that amicable spirit Abigail and her four sisters came to dinner at the Scotts to do their brother honor on his 62nd birthday, February 1, 1900. Always subject to periods of deep depression and passionate outbursts, Harvey had one of his bad nights.<sup>5</sup> He vented his frustration in harsh verbal abuse of his sisters, especially Abigail. Hurt but unsubdued, two days later Mrs. Duniway went to see him about printing the address she was to deliver in two weeks before the National American Woman Suffrage Convention in Washington, D.C. "He made a most abject apology for what he said;" reported Wilkie Duniway to Clyde,

told her he had been worried by a multitude of things Thursday and was almost beside himself; hoped that "sister, you will forgive me"; agreed to print the [paper]; furnished her a cut without charge, and unsolicited gave her transportation; besides, acknowledged he had been wrong to oppose

---

2. Abigail Scott Duniway to Clyde A. Duniway (February 19, 1899). Abigail Scott Duniway Papers, Special Collections, University of Oregon Library, Eugene. Subsequent Duniway letters cited are from this collection.

3. *Ibid.* (February \_\_, 1899). Day of month removed.

4. *Ibid.* (June 21, July 10, 31, 1899).

5. *Ibid.* (January 29, February 20, November 21, 1900). See T. W. Davenport to George Himes, October 26, 1910. Oregon Historical Society Library, Portland.

woman suffrage, and would not do so any more. So mother is happy that the incident occurred, as it probably removed the menace of opposition from the *Oregonian* in the coming election.<sup>6</sup>

This was a beautiful and unexpected boon indeed, and suffragist forces faced the spring weeks with buoyant hope. Abigail, to be sure, harbored a shred of doubt, knowing that her brother's photographic memory, stored with all twelve books of *Paradise Lost* and a myriad of detail, could sometimes draw a total blank when it came to conversational commitments between siblings.

Scott entrained east in early May to attend the quarterly meeting of the Associated Press Directors, leaving Holman in editorial command until just before the election.<sup>7</sup> "Command" is a relative term for an era of personal journalism, of course, when the paper was an extension of the editor's mind and personality whether he was in town or not. Particularly was this true when the surrogate was Alfred Holman, who had literally grown up in the *Oregonian* offices starting with deliveries in 1869, and to whom Scott fondly referred as the "well-beloved son of my professional life."<sup>8</sup> Thus when Holman began on May 15 a 20-day, 14-editorial pre-election barrage attacking woman suffrage from every angle, one could not think Scott was innocent of the proceedings. No doubt remained of the editor's involvement when he returned long enough before the June 4 election to write a devastating 1500-word editorial summation for the June 3 issue, the strongest and most comprehensive indictment he ever made of female suffrage.

Mrs. Duniway and the OESA increased efforts at the end to counter the long-feared attack—Abigail said it was "the busiest and most important week of my life"—and still hoped for the best.<sup>9</sup> The contest was so close that the result was in doubt for nearly three weeks after the election, but the final tally spelled defeat for the suffrage cause. There was a special concentration of negative votes in Multnomah County, in the *Oregonian's* greatest circulation perimeter. The work of 30 years had failed, and Abigail Scott Duniway was as bitter in defeat as her brother seemed vauntful in victory. Fortunately for the record, she wrote a running account of feelings and actions to her son Clyde, who as a history professor at Stanford constituted both a fully trusted correspondent and one who would preserve the sources. "Pray excuse my tardiness!" she wrote him on June 27,

---

6. Wilkie Duniway to Clyde A. Duniway (February 7, 1900). Abigail Scott Duniway, *Path Breaking: An Autobiographical History of the Equal Suffrage Movement in Pacific Coast States* (Portland, 1914), 163.

7. Leslie M. Scott, "Memoranda of the Files of the *Oregonian*." Typescript, n.d., Special Collections, University of Oregon Library, Eugene. *Oregonian* (May 17, 1900), 3.

8. Alfred Holman, "Harvey W. Scott, Editor—Review of His Half-Century Career and Estimate of His Work," *Quarterly of the Oregon Historical Society*, 14 (June, 1913), 87.

9. *Oregonian* (June 2, 1900), 5.

