

4-25-1903

Communication on Alaska Quaker Missions

George Fox University Archives

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.georgefox.edu/alaskan_mission_papers

Recommended Citation

George Fox University Archives, "Communication on Alaska Quaker Missions" (1903). *Alaskan Missions Papers*. 9.

https://digitalcommons.georgefox.edu/alaskan_mission_papers/9

This Book is brought to you for free and open access by the Alaskan Missions Collection at Digital Commons @ George Fox University. It has been accepted for inclusion in Alaskan Missions Papers by an authorized administrator of Digital Commons @ George Fox University. For more information, please contact arolfe@georgefox.edu.

J.G. Brady -2-

You further say, "As matters now stand you cannot all make your living upon Annette Island, or at least are not doing so. So it would be absurd to think of confining you to its limits unless the Government wishes to build your houses and furnish you with clothing and food, and I feel certain you do not want to lower yourselves to such a place".

The first thought that occurred to me on reading the foregoing lines was, what a pity they were not spoken by you in person when on your recent visit to Ketchikan you addressed our people at a public meeting. Instead of that these startling sentiments first reached us through one of our natives with whom you had a conversation in Sitka and were eagerly made a pretext by a few malcontents to raise a hue and cry. Such inflammatory utterances as "Our eyes are now open", "We are being deceived and misled", "We must take steps without delay to become free men", naturally caused an agitation and carried some of our people for a time off their feet. Edward Hareiden, supposed to be the native Missionary at Samman, but who is in reality a mischief maker at Ketchikan, where he spends more than half his time, readily placed himself at the head of the faction, and further intensified the alarm by telling our people, that being on a Reservation, they are not really under the American flag, but under a flag of their own.

It will, I feel sure, strike all who know anything of the native character, that such alarms, though they are false alarms, cannot but be prejudicial to the growth of loyalty among our people. To their minds, the opinions you have expressed insinuate underhandedness on the part of the Government, and insincerity or ignorance on the part of their friends.

Now as to the question at issue. I have to say that while it is true that our people are on a Reservation it is not true that they are under the Reservation system. That you know as well as I do. Not any of the restraints, regulations and characteristics common to Indian Reservations have been affixed to the Congressional Act by which our people occupy Annette Island, and for this very good reason our people are not savages, but a Christian, self-supporting and law-abiding Community from the day they migrated to Alaska.

I further deny it to be true that the policy of the United States with regard to Alaskan Natives is to place them under the Reservation system. And as to supposing the Government will ever think of fettering or cooping up a thrifty and progressive people and then feeding them and clothing them in idleness, I can only regard the bare suggestion of such a measure as a libel upon its integrity and common sense. How can it be possible that a Nation which is now sacrificing blood and treasure to free an Alien race from oppression and wrong, could ever be capable of inflicting an uncalled for insult on a handful of helpless people under its own flag, and

Secretary of the Interior, are our people on that account to take it for granted that he will use his authority to their detriment? Are they not rather justified in taking just the opposite view? Reasoning that as Congress can trust him with that authority surely they may safely trust him too.

X
X
[I tell our people to rest assured that when the time comes for the Secretary of the Interior to take action in regard to the Island it will not be for their detriment, but for their betterment. All they need to do is to live properly and thus prove themselves to be worthy of his confidence, and then face the future without any fear.

The late Secretary of the Interior took a noble stand on our peoples behalf, giving his "unqualified disapproval" to the attempt made by certain persons, some two years ago, to alienate a portion of Annette Island; and we have no reason to doubt but that the present Incumbent of that responsible office, will be as firm and considerate as his predecessor.

From what I have written it will appear to you that I am far from regarding the Act of Congress March 3, 1891, as a trouble-breeder; rather do I regard it as wise and beneficent legislation, which, if it was extended to every tribe of natives in Alaska would prove, I believe, a mighty factor for their uplifting in civilized life. It would assure them a permanent home in the land of their fathers, and give them confidence in the good will of the Government.

While therefore I do not favor in the least degree what is termed the Reservation system, I would earnestly recommend the Government to set aside small Reservations for every Native settlement in Alaska before it be too late, and thus encourage every Band to build for itself a civilized home that cannot be invaded by Saloons or other demoralizing institutions.

To instance the necessity for Governmental Action in this direction I need only refer to the sorry condition and prospects of the Natives at Sitka, Fort Wrangel, Ketchikan and Saxman. As for Sitka it is a shame for so large a band of Natives, after so many years of contact with Teachers and Government Officials, to be still huddled together as they are, so hemmed up by the whites, that it is impossible for them ever to possess a decent town site where they are. And what do the Fort Wrangel Natives show for the labor of twenty years for their welfare by Missionary and school teacher? The answer is a pitiable return indeed, probably they are worse rather than better, and for which their location is mainly responsible. Then as to the Tongas and Cape Fox Natives, who have been encouraged to leave their respective villages, which the Government were pledged to preserve to them and to settle among the whites at Ketchikan and Saxman on land over which they have no secure tenure, Surely they are to be pitied for demoralization stares them in the face.

civil life to which they must aim to reach. When the late Judge Bugbee was District Judge of Alaska I wrote to him specially on this behalf. And at the present time there is a communication of mine in the Office of the Secretary of the Interior, written at the request of the late Incumbent in which I again plead for citizenship for our people. Thus you will see that your information as to my steps on this matter was not reliable.

Now in regard to the general question of Citizenship it has to be kept in mind that the standpoint from which the natives view the question is not the same from which you and I view it. The natives see but one side of the question, the benefits and status it confers; but as for the other side the duties and the responsibilities it entails they very dimly realize it. As a proof of my assertion I may mention that our people have of late availed themselves of every opportunity offered them for reaching the ears of the Government to beg for the erection of a Government Industrial School at Metlakatla such as the Puyallip Indians near Tacoma possess, showing very clearly that while they are crying for citizenship they are also more than willing to be treated as paupers, or wards of the Government.

Nor is this cry due to their having no school or industrial teaching at Metlakatla. They have both. But the Puyallip School provides food, clothing and fun for their young men and maidens without cost during the winter months, and for these extra benefits they are ready you see to avail themselves of the Reservation system. These facts suggest caution in dealing with them. They are still children in many respects and need the same watchful care, guidance, and discipline.

This brings me to notice your advice to our people in respect to individual ownership of land, implying that by each taking possession of 160 acres of land, they would then get rid of the odium which the Reservation system casts upon them, and become an independent people.

Again I have to differ from you, for while it may be made to appear to the native a grand thing to own 160 acres of land, yet you and I know enough of the native and the country to assure us that such an acquisition would be to him no benefit at all. The Natives are not farmers, nor ever will be in Alaska. Annette Island is not adapted for farming, nor has the Indian either the will or the means for clearing forest. It is therefore easy to see what would happen to the acquisition when the day came for paying the land tax. Would the natives be likely to pay taxes for what he could not utilize? Hence the land would pass out of his possession for inability to meet his obligations.

This presents another view to be taken of your recommendation. If some of our people were to act upon your advice would not

the first statement you are very much in error. From my Wages Account Book, kept since our arrival in Alaska twelve years ago to the end of last year, the total amount disbursed to employees is \$334,803.47, and this amount does not include a number of items of expenditures for material bought of the natives. Now if this sum represents only five per cent of the wages earned by our people the whole amount of their earnings would be the enormous sum of \$6,696,069.40, which you can at once see is absurdly too much. If you had reported twenty five per cent instead of five per cent you would, I believe, still be under the mark.

The question of finding remunerative employment for so large a community of thrifty men as we have here is a difficult one. We have, however, done fairly well, for we have more industrial work carried on by our people at their own home than is found in any other settlement of Natives in Alaska. Still we are seeking for more and hope that mining will soon be added to our list.

This brings me to notice the clashing of our people with their neighbors of which you speak. If this charge is true, I should take it to be no wonder, for are not all persons, whites as well as Natives, clashing with their neighbors in the rush of business? But here again your complainant is at fault. He has put the shoe on the wrong foot. The clashing of which he complains is at fishing stations; and if he had said the Employees of a California Syndicate, who come each season to harvest Alaska, but sow no seed, are clashing with the Tlinkit Native fishermen whose rights to fish have been undisputed till the whites came, he would have told the truth. Now it is because these Tlinkit Natives choose to sell some of their fish to the Metlakantla Cannery that our people are charged with clashing with their neighbors. Most of our Tsimshian fishermen go to the Skeena River in British Columbia, being importuned each season to do so by the Cannery Agents. Some of our people are also employed by Canneries in Alaska, but nearly all who fish for Metlakantla Cannery are Alaskan Natives who are not on the Reservation but who do the clashing complained of.

From what I have written I think you will agree with me that while our people are seeking to obtain a livelihood by honest industry they should not be intimidated for fear of clashing with the malicious greed of their neighbors.

