

5-1-1964

An Investigation of the Theology of C.W. Butler

Donald Hohensee

Recommended Citation

Hohensee, Donald, "An Investigation of the Theology of C.W. Butler" (1964). *Western Evangelical Seminary Theses*. 124.
http://digitalcommons.georgefox.edu/wes_theses/124

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Western Evangelical Seminary at Digital Commons @ George Fox University. It has been accepted for inclusion in Western Evangelical Seminary Theses by an authorized administrator of Digital Commons @ George Fox University. For more information, please contact arolfe@georgefox.edu.

AN INVESTIGATION OF THE THEOLOGY OF

C. W. BUTLER

A Thesis

Submitted to
the Faculty of
Western Evangelical Seminary

In Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree
Bachelor of Divinity

by
Donald Hohensee

May 1964

APPROVED BY

Major Professor: Eldon R. Fuhrman

Co-operative Reader: Kenneth P. Wesche

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The author of this thesis is indebted to several institutions and individuals.

He is indebted to the following institutions: Vennard College for the use of their files of The Christian Witness, 1933-1939; Western Evangelical Seminary for their files of The Christian Witness, the Pentecostal Herald and The Herald.

He is indebted to the following individuals: Dr. Delbert Rose for the use of his files of The Christian Witness, also for the direction he gave as to sources for investigation; Dr. Eldon Fuhrman, my advisor, who loaned me his books which dealt with the area under study, also for the valuable direction he gave without which this thesis never would have materialized; Norene Hohensee, my wife, for the assistance she gave during the months of research, also for the encouragement she gave all along the way.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER		PAGE
I.	INTRODUCTION	1
	The Problem	2
	Statement of the problem	2
	Justification of the Study	3
	Limitation of the Study	4
	Method of Procedure	4
	Definition of Terms	5
	Organization of Thesis	6
II.	THE DOCTRINE OF GOD	7
	The Knowledge of God	8
	Natural revelation	9
	Special revelation	9
	Revelation and inspiration	10
	Divine and human element	11
	Unity and purpose of revelation	12
	Finished revelation	14
	Central figure of revelation	15
	Authority of revelation	16
	Response to revelation	16
	The Existence of God	18
	God as revealed in natural revelation	19
	God as revealed in special revelation	20

CHAPTER	PAGE
Personality of God	20
Trinity	22
Names of God	24
The will of God	24
Divine limitations	26
Natural attributes	27
Moral attributes	28
The Nature of God	30
Summary	34
III. THE HOLINESS OF GOD MANIFEST IN CREATION	36
Angels	37
Man	38
Summary	46
IV. THE HOLINESS OF GOD LOST IN MAN	48
Origin of Evil	49
Original Sin and Total Depravity	52
Twofold Nature of Sin	53
Penalty and Effects of Sin	55
Summary	56
V. THE HOLINESS OF GOD MANIFESTED AND PROVIDED BY REDEMPTION.	58
Introduction	59
The Doctrine of Christ	61
Christology--Scriptural approach	61
The person of Christ	64

CHAPTER	PAGE
Deity	64
Humanity	65
Unity of person--diversity of natures	65
Offices and estates of Christ	66
State of humiliation	66
State of exaltation	66
Offices of Christ	68
The atonement	71
Benefits of the atonement	79
The Doctrine of the Holy Spirit	81
Person	81
Offices of the Holy Spirit	82
Birth of the Spirit	84
Baptism of the Spirit	85
The witness of the Spirit	86
Manifestations of the Spirit	87
The fruit of the Spirit	88
The gifts of the Spirit	88
The guidance of the Spirit	89
The grieving of the Holy Spirit	90
Summary	90
VI. THE HOLINESS OF GOD RESTORED IN MAN	92
Individually	93
Zone one of salvation	93

CHAPTER

PAGE

Repentance	93
Saving faith	94
Justification	95
Regeneration	96
The will in salvation	98
Zone two of salvation	99
Holiness, the New Testament standard and command . . .	99
Holiness--a possibility	101
Definition of holiness	101
Relation of justification and regeneration to sanctification	103
Time element for the obtainment of holiness	104
Holiness--a second crisis experience	106
Christian holiness or entire sanctification	107
Eradication of sin	113
Distinction between sanctification and holiness . . .	115
Christian perfection	115
Growth in grace	117
Temptation	122
Possibility of falling into sin	126
Zone three of salvation	128
Collectively	129
Summary	130

CHAPTER	PAGE
VII. THE HOLINESS OF GOD IN LAST THINGS	132
Death and Immortality	133
Christ's Second Coming	134
Resurrection and Judgment	135
Final Consummation	136
Hell	136
Heaven	137
Summary	137
VIII. SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS	138
Summary	139
Conclusions	141
Suggestions for Further Study	142
APPENDIX	143
BIBLIOGRAPHY	146



Charles William Butler 1872-1960

INTRODUCTION

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

The Reformation brought to light truths which had been hidden and forgotten for many years. The truth which Luther helped to bring to remembrance was that of justification by faith. This truth was the source and determinate of his theology.¹ About two hundred years later another man of God helped to bring out a forgotten truth, that of entire sanctification by faith. This man was John Wesley. This truth is regarded by many as being the source and determinate of his theology.² The Methodist Church, which sprang from the movement started by Wesley, spread to America, producing many great leaders. Much research has been done on the theology of Wesley and his immediate followers but a lesser amount of research has been done on those who followed him on the American scene. One of those who stood in the Wesleyan tradition in the American scene was C. W. Butler.