I have been overwhelmed with hard work, and the humiliation and shame of my brother's nefarious conduct. But I am rising above it and shall go right on. We would have won triumphantly if the *Oregonian* had not stirred up the slum and slime of the city's purlieus, causing them to throw his bilge water on his own family from the ballot boxes of White Chapel district. No, his fight was not reputable. It made every real friend he had ashamed of him and his paper. But we are not whipped. We are stronger than ever. We got over 48% of the vote. 21 counties gave us a majority. One lost by a tie and one by only one vote. Hubert gave the cheap old tyrant a raking that made him sick. Then, last Sunday, I had it out with him, but not till after he said he would whip us harder than ever next time. The sweetest thing I said was 'You have stood up naked before the world and you are not ashamed!' I talked for half an hour. It seemed that I was inspired. Then, Monday, I sent out through the Associated Press, this telegram signed by my own name and office:

"Defeated, but not beaten! Yes, 26,265; No, 28,402. Leaders are jubilant over the large vote. Going right ahead! Will win next time!"<sup>10</sup>

After that memorable confrontation Scott ordered his family to stop all social contacts with Mrs. Duniway. Relationships were renewed the following year,<sup>11</sup> but after that summer Abigail's resentment was never far beneath the surface. For months she released her bitterness in letters to Clyde, while putting on a family front to the public for the sake of the future cause. "I have no words to tell you," she wrote August 30, "how I despise him." The editor of the *Oregonian* was the "cheap boy," "no brother of mine," "your mad uncle," "the coward," and "my unnatural brother, whom I hate with perfect and justifiable hatred." "My work," she wrote in September,

is going quietly on, almost as if nothing had happened except that the estrangement with Harve has not healed, nor will it till he has brought forth fruits meet for repentance.<sup>12</sup>

Part of her work that fall was to prepare a chapter entitled "History of Equal Suffrage in Oregon" for Susan B. Anthony's and Ida Husted Harper's comprehensive history of the national movement. This she published locally as the November issue of *The Campaign Leaflet*, The OESA periodical. Her first draft, the printed proofs preserved by Clyde Duniway, included three pages portraying in villainous perspective Scott's role in the recent election defeat. "It is no fault of mine," read this highly personal recent history,

10. Abigail Scott Duniway to Clyde A. Duniway (June 27, 1900).

11. Wilkie Duniway to Clyde A. Duniway, (July 7, 1900); Abigail Scott Duniway to Clyde A. Duniway (February 14 and March 12, 1901).

12. Ibid. (August 30, June 9, July 4, 17, 28, and September 9, 1900).

that I must hand him down to history in these pages as the great editor who whipped his sister at the public whipping post when she was bound hand and foot before the laws which women were compelled to sustain as taxpayers, and to which they are held amenable, even to the extent of giving up their sons, the children of their peril, to lose their lives in the service of a country in the management of which they have no voice, but which holds them as perpetual aliens through fiat of sex, no matter what their endowment of brains, patriotism or patrimony.

Miss Anthony was spared the challenge of dealing with that heroic 108-word sentence, and the entire section, when Abigail permitted herself to be persuaded to remove it from the final draft. She did have the grim satisfaction of making sure that Scott received a copy of the original unexpurgated version.<sup>13</sup> And her seething resentment persisted. In 1903 she would rejoice at Scott's defeat in the Oregon legislature for a U.S. Senate seat. While she grieved at his death in 1910, six weeks later when his will was made public she complained that he excluded Scott relatives (though "we didn't expect it—knowing the man."), and declared "He left all his children immensely rich, and his wife a millionaire. Well! She earned it—living with *him*."<sup>14</sup>

\* \* \*

This was one of those not-so-rare episodes in history when familial infelicity bore significantly on large public issues. Perhaps it is justifiable to invade the Scott-Duniway privacy long enough to gain perspective and insight into the course of the Oregon movement for women's rights. Perhaps, too, the tense drama attached to the familiar phenomenon of sibling conflict, here rendered larger than life in its societal dimensions, is worth telling for the human interest alone. Such ends require at least a brief summation of the adversaries' positions and interaction regarding woman suffrage both before and after the crucial 1900 election, followed by a modest attempt to suggest certain social and psychological dimensions of their relationship.

Converted early to the woman's movement, Abigail Scott Duniway was writing letters to the editor of the Oregon City *Argus* as a 24-year-old pioneer farm wife in 1858, declaring for the equality of the sexes. The next year she wrote an Oregon Trail novel, *Captain Gray's Company*, which showed keen sensitivity to women's disadvantages.<sup>15</sup> Then her husband Ben Duniway, without her involvement nor consent, lost their farm in the early 1860's by co-signing notes for a friend who defaulted. Soon after the family moved to town Ben suffered a handicapping accident, and Abigail become the pri-

13. Duniway, "History of Equal Suffrage in Oregon," 7. Proof sheets of the first draft, Duniway Papers. Abigail Scott Duniway to Clyde A. Duniway (November 21, 1900).