This brings me to the last point in your Report upon which I have anything to say, and which is as follows:

"To aggravate this whole matter, minerals have been discovered upon Annette Island and miners say they are very rich. Mr. Duncan has had them examined and his experts have informed him that they do not amount to much. At any rate Mr. Duncan wants the miners to stay away from the Island as he is fearful that they edge in and have a corrupting and demoralizing influence among his people". You might have added that my fears

J. G. Brady. -3-

EX-100-3
No. 16

A

to commit an injustice upon a loyal community who have built their homes on the good faith of the Government. The question resolves itself to this, Shall our Settlement be sacrificed, all its material and moral achievements be thrown away to gratify a few miners? Another question is, Shall the object lesson which Metlakatla offers to 30,000 natives of Alaska be obliterated and lost that room may be made for one more mining camp in the world? I sincerely hope the Congress of the United States will continue to give its emphatic answer NO to these questions.

Our Natives have still need of all the protection to their home life which the Government can give them. If their homes are kept safe and pure, prosperity will assuredly follow; but if their homes are violated then inevitable disaster will overwhelm their settlement.

Metlakatla owes its present happy condition, under God, to the three blessings, Unsectarian Christianity-Unity of its people and isolation of its homes from contaminating influences. The latter blessing Metlakatla owes to the Government, and if it is continued I feel sure our people will continue to grow in fitness for citizenship, a light to their native brethren, and an honor to the fostering care of the Government.

I have the honor to be,

Yours very respectfully,

(Signed) William Duncan.

ONE YEAR \$3.00
 SIX MONTHS 1.50
 FOUR MONTHS 1.00
 SINGLE COPIES10

Document No. 4-25
 Folder No. 19

1903
 4-25

Ketchikan, Alaska, April 26 1903

My Dear Mr. Duncan:

I am commissioned by a very wealthy party to make you a proposition looking to the opening up of Annette Island, or rather a part thereof, with your consent. The proposition is one which almost any person less worldly than yourself would be willing to accept, and comes from a gentleman who is an admirer of yours, although I do not think you have ever met him--one who is enthusiastic in his praise of the good work you have accomplished, and who would take no step in the direction indi-

(Page 2)

cated without your full consent. His proposition is that if you will consent to the opening up ^a part of the island, reserving for your people all that you think they need for comfort and well-being, he will first cause an examination of that part you consent to give up to be made, and if he finds it ^{as} has been represented to him, he will enter into an arrangement with you to secure to your people not less than half a million dollars, and then ^{terms} if such an arrangement is made on / satisfactory to yourself, and having your consent, he will go

(Page 3)

of your people, you might be willing to consider his proposition, in view of the other & further fact that an attempt was likely to be made at almost any time by less considerate persons to have the whole Island thrown open.

Will you please kindly advise me whether you are disposed to consider the proposition, in the meantime holding this letter strictly confidential? I think you are sufficiently well acquainted

(Page 4)

4

with me to know that I will not urge you take any action you do not consider for the good of your people, and that the simple word "No" will end the matter so far as I am concerned. If, however, you think you can afford to look into the proposition, and so advise me, I will come over and talk over the details, and bring you into personal communication with the party by whom I am commissioned to write you.

Yours Very Truly

(Signed) A. P. Swineford

P. S. - Eaton paid us the \$3.00

you sent by him, Thanks!

Document No. 4-25 03
Folder No. 19
4-25
A

THE MINING JOURNAL

Ketchikan, Alaska, April 25, 1903

My Dear Mr. Duncan:

I am commissioned by a very wealthy party to make you a proposition looking to the opening up of Annette Island, or rather a part thereof, with your consent. The proposition is one which almost any person less worldly than yourself would be willing to accept, and comes from a gentleman who is an admirer of yours, although I do not think you have ever met him--one who is enthusiastic in his praise of the good work you have accomplished, and who would take no step in the direction indicated without your full consent.

His proposition is that if you will consent to the opening up a part of the island, reserving for your people all that you think they need for comfort and well-being, he will first cause an examination of that part you consent to give up to be made, and if he finds it as has been represented to him, he will enter into an arrangement with you to secure to your people not less than half a million dollars, and then if such an arrangement is made on terms satisfactory to yourself, and having your consent, he will go to Congress for such legislation as may be necessary in the premises.

I have told him I thought it barely possible that, in the interest of your people, you might be willing to consider his proposition, in view of the other & further fact that an attempt was likely to be made at almost any time by less considerate persons to have the whole Island thrown open.

Will you please kindly advise me whether you are disposed to consider the proposition in the meantime holding this letter strictly confidential? I think you are sufficiently well acquainted with me to know that I will not urge you to take any action you do not consider for the good of your people, and that the simple word "No" will end the matter so far as I am concerned.

If, however, you think you can afford to look into the proposition and so advise me, I will come over and talk over the details, and bring you into personal communication with the party by whom I am commissioned to write you.

Yours Very Truly

(Signed) A. P. Swineford

(Ex-Governor of Alaska)

P. S. Eaton paid us the \$3.00
you sent by him. Thanks!

Document No. 29-29
Folder No. 35

A

C O P Y

SUSPENSE.

May 29, 1915.

Dear Dr. Claxton:

Here is a brief upon which some memoranda have been made showing the status of the Annette Islands and that all the land and improvements attached thereto belong to the United States.

Please return these papers.

For the Secretary:

Cordially yours,

(SIGNED) Jos. J. Cotter,
Acting Private Secretary.

Dr. P. P. Claxton,
Commissioner of Education.

Inc. 3275.

C O P Y

M E M O R A N D U M.

Congress
Acts of Congress
Indians,
The Act of Congress of March 3, 1891, set aside the
Annette Islands as a reservation for the Metlakahtla

Reservations
"and those people known as Metlakahtlans
who have recently emigrated from British
Columbia to Alaska, and such other Alaskan
natives as may join them, to be held and used
by them in common",

under regulations to be prescribed by the Secretary of the
Interior.

Land Titles
Property Rights
The title to these lands has, of course, not passed out
of the United States, and, therefore, the title to anything
thereon that has become part of the realty, is in the United
States. Of course, it was the intent of Congress that these
Metlakahtlans should live on the lands and erect their habitations
there, and while the present Act of Congress remains in force
and until further legislation by Congress, the title of the United
States to the lands is subject to the equitable interest of
the Indians. Father Duncan had no legal rights and no enforceable
equitable rights. In other words, if it became necessary to
remove from the island, this could be done and he would have no
right to remove any of the realty.

I have talked to Judge Proudfit and understand he
agrees with the above.

(SIGNED) Cotter

1915
5-29

A

Memorandum to be attached to Document No. 29-29, Folder No. 35, May 29, 1915.

Information taken from Official Register of the United States, 1917.

Proudfit, Sam'l. V.	Int. Gen. Land Off. Law Exam. \$2500
	Pa. 9 Iowa Mills DC

The Official Register 1915 and the Official Register for 1913 give the same information, except that the salary is given as \$2400.

See, also, initials "S.V.P." at top of Document No. 25-18, Folder No. 35, dated May 18, 1915.

F.A.R.

Document No. 29
Folder No. 35

1915
5-29
A

Edmund Verney,
Mayor

B. A. Haldane,
Secretary

Edward Benson,
Treasurer

COUNCIL CHAMBERS

COUNCIL ANNETTE ISLANDS' RESERVE

METLAKATLA, ALASKA

SEAL:
Bureau of Education
ans.
Jul 19 1915
noted
Alaska Division

Metlakahtla, Alaska, May 29, 1915.

SEAL:
Bureau of Education
ans.
Jul 13 1915
noted
Alaska Div. Seattle, Wash.

The Honorable,

The Secretary of Interior,
Washington, D. C.

Sir:-

Permit us to convey to you, for your perusal and careful consideration, the attached copy of resolutions drawn up by our special committee. These resolutions express the unanimous sentiment of our body as they do of the said committee.

In witness, whereof, we sign our full name and seal:

Council of Annette Islands Reserve.

Mark Hamilton

John Davis

Jacob Scott

Chas Brendible

Paul J. Mather

Roderick F. Davis

Andrew Usher

Frank Allen

Harry Lang

Eli Tait

Document No. 29.
Folder No. 35.

A

Edmund Verney,
Mayor

B. A. Haldane,
Secretary

Edward Benson,
Treasurer

COUNCIL CHAMBERS

COUNCIL ANNETTE ISLANDS' RESERVE

METLAKATLA, ALASKA

Metlakahtla, Alaska, May 17, 1915.

Council of Annette Islands Reserve,

Metlakahtla, Alaska.

Gentlemen:

In pursuance with your instructions at the time of our appointment, March 27, 1915, that we draft proper resolutions setting forth the grievances of the inhabitants of Annette Islands Reserve against Mr. William Duncan of Metlakahtla, Alaska, and the wish of the people in regard to his disposition, for the purpose of laying these facts before The Honorable, The Secretary of Interior of the United States of America, upon his visit to our settlement in July of this year, we humbly submit the following conclusions as our unanimous sentiment and the sentiment of a large majority of our fellow townsmen.

1. The Metlakahtla Indians cannot and will not work in an industrial company, henceforth, where Mr. Duncan is a shareholder, partner or in any other manner an interested party. (Reason: Our people believe Mr. Duncan has betrayed their faith in him many times in the past and, today, what we supposed was community property - the Cannery and Wharf, Saw-mill, Water System, General Store, Public Buildings, Sidewalks, etc. -, he claims as his private goods. Furthermore, we are sure that he is not interested in our progress and advancement but is entirely selfish in his aims.)