14. *Ibid.*(February 24, 1903; September 17, 1910).

mary breadwinner. First she found herself teaching school with her first class permit for half the pay of a man who had barely qualified for a third class certificate. She later took in boarders, and successfully operated a millinery shop. Business experiences confirmed her convictions and with Ben's influence brought her to conclude by the middle 1860's that the basic step toward redressing a host of economic and legal discriminations was to give women political identity with the vote.<sup>16</sup>

Doubtless stimulated both by her writing ambitions and by brother Harvey's notable success as editor of the *Oregonian* since 1865, she moved to Portland in 1871 and established a newspaper, *The New Northwest*. This high quality weekly added varied cultural features to its strong editorial promotions of women's rights, and paid its way until it was sold in 1887. Ben filled domestic roles and their five sons were active in the publication while Abigail traveled regularly throughout the region, speaking and organizing the movement, mailing back editorials, poems, and a dozen or more serialized novels, each with its feminist message. Probably no other equal suffrage paper survived so long on its own earnings, which result was directly due to Abigail's tireless creative energies and her family's considerable home efforts.

After graduation from Pacific University with the first B.A. degree awarded in the Pacific Northwest, Harvey Scott served a sort of editorial apprenticeship on the *Oregonian* from 1865 to 1872. Honing talents in writing and argumentation, he adhered faithfully to the Radical Republican line on political issues. On topics where he was permitted opinions of his own in those early years he tended to be progressive, and this included women's issues. He censured the universal practice of paying women one-third to one-half the salary men received for the same work, and he published comparative scales, by sex, for teachers' salaries across the land.<sup>17</sup> He welcomed Abigail's *New Northwest* in May, 1871, with an admiring editorial notice and an "extremely cordial" visit after her first issue. As Collector of Customs in Portland 1870-76, the appointment a lucrative reward for faithful party work, Scott hired Ben Duniway in 1873 as "Opener and Packer" in the customs office at \$1,300 annually, a fine salary for those depressed times.<sup>18</sup>

In September, 1871, Mrs. Duniway sponsored Susan B. Anthony in a Northwest lecture tour, and women's issues, especially woman suffrage,

---

15. *Oregon Argus* (December 18, 1858; January 11, 1859). Mrs. Abigail J. Duniway, *Captain Gray's Company; or Crossing the Plains and Living in Oregon* (Portland, 1859). This is the first of over 200 adult and juvenile novels with overland trail settings. "Oregon Trail Fiction Plus California and Mormon Trail Titles: A Bibliography," unpublished manuscript prepared by the writer.

16. Duniway, *Path Breaking*, 13-40; Leslie McKay Roberts, "Suffragist of the New West: Abigail Scott Duniway and the Development of the Oregon Woman Suffrage Movement" (B. A. Thesis, Reed College, 1969), 32.

17. *Oregonian* (May 13, 1867), 2; (September 18, 1869), 2.

achieved new levels of prominence in the region. Of all Portland male editors, as historian Tom Edwards has shown, Scott discussed these issues at greatest depth, and most sympathetically.<sup>19</sup> He felt the suffragists held unrealistically high hopes for the benefits the vote would bring them, argued that citizenship did not necessarily insure the suffrage, and took a rigid stand that “fixed laws of nature” would forever keep women in their domestic “sphere.” But he answered some of the particularly chauvinistic jibes against women made by his editorial rivals, and refrained from ridiculing Miss Anthony where she made herself most vulnerable. “As an individual,” he wrote, “we shall probably vote for woman suffrage when the question is presented.”<sup>20</sup> All told, it suggested the possibility of an effective Scott editorial alliance on women’s rights, a hopeful first year for Abigail’s public career.

Scott was out of the *Oregonian* editorship from 1872 to 1877, returning as part owner at 39, mature, studied, and more independent. From 1877 through 1883 he promoted his sister’s lectures, contributed financially to her cause, and gave woman suffrage occasional editorial support.<sup>21</sup> The month of November, 1883, a crucial time with the suffrage issue before the Washington territorial legislature, saw no less than three pro-suffrage editorials in the paper, and represents the apex of Harvey’s early public alliance with Abigail. The third of those essays, written after the measure had been voted through in Olympia, took up in detail several objections to woman suffrage raised by a Washington reader. All these were “considered and disposed of long ago,” said Scott. They were the sort of questions

invariably asked by persons who have but just begun to think on the subject. After they have become familiar with it they no longer find the difficulties which at first seemed to them so great. Indeed the difficulties vanish, having no existence outside the imagination.

Is the anti-suffrage male, Scott asked rhetorically, really prepared to assert that his wife, mother, and sisters are inferior to him in judgment, in

---

18. Ibid. (May 5, 1871), 2; Duniway, *Path Breaking*, 32; H. W. Scott to Hon. Secretary William A. Richardson, (June 21, 1873; endorsed as approved July 11, 1873), Record Group 56, Customhouse Nominations Portland, Oregon, Department of the Treasury, the National Archives, Washington, D. C.

19. G. Thomas Edwards, *Sowing Good Seeds: The Northwest Suffrage Campaigns of Susan B. Anthony* (Portland, 1990), 19-82, 111-122. Professor Edwards’ book covers Anthony’s contacts with Duniway from 1871 to 1905, providing rich setting and background for this essay.

20. *Oregonian* (September 16, 1871), 2; (September 19, 1871), 2; (December 6, 1871), 2; (January 8, 1872), 2.

21. Ibid. (April 20, 1877), 2; Abigail Scott Duniway’s Record Book of 1883 Contributions, Duniway Papers; *New Northwest* (May 1, 1879), 2. See *Oregonian* (October 25, 1912), 12, for Mrs. Duniway’s generally accurate summary of how Scott related to the suffrage question from 1871 forward.

patriotism, in love of good government? They are not disqualified from voting because they don't "hold office, perform road work, do jury duty, pay poll taxes," or go to war, since half or more of voting males also avoid those things. The assumption that politics would degrade the ladies betrayed an unfortunately low view of public life, which should concern all moral men as well as women. "The whole sum of the matter," he concluded, is that woman is capable of exerting an influence in public affairs which the state needs, and this influence can be made effective only through the suffrage. Prejudice may for awhile prevent it, but no argument can stand for a moment in its way.<sup>22</sup>

It was a handsome endorsement of Abigail's cause, and of Washington Territory's decision to enfranchise women. She would treasure the clippings and the memories for 30 years, hoping for a sequel. By the next spring, however, Scott had cooled toward the issue to the point that the *Oregonian* did not support the woman suffrage amendment to the Oregon state constitution when it was before the voters for the first time on June 2, 1884. He was on a trip east for several weeks around election time, and S.B. Pettingill, his assistant, maintained a neutral stance on the woman's question, publishing both hostile and supportive correspondence.<sup>23</sup> The amendment lost decisively, 28,176 to 11,223.<sup>24</sup> By 1887 Harvey Scott was refuting some of the same arguments for woman suffrage that he had advanced four years before, and he lent his influence to the decision of the Washington State Constitutional Convention in 1888 to deny women the vote in the new state.<sup>25</sup>

Several factors moved Scott to reverse his position on the suffrage question in the 1880's. He seemed, first, to consider the lopsided Oregon defeat of 1884 an indication that the opposition was too great to combat practically. Washington's reversal of its earlier stand confirmed Scott's view that woman suffrage was a dying cause. He wrote repeatedly during those years that only a minority of women themselves wanted to vote, and those generally the discontented and the uneducated. With the redress of certain legal and economic grievances by legislative acts, woman suffrage was, moreover, less and less needed. He was concerned, too, about the strong alliance generally in Washington and elsewhere between prohibitionist and suffragist forces. If they had the vote, he feared, women would be betrayed by their sentimental nature to take similarly "unsound" positions on other issues, such as capital punishment.<sup>26</sup>

---

22. *Oregonian* (November 30, 1883), 2. See *Ibid.* (November 4, 1883), 4; and (November 26, 1883), 4.

23. *Ibid.* (June 1, 1884), 5; *New Northwest* (June 5, 1884), 4; (June 19, 1884), 4.

24. Charles Henry Carey, *History of Oregon* (Chicago and Portland, 1922), 826.

25. *Oregonian* (July 12, 1887), 4; (January 14, 1888), 4.

Faithful study of Edmund Burke and Herbert Spencer had equipped Scott with a variety of conservative convictions by the late 1870's, and in the next decade he came increasingly to recognize that philosophical, political, economic, and social conservatism was no natural ally to woman suffrage. In Washington the issue was "buried in the same grave with the single-tax proposition," and its successes in the 1890's in Kansas, Colorado, and Idaho "was but an outgrowth of the temporary socialistic spirit that prevails in those states."<sup>27</sup> Scott was confirmed in these conclusions when Mrs. Duniway opposed his long-standing fight against inflation in all its forms, culminating in the campaign for sound money and McKinley against William Jennings Bryan and free silver in the presidential election of 1896. Abigail also opposed his campaign against free high schools, and she enjoyed the patronage and friendship of his most hated political enemy, U.S. Senator John H. Mitchell.<sup>28</sup>

All such considerations led Scott periodically to inveigh against woman suffrage after the mid-1880's and prepared him for the major editorial capstone of his views on the subject, released the day before the crucial 1900 election. Aileen S. Kraditor has helpfully identified at least 30 antisuffragist ideas current between 1890 and 1920, and it is worth noting that Scott made use of about half of them.<sup>29</sup> Most of his arguments appear in some form in the 1900 essay, plus a theme or two that Kraditor overlooked. If it is unneedful to deal fully with each nuance of his views, it might yet be useful to sample his rhetoric and suggest what Abigail and her allies were up against. "There is far too little deliberation in the exercise of the suffrage now," Scott emphasized.