A

Edmund Verney,
Mayor

B. A. Haldane,
Secretary

Edward Benson,
Treasurer

COUNCIL CHAMBERS

COUNCIL ANNETTE ISLANDS' RESERVE

METLAKATLA, ALASKA

4. We are positive there is no way in which we can be reconciled to Mr. Duncan and more positive that there is no way in which he can be permanently and sincerely reconciled to us. (Reason: Our people have tried to persuade him to this course many times but always in vain. Once Mr. Duncan has quarreled even with a bosom friend, he can never be reconciled again. Many of the great men of the United States and Canada have tried to get Mr. Duncan to change his course on many and various occasions but, as far as we know, no man has ever succeeded.)

5. We are positive it is the wish of a very large majority of our people and we know it is our wish that the Secretary of Interior will remove Mr. William Duncan from Metlakatla and Annette Islands Reserve forever.

6. We ask, as a final prayer, that The Honorable, The Secretary of Interior, will consider earnestly the future welfare of our little colony and, at the same time, we want him to be kind but firm with the venerable gentleman whom we wish to have removed from our leadership and association.

Yours, very respectfully,

his
Adolphus X Galvert
mark

Witnesses: Edmund Verney
B. A. Haldane

John Davis-----

Edmund Verney-----

B. A. Haldane-----

COMMITTEE

copy

Ketchikan, Alaska,

May 23, 1915.

4710

Hon. Franklin H. Lane,
Secretary of the Interior,
Washington, D. C.

Dear Sir:

When I was in Washington last February I promised you that on my return to Alaska I would try and learn some facts about Metlakatla that might be of help to your department. I have done what I could and must confess my inability to get anything of much importance. I will, however, tell you what I learned from Mr. Duncan in talking with him as he visited us a few days ago.

First. He absolutely refuses to have anything to do with any one connected with the government. He looks with suspicion on all government officials, and feels that they are conniving to destroy his work.

Second. When the question arose about his funds he stated that he would gladly turn over all his books to a recognized auditor and have them gone over. I urged that he do this that the public might know that he was on the square. I believe I could have this done and will tell him of a man if you will recommend one. I further believe that this move would be a wise one.

Third. He said he was thinking of leaving and going to some sanatorium to spend the remainder of his life. I advised this. I firmly believe that such a move on his part

Duncan's attitude
toward government
officials

Examination of
Duncan's books by
auditor

Probability of
going in 1915-
1916

11-6-15

will be better both for himself and for the work at Metlakatla.

Fourth. He is planning soon to go to Seattle and Victoria to consult with old time friends as to what he should do. At present one of his old friends and workers is with him and will be for the summer. In talking with him he suggested that Mr. Duncan get away for a while and he too believes the thing for him to do is to go to a sanatorium.

Further than this I could get nothing definite. I am giving this to you because I promised to do so. I am now wondering what time you will be in Alaska this summer. While I know that your trip is more especially for the Westward, as we call it, we would like to have you see our part too and if I can do anything to make your trip more pleasant or profitable please let me know and I shall gladly do all I can.

As I told you, while in your office, I preferred not taking this matter up with Mr. Duncan in an official capacity. I hope you will also take this letter merely as a personal rather than an official one. However, if I can be of further service please call on me.

Very truly yours,

(Signed) J. L. Myers

Plans to go to
Seattle to consult
with friends

3/11/1940

~~3/25/19~~ 2/4/19

32

50

A

1919

2701 3-11

A-17, Vol: 14, Net. 5, #388.

March 11, 1919.

Commissioner of Education,
Washington, D.C.

Dear Sir:

In accordance with the enclosed copy of telegram from Mr. Lopp, dated March 11, I am enclosing copies of correspondence and telegrams which today were received from Mr. Beattie.

I am also in receipt of your letter of March 4, enclosing copy of your letter to General R. H. Pratt, in reference to his letter to the Honorable Franklin K. Lane; also the original letters from Mr. Atkinson and Mr. Verney, of Metlakatla. Mr. Lopp has received copies of these letters from General Pratt and therefore knows the situation. He will, in all probability, upon his return from Metlakatla make recommendation in accordance with your letter of March 4, after he has thoroughly investigated conditions there.

Very truly yours,
(Signed) E. O. Sinclair,
Supply Agent.

HCS:RMK

(Telegram inclosed).
(Marked "copy")

Metlakatla, Alaska, Mar. 11, '19.

Sinclair, Seattle.

Forward to Commissioner copies Beattie letters and wire; if he can get the consent of the Secretary Interior to comply with request council's letter March 4 to Beattie even to extent of recovery through court. If people desire, if recovered it could be put to immediate use for hospital and industrial plants. Trustees have conferred with me. Believe any mission established by them will result in hopeless dissension. West Coast today. Return here Saturday.

BOPP.

(There is then attached letter of trustees of Duncan Estate, dated Dec. 23, 1918, addressed "To the Metlakatlans", copy of which I am quite sure you have in files.)

(Copy of Beattie letter) Metlakatla, Alaska, Jan. 11, 1919.

To the Mayor, other Officers
and Councilmen of Annette Islands'
Reserve:

The letter of Dec. 23, 1918, addressed to "The Metlakatlans" within an envelope addressed to Mr. Harry Lang, and signed by B. E. Myers and H. C. Strong, Trustee, which you handed to me for my perusal, has been carefully read by me.

Since the letter refers to the Bureau of Education, of which I am the local representative, I wish to make plain to you the position of the Bureau of Education, so far as I am informed, relative to matters referred to in that letter.

The letter states, "We desire and need the help and cooperation of the U. S. Bureau of Education". I wish to state for your information that this is the first indication from any source whatever that has come to the Bureau of Education that anyone legally representing Mr. Duncan or his estate had any desire to secure the cooperation in Metlakatla of the Bureau of Education. Being personally acquainted with both of the

(2)

person or thing connected locally with the Bureau of Education. Yet, never at any time has there been any indication on the part of the Trustees that they have desired any cooperation from us. If they have indicated their desire to my superiors in the Bureau of Education, it has not been made known to me.

The Bureau of Education, as you know, took up work in Metlakatla only after an ever increasing number of the people of Metlakatla had repeatedly, during a period of fifteen years or more, besought the government to establish a school here, and after seeking in every honorable way to secure the cooperation of Mr. Duncan.

When there arose a decided difference between Mr. Duncan and the local council (together with a majority of the people of your town) regarding the ownership of property, you recall that your council carried the matter to the Secretary of the Interior. Two predecessors of the present Secretary of the Interior had caused investigations to be made in Metlakatla some years before. Secretary Lane had also directed some investigations previous to your appeal to him for a decision relative to the ownership of certain properties. The Secretary of the Interior had access to all these reports and, I understand, to statements made by Mr. Duncan himself that the properties in question, including the church building, were the properties of the community of Metlakatla. After considering these and after receiving the report of his legal advisors regarding the matter, the Secretary of the Interior decided, as you, no doubt, recall, that the title to the Annette Islands Reserve and to all real property thereon rested in the United States for the use of the natives of Indians of Metlakatla under rules and regulations prescribed by the Secretary of the Interior. Title to property on island

You perhaps also recall that before issuing formal Rules and Regulations for Annette Islands Reserve, the Secretary of the Interior sought the advice of the people here; and when Rules and Regulations were issued, provision was made that the local council should control the issuance of permits to any native people to occupy land within the Reserve, thus showing that it is the purpose of the Government that the people of this community control property rights, even though the Congressional Act establishing the Reserve leaves the title to such property technically in the United States Government. Rules or Regulations

Sometime after the decision of the Secretary of the Interior was made public the Council and, I believe, the Church Elders, asked that the key to the church be turned over to the elders. It was at that time indicated by the Government that since Mr. Duncan had held the key to the church ever since its erection, it would be best to permit him to hold the key so long as he continued to minister as pastor of the church.

After the death of Mr. Duncan this request was renewed by the elders. On Sept. 16, 1918, a wire from the Assistant Secretary of the Interior Hopkins reached me - as follows:

"As representative of the Secretary of the Interior you will immediately assume custodianship of the guest house and office buildings. Also until further instructions of the church building in Metlakatla, placing upon the guest house and the office building a note similar to the note placed by Dr. Claxton on other buildings."

On Sept. 26, 1918, Dr. P. F. Claxton, U.S. Commissioner of Education, wired me as follows: "As custodian of the church building you will, of course, grant to the elders authority to control its use for religious purposes, reporting to me all action in the matter."

Early in October the chairman of the board of elders asked me for the key to the church, and on October 7, 1918, I addressed a request to Dr. P. F. Claxton who had held the key from the time of Church Key

(3)

Mr. Duncan's death to deliver the key to the chairman of the board of elders, Mr. Daniel Reese. He sent me a request for a receipt for the key and I signed the receipt and returned it to him (Dr. Minthorn). He then delivered the key to Mr. Reese.