Introduction of the feminine element would immensely increase this evil. For women as a rule are less deliberate than men. A due sense of the proportion of things; an adequate subordination of impulse to reason; an habitual regard to the ultimate and unexaggerated judgment, are elements which already are lamentably wanting in political life, and female suffrage certainly would not tend to increase them.

Men were "deplorably deficient" and "flighty" in understanding public affairs, but "all the evils that belong to indiscriminate male suffrage would

---

26. Ibid. (July 12, 1887), 4; (August 12, 1889), 4; (October 8, 1889), 4; (June 8, 1890), 6. See *New Northwest* (January 6, 1887), 1, Mrs. Duniway's final issue, where she takes a last dig at Scott, his sources, and his reasoning.

27. *Oregonian* (November 12, 1898), 4. On his Burkean conservatism see Ibid. (October 17, 1901), 10; (August 20, 1910), 6.

28. Abigail Scott Duniway to Clyde A. Duniway (January 15, 1894); (June 2, 1895); *New Northwest* (March 4, 1880), 2. She was also the friend of leftist attorney-poet C. E. S. Wood, another Scott *bete noire*. Duniway, *Path Breaking*, 12, 58, 59.

29. Aileen S. Kraditor, *The Ideas of the Woman Suffrage Movement, 1890-1920* (New York and London, 1965), 14-38.

be more than doubled by indiscriminate suffrage to women.” One of the problems lay in the fact that “the conservative woman as a rule is probably feminine and likely to stay at home while the radical woman is pretty sure to go forth rejoicing to the fray.” “Moreover,” declared Scott, warming to his message and pursuing a seemingly original line of thought,

with women, even more than with men, there is a strong disposition to overrate the curative powers of legislation, to attempt to mould the lives of all persons in their details by meddlesome or restraining laws, and the vast increase of female influence which the suffrage would give could hardly fail to increase that habit of excessive legislation which is one the great evils of the time.

Women themselves had no further legal nor economic wrongs to be redressed; the laws, in fact, now discriminated in favor of the wife in matters involving property and children. “Government,” Scott continued,

is a very practical business. It is very strenuous business. For government in its final analysis is always force; and if rash measures get the community into trouble, it is by men that it must be got out again. In the last resort, it is physical strength that rules the world, and it is in man, not in woman, that this last court of appeal resides.

All of this was not to imply that woman was inferior to man. In fact her special qualities in the “affections and graces” may be more important than man’s practical qualities, but they did not equip her to govern. “Herein,” the editor concluded,

are the chief reasons why, as the *Oregonian* thinks, woman is as little fitted for political as man is for domestic life. Women suffrage, therefore, cannot be good for government and society, nor for woman herself; and womanly women see all this through their intuition as clearly as manly men apprehend it through their judgment and reason.<sup>30</sup>

For century’s turn it was an impressive blend of bellicose realpolitik, anti-democratic elitism, Victorian decorum, and frontier male chauvinism. Its still-timely preachments fell on itching ears in the Oregon electorate, and Abigail was undone.

If the editorial of June 3, 1900 represented Scott’s most effective effort on its subject, it may also be considered his antisuffragist valedictory. Never again in the decade remaining him was he to mount an editorial campaign against woman suffrage nor write a hostile leader on the subject. It is clear in retrospect that his 1900 victory over the suffragist forces was so decisive,

---

30. *Oregonian* (June 3, 1900), 6.

despite the narrow margin, that further campaigning would have been redundant. The momentum of 1900 greatly hurt later equal suffrage campaigns in 1906, 1908, and 1910, as did the declining energies and involvement of Mrs. Duniway. Scott maintained neutrality in the first two elections, and was three months in his grave at the third. But his views were known. "The *Oregonian* has not changed its mind," he wrote in response to several inquiries before the 1906 election, "but is tired of the contention."<sup>31</sup> Scott may have recognized that the suffrage amendment would lose without his current opposition, as indeed it did by increasing margins: 10,000 votes in 1906, 22,000 in 1908, nearly 24,000 in 1910. Two years after Scott's death the *Oregonian* actively supported the suffrage measure for the first time, and despite the dedicated efforts of Leslie Scott to use his father's negative influence from the grave, the women finally won, by 4,000 votes.<sup>32</sup> Abigail was there to savor victory, her spirit powerful still amid physical infirmities at 78. And she did savor it, but she never forgot that in all probability her triumph would have come twelve years sooner had the *Oregonian* been neutral in 1900, earlier still had her brother supported her cause.