The letter from Trustees Myers and Strong seems to indicate that they are of the opinion that the agent or agents of the government have in some way interfered with their rights as trustees of Mr. Duncan's will. I wish to state emphatically that the writer is one of the agents of the government has in no way interfered with such rights, so far as he understands the situation.

It might be well to call your attention to the fact that although the Government agents treated Mr. Duncan with the utmost courtesy, he did not always reciprocate such courtesy. On the contrary, Mr. Duncan vilified government agents, defied the United States law relative to Annette Islands and absolutely refused to recognize the authority of the Secretary of the Interior. As a result it became the unpleasant duty of the government agents to carry out the provisions of the law governing the Reserve, without the consent of Mr. Duncan. Mr. Duncan then held that the government interfered with his rights and embarrassed his work. The Trustees seem by their statement to take a position similar to that taken by Mr. Duncan.

The writer does not believe that there is anyone who desires a recurrence of difficulties such as have been manifest in Metlakatla during the past eight or ten years. Evidently the authorities at Washington want it thoroughly understood that a continuation of Mr. Duncan's regime is impossible for, under date of Sept. 26, 1918, the Commissioner of Education telegraphed the writer that Duncan held no rights on the Island which could be transferred by will and could have no successor who would be recognized by the government. This would seem to indicate that whatever is done in this Reserve in the future must, if it is to have the approval of the Bureau of Education, not be a continuation of the Duncan regime. Whatever is undertaken in Metlakatla in the future must surely be with the full understanding that the buildings referred to in the letter of the Trustees are virtually the property of the people to be controlled by their duly elected representatives so long as such control does not conflict or interfere with regulations laid down by the Secretary of the Interior.

If it is the desire of the elders and council and people of Metlakatla to have work carried on in the Metlakatla church by the trustees above mentioned or any other person or group of persons, the fact that the local agent of the government is custodian of the church building and the further fact that he has placed the key to said building in the hands of the board of elders - the official board of the Metlakatla church - need not embarrass the trustees, the people of the community, or any one else. You are probably acquainted with the fact that there are churches in Southeast Alaska owned and controlled by the native people. Yet the pastors and ministers of these churches have been sent there at the request of the people themselves by a board or boards of missions located entirely outside of those church communities. Such an arrangement as the people desire can surely be made here.

The trustees seem to have no definite proposition to the people of Metlakatla. So long as statements set before you are so indefinite that it seems impossible for any considerable number of people to agree as to what those statements mean, it is certainly not conducive to harmony or peace to discuss such statements for a long time.

Permit me to suggest that some plan be worked out whereby your

(4)

body, as the official representatives of the whole people of the community, and the Trustees may reach a common understanding regarding what work may be undertaken and the plans for its administration and that you then present the matter to the whole people for their consideration.

Very truly yours,

(Signed) W.C. Beattie.

Teacher & Industrial Director
U.S. Bureau of Education.

(Then follows copy of letter, dated Feb. 4, 1919, from Council Amette Islands' Reserve, by Marsden, Secy., to the Trustees Duncan Estate, of which I think we have copy in files)

(Copy Beattie letter to Lopp)

Metlakatla, Alaska, Mar. 4, 1919. †

Dear Mr. Lopp:

I have tried all day to get started on a letter to you about the Council and the petitioners who have upset the equilibrium of this community the past few days, but have been so constantly interrupted by callers that I am just now endeavoring to get off a brief note before the mail boat arrives.

I enclose copies of telegrams I am sending you today. It seems that Hewson and Hudson, with Ealdane, Calvert and possibly Benson, keep going to Ketchikan and talking to the trustees and then come back here and make all sorts of ~~rumor~~ reports to the people. They have the whole community so badly mixed up that the people don't know whether they are awake or dreaming.--so far as the trustees and the Duncan will be concerned.

The Council met Friday night, Saturday night, and again last night and listened to some of the men who are pushing the petition. of Petition course, Ealdane, Calvert and Hanbury are councilmen and all uphold the petition. I have tried to get the Council to laugh at the matter and pass it up but it is too serious from their point of view. The greatest trouble is that Jos. Hayward, who with Silas Booth and James Howard carried the petition, represented to a number of those who signed that the Government and the Council had both endorsed the petition. Hayward denies this now but two men testified before the Council last night that he did say this.

I am enclosing a copy of the petition when it had 87 signers. Copy Heads of families have written in the names for nearly the whole family whether they are here or not. You will notice that Bertha Smith's name appears, though she is in Juneau. Quite a number of the signers are children. The petition is supposed to have some two hundred names to it now.

The Department ought to take this whole matter in charge as the Council has requested. Must close as the mail boat is coming.

Sincerely yours,

(Signed) W. C. Beattie.

(5)

(Copy)

We, the undersigned residents of Metlakatla, Alaska, who, upon true loyalty to the United States Government, wilfully accept the estate of the late William Duncan for the use of the Metlakatla Christian Mission; and to be sincerely in brotherly unity and subjects to the Christian Church of Metlakatla, Alaska.

1. Adolphus Calvert
2. Josiah Joseph Guthrie
3. William Dalton
4. Charles Gibson
5. Joseph Hayward
6. John Buxton
7. M. A. Hewson
8. Henry Reeve
9. Silas Booth
10. James Howard
11. Agnes Buxton
12. Fred Benson
13. Mrs. Louisa Benson
14. Lucy Calvert
15. Lucy Howard
16. Robert Alford
17. Minnie Haward
18. Willie Alford
19. Harriet Verney
20. Rod Murchison, Jr.
21. Solomon Dundas
22. Sarah Dundas
23. Annie Murchison
24. Mrs. Alfred Dundas
25. Eli Tait
26. Maude Tait
27. Robert Dundas
28. Bertha Dundas
29. Annie Hanbury
30. Simon Keith
31. Ralph Smith
32. Harriet Smith
33. Bertha Smith
34. Hattie Smith
35. Rhoda Hayward
36. Susan Hayward
37. Alice Buxton
38. Rufus Thian
39. Helen Allen
40. Maria Booth
41. Betsey Jurie
42. Mrs. Matilda Booth
43. Charles Hayward
44. Louis Buxton
45. Annie Cantil
46. Hannah Reeve
47. Simon Reeve
48. Sarah Alford
49. Ellen Webster
50. Lucy Gordon
51. Louisa Marsden
52. Harris Gordan
53. Eli Gordon
54. Mrs. Martha Hewson
55. Martha Guerre
56. Hagar Hewson
57. Marian Jance
58. George Hall
59. Silia Hall
60. Mrs. Robert Ridley
61. E. K. Mather
62. A. Mather
63. Georgina Atkinson
64. Rowena Atkinson
65. Ed. Atkinson
66. Henry Benson
67. Teddie Benson
68. Eddie Reece
69. George Campbell
70. Amanda Guthrie
71. Sarah Guthrie
72. Ellen Hanbury
73. Frances Hanbury
74. John Hudson
75. Everett Hudson
76. Harold Hudson
77. Mary Hudson
78. Laura M. Hudson
79. Margery Hudson
80. Miriam Hudson
81. Lillian Hudson
82. Rebecca Guthrie
83. Minnie Williams
84. Hannah Gibson
85. Sam Henry
86. Harriet Henry

Boff, 1919-20, Metlakatla- Miscellaneous papers from Seattle Office files, left by Mr. Lopp, April, 1920).

(The following pencil "personal note" attached to original letter of Beattie to Lopp, March 5, 1919, in which he inclosed copy of letter from the Council, and both letters of which Mr. Penfield has)

"Dear Mr. Lopp:

There has not been such a rumpus among the people here since Duncan threatened to shoot Ed. Atkinson, etc. It may be a 'tempest in a teapot' but it sure has been a tempest during the last week.

I'm afraid its going to affect our trip to the fair again but guess we'll have a delegation anyhow. Take special notice of the closing of the Council's letter to me - 'We have the honor to be, Sir, your humble and obedient servant.' Guess the writer forgot he'd addressed me at the start.

Here's hoping that things will yet shape themselves so that the people here will get a square deal and that the old man's accounts will yet be audited.

Beattie"

Telegram:

Metlakatla, Alaska, Mar. 4, 1919.
Via Ketchikan.

Lopp, Seattle.

Petition to trustees accepting will with no limitations fostered by Hewson et al being circulated here in opposition to wishes of Council is causing more unrest than apparent here for several years. Council on February four wrote trustees requesting conference. No reply yet received. Council now formally requests by nine affirmative votes, one negative and two not voting, that Department of Interior take in hand the whole matter and act for the people of Metlakatla in all matters relating to Duncan estate. Council urges immediate action on ground that it is only way to settle community strife. Council requests this be wired Commissioner and Secretary.

Beattie.

Metlakatla, Alaska, March 5, 1919.

Mr. W. F. Lopp,
Chief of Alaska Division,
Seattle, Wash.

Dear Sir:

I enclose herewith copy of letter from the Council to me and also copy of a notice that was posted in a number of places about town yesterday.

I have endeavored to get the Council to stick closely to the Rules and Regulations of the Reserve and not to make statements which can not be fully endorsed by the Government. Several of the Councilmen verbally attacked the petitioners (referred to in my letter of yesterday) saying that those men had no right to write a petition when the Council had already written the Trustees and had not yet received a reply. The question came up in Council meeting and I stated that the right of petition belonged to all people, but that the wrong on the part of this petition was the stating by some of those who carried the petition that the Council and the Government had endorsed the petition.

I have endeavored to get the Council to see that the petition would have no serious effect, but they are by no means sure of this.

The Council called in the three men who carried the petition and questioned them but they denied that they used the name of the Council or the Government. However, it has been proven since that they did use the name of the Council and it is pretty evident that they used the name of the Government also.

Haldane said in Council meeting on Friday night that Supt. Hawkesworth endorsed the petition when he was here. I took the copy of Mr. Hawkesworth's letter to you and read them (on Monday night) His statement and his "five points". That evening Haldane denied that he had said on Friday that Supt. Hawkesworth endorsed the petition - although the rest of the Council heard him both times.

Saturday night I was ill and could not attend the meeting, so I asked Mr. Purvance to take my place. Moses Hewson, Edward Benson, Josiah Guthrie, and several others were there and spoke before the Council. They charged that the Council was not acting in good faith with regard to the will and stated that the people were now going to take the matter out of the hands of the Council. These same men and more attended the meeting Monday night. After they had made a few statements like that, Acting Mayor Allen stated very calmly but

(7)

firmly that the Council had acted in good faith and that it intended to proceed in good faith, and that it would not be turned aside or shaken by the attacks and threatenings of these people. The visitors then left and the Council proceeded with business and took the action which I wired you yesterday and which is stated in their letter of yesterday to me, a copy of which is enclosed.

It seems that Benson stated on Saturday night that this matter is being stirred up in the hopes of stopping Marsden from Preaching in the church when asked to do so by the Elders.

I have stated repeatedly to the Council and to Benson and others personally that the Government has in no way interfered with the church services. That is wholly in the hands of the Elders. I have stated before Marsden preached in the church or whether some one else did - that the matter was wholly in the hands of the Elders. The chairman of the Board of Elders, Daniel Reece, has informed me that Marsden has never sought an opportunity to speak in the church and has spoken there only upon invitation of the Board of Elders. Marsden has never taken full charge of a service. He is always accompanied into the pulpit by one of the Elders who opens and closes the service and calls upon Marsden when the proper time comes for his part of the service.

Benson and Lang both came to me regarding the Elders and the control of the church in November and December last. I told them that I was technically custodian of the church building; that it was held by the Government for the use of the people of the community; that the Commissioner of Education had issued instructions to me that the Board of Elders was to have full authority to control the religious services; that upon the request of the Elders I had asked Dr. Minthorn to turn the key of the church over to the chairman of the Board of Elders; that Dr. Minthorn had complied with my request and I had receipted him for the key; that it was the duty of the people or members of the church to elect the Board of Elders whom the people wished; that such Board of Elders would be recognized as the official Board of the church, if the election was carried on in an open and fair manner; and that so long as I should be the official custodian of the church building, I would recognize only such Board as was thus elected.

I presented the same to others who came to me. These men seemed to be perfectly satisfied with this. Later, the Council and Elders (I believe) called together a meeting of the people to consider whether the then Board of Elders should be continued for another year or whether a new election would be held. This matter was discussed, I understand, at three different meetings held during the course of a week, open to all and well attended. It was finally decided that a new election of a Board consisting of eight elders should be elected. The election was to be held in the church building by ballot under supervision of a board of judges, as ordinary political elections are held. This election was carried out according to plans. The church bell was rung every few minutes during the day to remind the people to go and vote. I knew nothing of this election until it was in progress, although I knew that public mass meetings had been held to discuss the matter. All the information I have given came to me after the election was over. It seems that sixteen names were placed in nomination for elders at the final mass meeting. At the same

Election of elders

(8)

(He evidently omitted one name in this - that of Herbert Murchison, I think - as there are only fifteen names here):

George Eaton	104	Ernest Milton	65
Geo. C. Williams	95	R. Murchison, Sr.	40
Daniel Reece	86	Edward Benson	51
Robert Ridley	80	Theodore Dundas	45
Andrew Usher	75	Arthur Milton	17
John Davis	72	Silas Booth	18
Fred Benson	70	Philip Nelson	17
Solomon Dundas	69		

The eight men in the first column above were declared elected. Another meeting was held at the call of Mayor Lang, I am told, to discuss the matter of the installation of these men into the eldership of the church. Some people wanted to get Rev. Van Marter or Rev. Jenkins from Ketchikan to come over and conduct a brief ceremony of installation. Others thought this unnecessary, and suggested that Rev. Marsden be asked to conduct this ceremony. Mayor Lang afterwards told me that he stated at that meeting that if the people would understand that Mr. Marsden was simply responding to the request of the people to do this there could be no objections to it. Mr. Marsden was called upon in the meeting and was asked if he would conduct the ceremony. He responded that he would do so only upon a request from this meeting and with the plain understanding that he had no official connection with it other than the other ministers referred to. He further stated that he trusted that he was fully understood and that, if he did this service, the people would not state that because he did it he was endeavoring to control the church - or words to that effect. The meeting then asked him to conduct such a ceremony on the following Sunday, which he did.

Most of this report to me ^{came} from Mayor Lang who is looked upon as one of those strongly opposed to Marsden, hence, I am quite sure it is not embellished in any way in Marsden's favor.

The Board of Elders thus elected and installed continued Daniel Reece as chairman. Three or four of the elders elected are new men on the Board.

Since that time the question has ^{not} been raised to me of the validity of the right of the Board of Elders to conduct and control the services in the church. There has never been a service, so far as I can learn, in the church since Dr. & Mrs. Minthorn stopped except such as has been led by one of the Board of Elders. The Elders have at times conducted the services alone and at times invited others to speak, but always with an elder presiding. Among those who have spoken aside from the elders themselves are Rev. Marsden, Mr. Hawkesworth, Rev. Jenkins (Rector of the Episcopal Church of Ketchikan), Dr. Condit, General Missionary of the Presbyterian Church in Alaska, and myself.

Rev. Marsden is the only one of these who has been invited to conduct a Sunday morning service. All the rest have spoken at night - Messrs. Hawkesworth, Jenkins and Condit, once each, and I have spoken twice. Each one of us spoke only upon the invitation of the Board of Elders. Mr. Marsden has spoken at a number of services - both morning and evening - but rarely, I believe, twice in the same day.

I have gone into this detailed account of Elders and services because of the statement that Mr. Benson made at Saturday night's Council meeting. Undoubtedly, if the present turmoil among the

(9)

Government's appointing me custodian of the church building is simply a technical matter to protect the people in their virtual ownership of the church. I have refused absolutely even to comment on their religious services. I questioned only the wisdom of the elders in inviting me to speak there, but the chairman who came to me held that they insisted upon this, and I responded.

I believe that if it is possible for the Secretary of the Interior to take up this matter for the people and deal directly with the Trustees, much strife and unnecessary wranglings among the people themselves will be avoided. The Council asked me directly whether or not the Secretary of the Interior would do this and I told them that I did not know. They finally decided to take the action of the night of March 3.

I recommend that this matter be taken up at once and that the Secretary of the Interior act as the Council has requested, if it is possible to do so.

Very truly yours,

(Signed) W. G. Beattie,

Teacher & Industrial Director.

(Marsden letter to Beattie)

Metlakatla, Alaska, Mar. 4, 1919. +

Prof. W. G. Beattie,
United States Bureau of Education,
Metlakatla, Alaska.

My dear Sir:

At the Special Meeting of the Council of Annette Islands' Reserve held in the Teachers' Residence, Monday evening, March 3, 1919, there took place a full, unreserved and free discussion of the present and serious disruption and threatened physical clashes, on account of Father Duncan's Will to the Metlakatla people, and after a very careful consideration, action was taken and said action, its cause, nature and aim are as follows:

First, By a vote of nine to one, the Council of Annette Islands' Reserve earnestly and urgently requests the Honorable Secretary of the Interior to at once take in hand this whole matter of the Duncan will as applied to the whole people of Metlakatla, by just and lawful proceedings and according to the records and facts as may be gathered in the archives of the Government and as may be represented and proved by the people of Metlakatla, make final settlement of this whole matter in the interest and for the whole Indian people of Metlakatla, Alaska, and not for the sake of a very few Indians only.

Second, The many causes leading up to this action are very serious and menacing and cannot be enumerated at this time. Suffice it to say that a few of the Indians here are misrepresenting both the Government and the legal governing bodies of Annette Islands' Reserve with a view to their exclusive benefit as against the whole people under the Duncan Will.

Third, This action prescribes the condition under which the Duncan Will can only be acceptable and made effective here at Metlakatla and that is that both the Government and the constituted legal bodies of the Tsimpshean people of Metlakatla are recognized, respected and heeded in all matters pertaining to the Will.

(10)

Notice to the People of Metlakatla,
Alaska.