\* \* \*

That much told, the historian has fulfilled his journeyman responsibilities. The narrative is presented, the attitudes described, the ideas rationalized, the documentation recorded. Yet thoughtful practitioners have long known that there is more to intellectual history than the intellect. *Homo Sapiens*, including the intelligentsia of the species, are moved by ganglia and viscera as well as the cerebrum. Their range of styles in relating to others arises out of the complexities of early social environment. They live through identifiable stages in life that affect their thinking and judgments. Having combed, or rather brushed, some of what developmental psychologists unabashedly call their "literature," I would like to make some closing modest suggestions of extra-rational factors that may have been part of the historic Scott contention. This without serious psycho-historic pretensions, and with several common sense extrapolations.

---

31. Ibid. (June 2, 1906), 8.

32. Carey, *History of Oregon*, 904-905. Leslie Scott wired several of his father's early associates for their recollections of the editor's views on woman suffrage, hoping to use their replies just before the election. F. A. Carle to Leslie M. Scott (October 20, 1912); Alfred Holman to Leslie M. Scott (October 29, 1912); Ernest Bross to Leslie M. Scott (October 29, 1912); N. J. Levinson to Leslie M. Scott (October 31, 1912). Scott Family Papers, in possession of Leslie M. Scott family, Portland, Oregon. Margaret N. Scott, the editor's widow, joined son Leslie's campaign with an anti-suffragette letter to the *Oregonian*, which was reprinted and widely distributed, and answered effectively by Mrs. Duniway. *Oregonian* (October 11, 1912), 12; (October 25, 1912), 12.

Prominent among Abigail Jane Scott's earliest recollections was the severe disappointment of her parents at the fact that their first children to survive infancy were girls. As the second of those daughters, born October 22, 1834, Abigail recalled "my mother informed me on my tenth birthday that her sorrow over my sex was almost too grievous to be borne." At the birth of a later daughter the mother told Abigail, through her tears, "Poor baby! She'll be a woman someday! Poor baby! A woman's lot is so hard!"<sup>33</sup> The corollary of this traumatic early rejection by gender was the great joy and continuing affirmation that greeted the birth of the first surviving son, Harvey, on February 1, 1838, 39 months after Abigail's arrival. The frontier Illinois farm, and Oregon Country counterparts later, needed strong sons. Harvey's superior family standing and "value" relative to his six sisters was still further enhanced when his two younger brothers died early, one on the Oregon Trail in 1852 at three years, the other at 18 in 1862.<sup>34</sup>

Abigail's impressions from her mother, Ann Roelofson Scott, were driven home by the events of 1851 and 1852, when John Tucker Scott, the father, was preparing to migrate overland to Oregon. On September 8, 1851, a few weeks before her twenty-first wedding anniversary, Mrs. Scott gave birth to her twelfth child, another unwanted girl who died the same day. The mother was ill and weak all that winter, and quietly opposed, but in a patriarchal era would not veto, the projected trip to Oregon. On the last day of spring, 1852, having jostled along in the springless prairie schooner for 80 days, she died beside the Platte of the plains cholera, a worn-out invalid at 40 years of age. Thirteen months later, Abigail Jane followed her mother's path and the expectations of frontier society by herself becoming a hard-working farm wife, and in ten months a daughter arrived to begin the familiar pattern of biennial babies. There would be six of them.<sup>35</sup>

The frontier environment offered Harvey a variant set of experiences, also difficult but somehow co-operating more happily with his fulfillment than did his sister's drudgery with hers. Campaigns against rampaging Indians in the Yakima War at 17; hard outdoor work in clearing farmsites, building cabins, logging, and following the Boise basin gold rush—all such activities confirmed his aggressive, confident manhood, his expected role. He postponed marriage until he enjoyed a dependable income, as it was socially acceptable for a male to do. The thoughtful, well-read Scott clan even respected the atypical passion he felt to study Latin and Greek and get a college education. The greater range of his options than those of his sisters was readily apparent, and expanded yet further with his degree, as he served as Portland's first librarian, studied law, and finally became editor. At

33. Duniway, *Path Breaking*, 3, 8.

34. Harvey W. Scott, *History of the Oregon Country*. Compiled by Leslie M. Scott. (Cambridge, MA: 1924), I, 275.

35. *Ibid.*, III, 239, 248-49, 272; Duniway, *Path Breaking*, 3-9.