Notice is hereby given that at the Special Meeting of the Council of Annette Islands' Reserve, a meeting regularly called and held in the Teachers' Residence on the evening of Monday, March 3, 1919, by a vote of eight to one, the Secretary of the Interior of the United States Government has been formally requested to take in hand the whole matter of the Duncan Will as applied to the people of Metlakatla and make whatever settlement there is to be made in the interest and for all the Town and People of Metlakatla, Alaska, and not for the sake of a few persons only.

And notice is also hereby given that any secret meetings by any of the people of Metlakatla for the sake of nullifying the authority of the Town Council - meetings other than what are called for by the Mayor or Acting Mayor in the good and peaceful interests of the whole people of Metlakatla - are declared to be contrary to the best welfare of the whole people of Metlakatla, Alaska, and as such are to be prohibited.

By order of the Acting Mayor and Council of
Annette Islands' Reserve.

Edward Marsden,
Secretary.

Metlakatla, Alaska,
March 4, 1919.

March 5, 1919.

Mr. B. A. Haldane,
Metlakatla, Alaska.
Dear Sir:

We are enclosing a letter addressed to the Metlakatlans in your care. We hope, as a member of the Town Council and of the Metlakatla Christian Mission, you will arrange to give the same the greatest publicity in your community. Duncan Will

We would suggest that you request the Superintendent of the Bureau of Education at Metlakatla to take the Will of the late William Duncan, also our letters of December 23d and the one enclosed under date of March 5th, and publicly read them and explain the wording therein.

An honest interpretation of the Will and our communications should leave no doubt in the minds of any of your people as to the sincerity of Mr. Duncan and his Trustees to do well for you.

Respectfully,
H.C. Strong
B.H. Myers,
Trustees.

(Copy of letter referred to
is attached, but I think
you have it.)

Metlakatla, Alaska, March 5, 1919.

The Com. of Education,
Wash., D.C.

Dear Sir:

On looking up my files I cannot find a copy of my letter to you relative to the carrying into effect the instructions of your telegrams of Sept. 25 and 26, 1918, since my letter of Oct. 1, although I thought I had written you also in Nov. I will now recount action taken since that reported on Oct. 1, 1918, in order that you may have a connected account to date.

Upon the request of a committee from the Board of Elders consisting of Chairman Daniel Reece and Edward Atkinson, I wrote Dr. H. J. Minthorn (who had held the key to the church here from the time of Mr. Duncan's death) on Oct. 7, 1918, requesting that he turn the key to the church over to Daniel Reece, Chairman of the Board of Elders. (I enclose herewith a copy of my letter to Dr. Minthorn). I sent the letter by Mr. Reece who returned in a few minutes with a form of receipt for the key which I signed and returned to Dr. Minthorn. The latter then turned the key over to Mr. Reece.

Since that time the key has been in the hands of the chairman of the Board of Elders and the Board of Elders has had full control of religious services in the church.

On Oct. 10, Elders Reece and Atkinson again came to me and asked me to write a letter for them to Dr. and Mrs. Minthorn requesting them to take charge of the services the following Sunday. I told them that it would be much wiser for them to write the letter themselves. They stated that they wanted some one to write it because they wanted it expressed in good English. I finally told them to go home and write a letter and then, I would put it in form on the typewriter for them. They did this, and I wrote the following, endeavoring to convey accurately their meaning:

Metlakatla, Alaska, Oct. 10, 1918.

Dr. & Mrs. Minthorn,
Metlakatla, Alaska.

We, the Elders of the Metlakatla Church, in meeting this day request you to take charge of the services in the church next Sunday, October 13, and ask you to work together with us in the Christian work of the church all the time you are in Metlakatla.

We desire to have one or more of our Board of Elders to take charge of the services sometimes, and ask other Christians either in Metlakatla or from ~~the~~ outside Metlakatla to take charge of a service once in a while. It is our desire to have you take charge of most of the services during the remainder of 1918. If at any time we wish to have some other Christian hold a service, we will let you know about it before the day of such service.

Yours for Christian Service,

Elder Ed. Atkinson then stated that I did not make the last part conform to their idea fully, and asked me to rewrite the last sentence to the effect (that the Elders would call upon or notify Dr. and Mrs. Minthorn from time to time when it was desired to have them conduct the service). I rewrote the letter changing the last sentence to satisfy the committee from the Elders. (I have misplaced the copy of the corrected form which they took, but am quite sure that was the only change made). The Committee took the letter and thanked me and, I suppose, took it to the other Elders to be signed.

A day or two later Mr. Ed. Atkinson came to me and stated

(12)

Government had pushed him out of the church by taking the key and he would not go back till the Government invited him. I wish to state here that upon receipt of your telegram - or rather the telegram from the Assistant Secretary of the Interior - of Sept. 16, 1918, I went and had a talk with Dr. and Mrs. Minthorn and furnished him with a copy of the telegram. While he seemed to think that the property referred to was all the property of the Duncan estate (or of what he called the "Metlakatla Christian Mission"), he was quite cordial and friendly throughout our conversation. He asked me then if I wanted him and Mrs. Minthorn to step out of the church and turn the key over to me. I told him that I did not; that the services of the church would be in the hands of the Elders - the official Board of the church - as soon as a quorum of the Elders returned to town; that if the Elders wished him and Mrs. Minthorn to continue in charge of the church services, the former should make proper arrangements with them so that there could be no misunderstandings. I think I told him then that if the Elders asked for the key, I would send him a written request to turn it over to them. When I left Dr. and Mrs. Minthorn that day, I felt sure that there would be no rupture between them and the Elders. Hence, I was surprised when Mr. Atkinson came to me with the statement mentioned above. As soon as I could, after Mr. Atkinson's statement - at the close of school the same day - I again called on Dr. Minthorn and expressed surprise at the report of Mr. Atkinson had brought to me. Dr. Minthorn said he did not think he had made a statement just like that; that he rather thought his statement had been to the effect that the Elders had pushed him out. I again explained that the Government, so far as I knew, would not interfere in any way with the religious services of the church and that these would be in the hands of the Board of Elders. I also stated that the only reason of which I knew for making me, as local agent for the Government, custodian of the church building was to protect the title or ownership of that building for the people of Metlakatla.

I believe neither Dr. nor Mrs. Minthorn ever led any church service again while they were here. They left early in December.

Since that time, the people have seemingly been more contented as a whole than I have seen at any other time since I knew Metlakatla, until within the last few weeks a number have been endeavoring to stir up strife among the members of the community relative to the Duncan will.

I have already mailed copies of the correspondence of the Trustees of the will, so far as I have seen it. I have also mailed to the Seattle Office copies of the Council's letter of Feb. 4, 1919, to the Trustees.

I think this brings up to date all the information I have regarding the matters mentioned above.

Let me say before closing that the church services in Metlakatla have never before been so well attended (since my coming here) as they have been since the middle of December. I believe if people outside of Metlakatla would cease to criticise the Government for taking custodianship of the church building and permitting the Board of Elders to have full control of religious services, and at the same time would cease to foster differences between, or rather, among various groups and individuals of the community, Metlakatla would soon settle down into a fairly harmonious community, and would make much better progress in every way than it has yet done.

Very truly yours,

(Signed) W. C. Beattie.

A

B. of E., Wash., D. C.: 1918-19, Vol. 14, Met. 3, #302. (FAR/MB, 10-18-23.)
(Typed copy; bears stamp Boff., Wash., D. C., 3/17/19; attached, with a number of other documents, to letter of Sinclair Comm. Ed., 3/11/19.)

(Copy)

Harry Long
Mayor

Edward Morsten
Secretary

Charles Brenhille
Treasurer.

COUNCIL CHAMBERS
COUNCIL METLAKATLA ISLANDS RESERVE
Metlakatla, Alaska

February 4, 1919.

Messrs. H. C. Strong and B. L. Myers,
Trustees, Ketchikan, Alaska.

Gentlemen:

Your letter of December 23, 1918, addressed "To the Metlakatlans" has received the attention of the town council, and after a careful consideration of the matter I am directed to answer it.

Let me say first, that your Christmas greetings should have been answered at once as soon as they were received, but the council thought it wise not to do so since it raised several controversial questions on which the people of this native town are sharply divided.

However, your greetings are herewith acknowledged, and while we regret this very belated answer - a tardy response which does not in any way represent our mind and spirit - we assure you that on behalf of the whole town we are thankful to receive your greetings, especially since the law has established your standing as William Duncan's trustees.

In our judgement your communication is simply an expression of a desire on your part as trustees - granting that no legal obstructions are in the way - to carry out to the best of your ability Father Duncan's will as applied to the town and people of Metlakatla, Alaska, rather than any clear definition of a matured policy. On this account therefore the council authorizes me to make an inquiry before anything more can be said and done in regard to the whole matter.

Since the Indian people of Metlakatla, Alaska, and they alone, are directly concerned in Father Duncan's will because of their industrial and business associations with him in the many years past, and since the help and protection of the Interior Department of the Federal Government are kindly extended to us at our own request, the proposition of the council is that you as trustees of Father Duncan's estate meet with a representative committee to be composed of at least three persons from this council, three from the Board of Elders of the Metlakatla Church, and two from the representatives of the United States Bureau of Education.

INTERVIEW WITH MRS. MINTHORN.

While at Metlakatla I called upon Mrs. Minthorn and had an extended interview with her. Mrs. Minthorn encourages the natives in making baskets which she disposes to people in the States. She has the finest collection of basketware I have seen anywhere in Alaska. Instead of giving to the natives the money she receives for this work, which she believes they would unwisely use, she gives its equivalent in clothing and yarn--mostly the latter--and she says that as a result of this, the natives generally are better dressed and have more woolen garments than before she took up this work.

I asked Mrs. Minthorn if she would like to make any statement to me regarding the conditions at Metlakatla. There is no doubt that she believes as Mr. Strong does that the Bureau should not have gone into Metlakatla in the first place, but she says that it would be a tragedy for the Bureau to withdraw now. Instead of doing that, she thinks we should radically alter our system of education and lay much greater stress on vocational education so that the natives may be better able to earn a livelihood than they will be if we persist in stressing academic education. Also, she says that we have a very fine domestic science room at the school but that we have never had a competent teacher of this subject and that consequently the girls are growing up without any knowledge of the domestic science and arts. Mrs. Minthorn emphasized the good work done by Mr. Duncan in vocational education for the men and domestic science for the women. She said that there are many competent mechanics among the Metlakatlans due to Mr. Duncan's work, and that the boarding school he maintained for girls between fourteen and eighteen years of age turned out many fine housekeepers among the women.

Mrs. Minthorn strongly urges the establishment of an industrial school at Metlakatla.

Industrial
Schools

Regarding the personnel of the Bureau's staff, Mrs. Minthorn said that generally our teachers were not of the type that will uplift the natives. She said that the great need is for teachers with the missionary spirit. She also protested strongly against the Bureau teachers dancing with the natives. This form of amusement I think she believes was introduced into the Reservation by the teachers, and she says that the natives have not yet reached that stage of civilization where this kind of social contact with white teachers can have any but ill effects. (I subsequently found out that the local superintendent has never permitted dancing on the Government school property, but that the teachers have attended dances held in native homes and that they have danced with the natives.) I spoke to

Dancing

Morality

-2-

Mr. Hawkesworth about this and he ridiculed the allegation that this would injure the morals of the natives. He believed the social contact good for the teachers and the natives.

Indians

Law & Order

Seizure of Property

Housebreaking

Mrs. Minthorn called attention to the fact that there is no law enforcement attempted in Metlakatla, and that gross violations of law have been permitted without any attempt to find the guilty parties or to punish them. She specified particularly that after the Duncan warehouse had been seized by the Government, the contents were looted by the natives without any effort by the Government officials to protect private property. (I spoke about this to Marsden and some other natives, but they state that while it is true that the property in the Duncan warehouse was looted by the natives, it was almost wholly, if not entirely, the work of the Duncan followers, who took the attitude that it was their property, which they had owned in common with Mr. Duncan.)

In general, Mrs. Minthorn believes that the results of the Government's control of Metlakatla have resulted in (1) the lowering of the moral tone of the natives-(2) a growing disrespect for the white race; (3) contempt for law and order (4) the turning out from our schools of boys and girls without any preparation for making a livelihood or a home. Mrs. Minthorn believes the Bureau should encourage basket work and other native arts among the natives, not however as a vocation but as a supplement to modern trades. She says that a basket which she can sell for \$3.00 or \$3.50 but only as a curio rather than for its intrinsic worth, takes a native woman from a week to ten days of constant work to make. When a woman can earn forty or fifty cents an hour in the cannery it is not to be expected that she will work from seven to ten days for three dollars.

(Signed) Theo. Honour.

Certified copy

E.T. (These initials are in ink.--M.G.)

A

(COPY)

Metlakatla, Alaska, 8 Jan. 1900.

Hon. John G. Brady,
Governor of Alaska,

Dear Sir:-

Your letter of 27 Nov. with its enclosures was delayed in transit or I should have replied to it earlier.

I desire to thank you for your courtesy in writing to me so fully our views on questions affecting (affecting) the welfare of Metlakatla, but I beg respectfully, yet candidly, to confess I do not share in your apprehensions, nor do I agree with the recommendations you offer our Natives in regard to the course they should pursue.

Touching first your report of Metlakatla to the Government, a copy of which you have kindly sent me, I notice a few notable mistakes showing that you are greatly misinformed on some important particulars concerning our Mission. The first error is in regard to the initiation of the Mission. Had I taken the course you describe, I should without doubt, have experienced the same ill success in Missionary work which has characterized Alaskan Missions generally.

I did not, as you report, begin my work forty two years ago by moving a band of Tsimshians from Fort Simpson, but forty two years ago I arrived at Fort Simpson where were located about 2000 Natives in a most degraded condition of savage life, and there I worked for nearly five (5) years. At the end of that time I moved from Fort Simpson to a spot seventeen miles away and commenced the settlement of Metlakatla for all the Natives who had been won by Gospel teaching to lead a Christian life. [It was not therefore a change of location, nor my establishing of industries, as some people have assumed, to which the Tsimshians owe their commencement in civilized life, but solely to the Gospel which they accepted.

I will now review, seriatim, the several questions upon which you have thought well to give us advice.

First as to the Reservation.

From your Report I gather that you regard the Congressional Act of Mch. 3, 1891, setting aside Annette Island for the Natives, as a blunder. You say "this piece of legislation in the opinion of many people is a trouble-breeder, that it introduces into Alaska the Reservation system of handling the Natives". And in your letter to our people dated 23 Nov. 1899, you inform them that their "position as a

Document No. 3.

Folder No. 16.

8 Jan. 1900.

Hon. John G. Brady

3

his experts have informed him that they do not amount to much. At any rate Mr. Dun-
can wants the miners to stay away from the Island as he is fearful that they edge in
and have a corrupting and demoralizing influence among his people. You might have
added that my fears are shared in by every well wisher of Metlakatla.

I think it is well understood that when an event is of frequent occurrence it
ceases to be wondered at, and so it has ceased to be a wonder that the land which
has been assigned to Indians should be coveted by a certain class of whites. An-
nette Island is no exception to the rule. The miners you allude to were some two
or three trespassers who were acute enough to realize that exaggeration was an es-
sential adjunct to their report of the mineral resources of the Island in order to
boom up their prospects and condone their offence of trespassing. Sad would it be,
however, for this or any other Country if Rulers could be always swayed into action
by the utterances of greed to commit an injustice upon a loyal community who have
built their homes on the good faith of the Government. The question resolves it-
self to this, Shall our Settlement be sacrificed, all its material and moral achieve-
ments be thrown away to gratify a few miners? Another question is, Shall the
object lesson which Metlakatla offers to 30,000 natives of Alaska be obliterated
and lost that room may be made for one more mining camp in the world. I sincerely
hope the Congress of the United States will continue to give its emphatic answer
NO to these questions.

Our Natives have still need of all the protection to their home life which the
Government can give them. If their homes are kept safe and pure, prosperity will
assuredly follow; but if their homes are violated then inevitable disaster will
overwhelm their settlement.

Metlakatla owes its present happy condition, under God, to the three bless-
ings, Unsectarian Christianity—Unity of its people and isolation of its homes from
contaminating influences. The latter blessing Metlakatla owes to the Government,
and if it is continued I feel sure our people will continue to grow in fitness for

able
result of
mining on
Annette
Island

A

Hon. John G. Brady

7

8 Jan. 1900.

represents only five percent of the wages earned by our people the whole amount of their earnings would be the enormous sum of \$6,696,069.40, which you can at once see is absurdly too much. If you had reported twenty-five per cent instead of five per cent you would, I believe, still be under the mark.

The question of finding remunerative employment for so large a community of thrifty men as we have here is a difficult one. We have, however, done fairly well, for we have more industrial work carried on by our people at their own home, than is found in any other settlement of Natives in Alaska. Still we are seeking for more and hope that others will soon be added to our list.

*clashing of
Metlakatla
with neighbors* This brings me to notice the clashing of our people with their neighbors of which you speak. If this charge is true, I should take it to be no wonder, for are not all persons, white as well as Natives, clashing with their neighbors in the rush of business? But here again your complainant is at fault. He has put the shoe on the wrong foot. The clashing of which he complains is at fishing stations; and if he had said the Employees of a California Syndicate, who come each season to harvest Alaska, but sow no seed, are clashing with the Tlinkit Native fishermen whose rights to fish have been undisputed till the whites came, he would have told the truth. Now it is because these Tlinkit Natives choose to sell some of their fish to the Metlakatla Cannery that our people are charged with clashing with their neighbors. Most of our Tsimshian fishermen go to the Skeena River in British Columbia, being importuned each season to do so by the Cannery Agents. Some of our people are also employed by Canneries in Alaska, but nearly all who fish for Metlakatla Cannery are Alaskan Natives who are not on the Reservation but who do the clashing complained of.