the *Oregonian* helm Scott immediately conformed to the clearly understood “macho” norm of a fighting frontier editor.<sup>36</sup> Editors were *expected* publicly and visibly to be tough, combative, elemental, insensitive, uncompromising—in short, to demonstrate a sampling of the lesser proofs of virile masculinity. Scott fought a victorious street brawl with rival editor Jimmy O’Meara after a bitterly-contested election in 1866, during which he was obliged to disarm his pistol-packing opponent. He later took to carrying a firearm himself, and drew it in anger on at least one occasion.<sup>37</sup> All of this is intended to suggest the great gulf between socially-accepted sex roles for men and women in the 1860’s. Abigail opposed powerful taboos when she launched the *New Northwest*. And Harvey faced massive barriers in trying to take her mission seriously, and to consider whether and how he should relate to that mission.

If those several factors would seem to strain brother-sister ties, they appear even more significant in the light of recent psychological research on children of various ages. Of all sibling relationships, these studies conclude, the most volatile, quarrelsome, and competitive are commonly between a girl and her younger brother. The sister tends to be jealous of her commonly less responsible and more heartily affirmed brother. She is also greatly stimulated by the relationship, scoring highest of all individuals studied in curiosity, creativity, tenacity, and ambition. The brother tends to be more withdrawn, depressive, exhibitionistic, selfish, and uncooperative, ranking low in friendliness, and is “highly quarrelsome at all ages.”<sup>38</sup>

Everything we know of the Abigail-Harvey relationship, including her memories of physical beatings she sustained at his hand as a child, identifies them as a classic, intensified case of sister-younger brother sibling rivalry. When she started her newspaper she did not consult at all with Scott on details, and her opening editorial asserted, “if we had been a man, we’d have had an editor’s position at a handsome salary at twenty-one.” This gratuitous egoism was an obvious reference to brother Harvey, who had failed to attain such a position until the advanced age of 27. It is clear that Scott was always a more important and prominent factor in her social environment than she was in his, and that recognizing this fact she resented it. Disappointments impelled her repeatedly to consider what might have been. In her 1914 autobiography she expressed her belief that Scott would have supported her mission “if I had not been his sister.”<sup>39</sup>

---

36. For a more extended, documented account of these themes, see Lee Nash, “Scott of the *Oregonian*: Literary Frontiersman,” *Pacific Historical Review*, (August, 1976), 357-68.

37. Matthew P. Deady to James W. Nesmith (June 11, 1866). Deady Papers, Oregon Historical Society Library, Portland; *Oregonian* (March 12, 1868), 2; Scott Family Scrapbook, 90, Scott Family Papers.

38. Brian Sutton-Smith and B. G. Rosenberg, *The Sibling* (New York, 1970), 148-52.

Throughout the twelve years of public cordiality Scott and the *Oregonian* displayed toward Mrs. Duniway, 1871 through 1883, there were underlying tensions and private arguments. “The terror of my boyhood” in the 1870’s, recalled Clyde Duniway half a century later, was to see family reunions destroyed as his mother and his uncle went at it hammer and tong at their father’s home in Forest Grove.<sup>40</sup> The father, to be sure, himself a powerful personality, did all he could to exercise a moderating influence upon the more destructive intrafamily disputes, and to enlist Harvey’s public support of his sister. “Jen [Abigail Jane was called “Jenny” in the family] lectured here last Friday night,” John Tucker Scott typically wrote his son in early 1873.

She acquitted herself *nobly* and earned the favor of all who heard her. The house was *full*.

And now Harve let me say to you that it will be to the interest of the Republican party to remember her in the distribution of the federal offices. Give her...the Post Office... . The fact is the “*Woman movement*” will hold the balance [*sic*] of power in all our coming elections, and we cannot ignore so powerful an ally as *Jen* with her “*New Northwest*” will be to the Republican party. I hope that her claims will be considered and *justice* done, and that *you* will aid her all that is in your power consistent with your duty as a *brother* and an influential public man.<sup>41</sup>

While Abigail Jane never got the Post Office, John Tucker Scott exercised a major restraining influence upon Harvey. The editor admiringly regarded his father as a “pioneer of pioneers” for his awesome physical strength, his “mighty and invincible nature,” raw courage, and many exploits. Harvey was greatly affected by John Tucker Scott’s death on September 1, 1880, which was followed the next February by another trauma, the death of his promising ten-year-old son, Kenneth.<sup>42</sup> These events shook the foundations of Scott’s life at age 42, and removed the authority figure to whom he had always looked as a moral guide. He entered, during those hard months,

---

39. Abigail Scott Duniway to Clyde A. Duniway (June 21, 1899); *New Northwest* (May 5, 1871, 2; Duniway, *Path Breaking*, 31-32. Harvey’s prominence in Abigail’s consciousness is fictionally portrayed in the two youths in her two published novels, “Herbert” in *Captain Gray’s Company* and “Harry” in *From the West to the West: Across the Plains to Oregon* (Chicago, 1905). The latter was the younger brother of the heroine, who was obviously a youthful Abigail. Herbert and Harry are both portrayed favorably as outspoken, impulsive, and mischievous.