From what I have written I think you will agree with me that while our people

A

Hon. John C. Brady

8 Jan. 1900.

fun for their young men and maidens without cost during the winter months, and for these extra benefits they are ready you see to avail themselves of the Reservation system. These facts suggest caution in dealing with them. They are still children in many respects and need the same watchful care, guidance, and discipline.

This brings me to notice your advice to our people in respect to individual ownership of land, implying that by each taking possession of 160 acres of land, they would then get rid of the odium which the Reservation system casts upon them, and become an independent people.

Letive ownership and ✓ Again I have to differ from you, for while it may be made to appear to the native a grand thing to own 160 acres of land, yet you and I know enough of the native and the country to assure us that such an acquisition would be to him no benefit at all. The natives are not farmers, nor ever will be in Alaska. Annette Island is not adapted for farming, nor has the Indian either the will or the means for clearing forest. It is, therefore, easy to see what would happen to the acquisition when the day came for paying the land tax. Would the native be likely to pay taxes for what he could not utilize? Hence the land would pass out of his possession for inability to meet his obligations.

This presents another view to be taken of your recommendation. If some of our people were to act upon your advice would not that eventually lead to their relinquishing the Island altogether, and Metlakshla would no longer offer, as it does now, a refuge and peaceful home to any of the Alaskan natives around us who wish to escape from the vices and degrading customs that still enthrall their own settlements?

Next I have to notice a discrepancy or two in your Annual Report in regard to work at Metlakshla. Your first statement reads, Mr. Duncan can give employment to not more than five per cent of his people. And you also say that people "make

Hon. John C. Brady

5

8 Jan. 1900.

A

school teacher? The answer is a pitiable return indeed, probably they are worse rather than better, and for which their location is mainly responsible. Then as to the Tanaga and Cape Fox Natives, who have been encouraged to leave their respective villages, which the Government were pledged to preserve to them and to settle among the whites at Ketchikan and Saxman on land over which they have no secure tenure, surely they are to be pitied for demoralization stares them in the face.

I am led to refer to these cases of maltreatment of the natives to show the anomaly for anxiety on the land question on behalf of Metlakatla, which is already well cared for, while the condition of all the other natives in Alaska in this respect is being deplorably neglected.

Citizenship

(The next question upon which you offer advice to our people is Citizenship. Before commenting on this subject generally I desire to correct an impression which you apparently entertain, which is, that I am averse to our people becoming citizens. So far, however, from that being the case, the opposite is true. I urged for citizenship for them twelve years ago in Washington, D. C. and have ever kept it before our people as the goal in civil life to which they must aim to reach.) When the late Judge Bugbee was District Judge of Alaska I wrote to him specially on their behalf. And at the present time there is a communication of mine in the office of the Secretary of the Interior, written at the request of our people. Thus you will see that your information as to my steps on this matter was not reliable.

Now in regard to the general question of Citizenship it has to be kept in mind that the standpoint from which the natives view the question is not the same from which you and I view it. The natives see but one side of the question, the benefits and status it confers; but as for the other side the duties and the responsibilities it entails they very dimly realize it. As a proof of my assertion I may mention that our people have of late availed themselves of every opportunity offer-

of
gives on
citizenship

A

Hon. John G. Brady

— 4 —

8 Jan. 1900.

ment? Are they not rather justified in taking just the opposite view? Reasoning that as Congress can trust him with that authority surely they may safely trust him too.

I tell our people to rest assured that when the time comes for the Secretary of the Interior to take action in regard to the Island it will not be for their detriment but for their betterment. All they need to do is to live properly and thus prove themselves to be worthy of his confidence, and then face the future without any fear.

The late Secretary of the Interior took a noble stand on our peoples behalf, giving his "unqualified disapproval" to the attempt made by certain persons, some two years ago, to alienate a portion of Annette Island; and we have no reason to doubt that the present Incumbent of that responsible office, will be as firm and considerate as his predecessor.

From what I have written it will appear to you that I am far from regarding the Act of Congress March 3, 1891, as a trouble-breeder; rather do I regard it as wise and beneficent legislation, which, if it was extended to every tribe of Natives in Alaska would prove, I believe, a mighty factor for their uplifting in civilized life. It would assure them a permanent home in the land of their fathers, and give them confidence in the good will of the Government.

While, therefore, I do not favor in the least degree what is termed the Reservation system, I would earnestly recommend the Government to set aside small Reservations for every Native settlement in Alaska before it be too late, and thus encourage every Band to build for itself a civilized home that cannot be invaded by Saloons or other demoralizing institutions.)

To instance the necessity for Governmental Action in this direction I need

to instance the necessity for Governmental Action in this direction I need

Document No. 3.
Volume No. 16.

A

Hon. John G. Brady

-- 3 --

3 Jan. 1903.

It will, I feel sure, strike all who know anything of the native character, that such alarms, though they are false alarms, cannot but be prejudicial to the growth of loyalty among our people. To their minds, the opinions you have expressed insinuate untruthfulness on the part of the Government, and insincerity or ignorance on the part of their friends.

Now as to the question at issue, I have to say that while it is true that our people are on a Reservation it is not true that they are under the Reservation system. That you know as well as I do. Not any of the restraints, regulations and characteristics common to Indian Reservations have been affixed to the Congressional Act by which our people occupy Annette Island, and for this very good reason our people are not savages, but a Christian, self-supporting and law-abiding community from the day they migrated to Alaska.

I further deny it to be true that the policy of the United States with regard to Alaskan Natives is to place them under the Reservation system. And as to supposing the Government will ever think of fettering or cooping up a thrifty and progressive people and then feeding them and clothing them in idleness, I can only regard the bare suggestion of such a measure as a libel upon its integrity and common sense. How can it be possible that a Nation which is now sacrificing blood and treasure to free an Alien race from oppression and wrong, could ever be capable of inflicting an uncalled for cruelty on a handful of helpless people under its own flag, after repeatedly assuring them by word and act, through its highest Functionaries, of its respect for their advancement. I say again, the mere thought of such inconsistency ought not to be indulged for a moment.

If it is asked, why then was Annette Island reserved at all? My answer is, that the people who had been robbed of their patrimony in British

Alaska
is under
Reservation
system.

True policy
of Government

Document No. 3.
Folder No. 16.

31 Jan 1900;

Hon. John G. Brady

pieces of legislation in the opinion of many people is a trouble-breeder, that it introduces into Alaska the Reservation system of handling the Natives". And in your letter to our people dated 23 Nov. 1899, you inform them that their "position as a people in the territory is uncertain." That they "are bound to observe and live under the rules and regulations which the Secretary of the Interior may prescribe from time to time". That "if he sees fit to put an Agent over you and confine you to the limits of Annette Island, he would have this law as his authority for doing so."

You further add, "I do not know upon whose advice this law of March 3, 1891 was passed, whether it was your own working, or was advised independently of you by people who were friendly disposed but surely not well informed as to the working of the Reservation system upon the Natives."

You further say, "As matters now stand you cannot all make your living upon Annette Island, or at least are not doing so. So it would be absurd to think of confining you to its limits unless the Government wishes to build your houses and furnish you with clothing and food, and I feel certain you do not want to lower yourselves to such a plane."

The first thought that occurred to me on reading the foregoing lines was, what a pity they were not spoken by you in person when on your recent visit to Hatakhtla you addressed our people at a public meeting. Instead of that these startling sentiments first reached us through one of our natives with whom you had a conversation in Sitka and were eagerly made a pretext by a few malcontents to raise a hue and cry. Such inflammatory utterances as "Our eyes are now open", "we are being deceived and misled", "we must take steps without delay to become free men.", naturally caused an agitation and carried some of our people for a time off

1/8/00 to

Document No. 3.
Folder No. 16.

✓ 5, 6, 2
A

COPY

Metlakatla, Alaska, 8 Jan. 1900.

Hon. John G. Brady,
Governor of Alaska.

Dear Sir:-

Your letter of 27 Nov. with its enclosures was delayed in transit or I should have replied to it earlier.

Taking issue
with your

I desire to thank you for your courtesy in writing to me so fully your views on questions affecting the welfare of Metlakatla, but I beg respectfully, yet candidly, to confess I do not share in your apprehensions, nor do I agree with the recommendations you offer our Natives in regard to the course they should pursue.

Information
governing

Touching first your report of Metlakatla to the Government, a copy of which you have kindly sent me, I notice a few notable mistakes showing that you are greatly misinformed on some important particulars concerning our Mission. The first error is in regard to the initiation of the Mission. Had I taken the course you describe, I should, without doubt, have experienced the same ill success in Missionary work which has characterized Alaskan Missions generally.

the Circumstances
of found
ing of colony

I did not, as you report, begin my work forty two years ago by moving a band of Taimshesna from Port Simpson, but forty two years ago I arrived at Port Simpson where were located about 2000 Natives in a most degraded condition of savage life, and there I worked for nearly five (5) years. At the end of that time I moved from Port Simpson to a spot seventeen miles away and commenced the settlement of Metlakatla for all the Natives who had been won by Gospel teaching to lead a Christian life. It was not, therefore, a change of location, nor my establishing of industries, as some people have assumed, to which the Taimshesna owe their commencement in civilized life, but solely to the Gospel which they accepted.