40. Interviews with David C. Duniway (August 9, 1969; October 3, 1979).

41. John Tucker Scott to Harvey Scott (January 21, 1873), Scott Family Papers. Abigail was recognized as a highly effective public speaker and Harvey was awkward in delivery and demeanor on the platform, another probable source of jealous tension.

42. Harvey Scott to Margaret N. Scott, (September 4, 1880), Scott Family Papers; *Oregonian* (September 2, 1880), 2; Scott, *History of the Oregon Country*, I, 9. Scott’s personal scrapbook holds several clippings and poems relating to both deaths on the same page, Scott Family Scrapbook, Scott Family Papers.

what Yale psychologist Daniel J. Levinson calls the “Mid-life Transition,” the door to “middle adulthood.” And as he sorted out his emotions and his options in the early 1880’s, he achieved the new levels of “individuation” and take-charge independence first described by Carl Jung as the natural accompaniment of the start of the second half of life.<sup>43</sup> One of the noticeable results was for him to go public with his underlying convictions on woman suffrage.

When Harvey Scott entered his sixties in 1898, his crowning public triumph just behind him of “saving” Oregon for McKinley and sound money in 1896, he made some conscious transitions in interest and style. Vigorous fights remained, to be sure, especially with the new *Oregon Journal* after 1902, but his general tendency was to mellow and modify traditional hostilities, toward Senator Mitchell and free high schools, for two examples.<sup>44</sup> He became relatively less concerned for current contentions, and more for cultural projects such as the Oregon Historical Society and the Lewis and Clark Exposition, and for his own reputation and historic standing. He was greatly interested in topping off his career in the U. S. Senate, and worked hard behind the scenes to that end, though unsuccessfully.<sup>45</sup>

All of this made the late attack in 1900 on Abigail and woman suffrage untimely and unseemly, a sort of last battle against a particularly persistent foe, one with whom he had special emotional ties. After his victory and the year-long breach, he consistently tried to relate cordially to Abigail, recognizing belatedly the importance of family when one sought to appraise his life and shore up for old age. The most dramatic public expression of this effort to compensate for his failure to follow John Tucker Scott’s early admonitions as to his brotherly duties occurred in August, 1906. “The Oregonian has not supported woman suffrage,” wrote Scott in an untitled editorial note,

but has opposed it; ... But it will say it has been an interested witness of the effort for it during the whole period of the agitation in Oregon, these forty years. It was begun by Mrs. Duniway, and has been carried on by her unceasingly; and whatever progress it has made is due to her more than to all other agencies together... . The progress it has made is an extraordinary tribute to one woman’s energy. Richard Realf wrote of one who—

---

43. Daniel J. Levinson, *The Seasons of a Man’s Life* (New York, 1978), 23-33.

44. George S. Turnbill, *History of Oregon Newspapers* (Portland, 1939), 131; Lee Nash, “Harvey Scott’s ‘Cure for Drones’: An Oregon Alternative to Public Higher Schools,” *Pacific Northwest Quarterly*, 64 (April, 1973), 70, 78-79.

45. Lee M. Nash, “Scott of the *Oregonian*: The Editor as Historian,” *Oregon Historical Quarterly*, 70 (September, 1969), 196-232; *Oregonian* (February 21, 1903), 1; Jonathan Bourne, Jr. to H. W. Scott (March 8, 1906), Jonathan Bourne, Jr. Papers, Special Collections, University of Oregon Library, Eugene.

Did not wait till Freedom had become  
the easy shibboleth of the Courtier's lips.  
But smote for her when God himself seemed dumb,  
And all his arching skies were in eclipse.

If woman suffrage is a synonym for freedom, as its advocates claim, these lines are fit eulogy of Abigail Scott Duniway.<sup>46</sup>

It was not as pleasing to Abigail as that elusive alliance would have been, and it may not finally have absolved Harvey from lingering guilt. But it was more than he ever said for any other of his many vanquished enemies through the decades. And he said it here, obviously, because sibling rivalry held a different quality than his other contentions. Ties of blood asserted themselves in this last stage of the longtime love-hate relationship with sister Abigail, and his warmer impulses finally prevailed.

---

46. *Oregonian* (August 20, 1906), 6.