I. THE PROBLEM

Statement of the Problem

The problem of this paper was to investigate C. W. Butler's

¹Ewald M. Plass, This Is Luther (St. Louis, Mo.: Concordia Publishing House, 1948), p. 93. See also Luther's Works, American Edition, Vols. XXVI and XXVII.

²Harald Lindstrom, Wesley and Sanctification (London: Epworth Press, 1946), p. 218. George Allen Turner, The More Excellent Way (Winona Lake, Indiana: Light and Life Press, 1952), p. 274.

theology in order to: (1) ascertain the focal point of his theology, (2) set forth the effect this focal point had on the rest of his theology, and (3) systematize his theology in the light of that influence.

II. JUSTIFICATION OF THE STUDY

As was mentioned earlier, it has been observed that much research has been done on Wesley and his immediate followers but a lesser amount of research has been done on those who followed him on the American scene.³ The Methodist Church has influenced the lives of multitudes of people. Also, other denominations have grown out of Methodist people who became dissatisfied with the trends in Methodism. These denominations, in turn, have affected the lives of thousands of other peoples. The doctrines which were peculiar to the Methodist Church have been the predominate emphases of these other churches.

This research project has attempted to study the life and theology of one who followed Wesley on the American scene. The one studied has influenced many people across America. In addition to this, no one has ever systematized the works of C. W. Butler. Therefore, this study has been justified on a twofold basis. Little research has been done on those men who influenced the lives of thousands of peoples in the Methodist churches and no one has yet systematized the works of C. W. Butler.

³Delbert Roy Rose, "The Theology of Joseph H. Smith" (unpublished Doctoral dissertation, The State University of Iowa, Iowa City, Iowa, 1952), 1.

III. LIMITATION OF THE SUBJECT

The central purpose of this study has been theological. The historical background has been surveyed but not included in this study. If the reader would desire to acquaint himself with this, he can check Dr. Delbert Rose's doctoral dissertation entitled, "The Theology of Joseph H. Smith." This dissertation was submitted to the Department of Religion at the Graduate College of the State University of Iowa.

It has not been the purpose of this study to prove that Butler's theology was Wesleyan or something else. Nor has there been an attempt to prove the truth or falsity of Butler's position. Rather, the only things attempted here have been to show the central motif of Butler's theology and how it affected the rest of his thought.

IV. METHOD OF PROCEDURE

The material for this study has been gathered in the usual manner of library research. Butler wrote only a few books. The majority of the support for this study has been drawn from the editorials which he wrote for the Christian Witness and the articles he contributed to the Pentecostal Herald and The Herald. In addition to this, his published sermons have been examined. These, however, were few in number.

Every available editorial and article which Butler wrote was examined at least once. Those articles which were not theological in nature were eliminated in the first reading. Those dealing with Butler's theological position were examined a second time. In the third

examination, the material was gathered which now comprises this thesis. Since editorials are not lengthy in word content it was necessary to draw his theological position from many articles.

V. DEFINITION OF TERMS

The terms which Butler used are in general agreement with the traditional Wesleyan theological terminology. He spoke often of salvation as consisting of two hemispheres or three zones.⁴ The first zone and hemisphere was that which is usually referred to as the first crisis experience. This he referred to as "being born of the spirit."⁵ He also thought of this as conversion. Included in this is justification, regeneration, adoption and the witness of the Spirit.

The second zone and hemisphere is that which is usually referred to as the second crisis. This second crisis also was referred to as "entire sanctification," "holiness," "a pure heart," "Christian perfection," "perfect love," "full salvation," "a personal pentecost," and "the second work of grace." This experience is Scriptural holiness.

Butler used the term holiness more than the other terms. It has been defined in a greater manner in the body of this study, but since it has been used so often a brief definition has been given here. He

⁴C. W. Butler, "The Double Cure," Pentecostal Herald, LXI (April 6, 1949), 3.

⁵C. W. Butler, "Bible Perfection," The Christian Witness, New Series LXII (October 12, 1944), 1, 2.

defined holiness as the "absence of sin" and the "presence of righteousness." Further, holiness is "unmixed good." It "excludes all that is contrary to its own nature, and it permeates and changes all that it does not exclude."⁶

VI. ORGANIZATION OF THESIS

The remainder of this thesis has been organized into seven chapters. Chapter II dealt with Butler's doctrine of God. His doctrine of God brought out the fact that his strong emphasis was on the holiness of God. Chapter III presented Butler's position on how God's holiness was manifested in creation. Chapter IV indicated how man lost his original holiness. Chapter V presented the holiness of God as manifested by redemption. It presented the objective side of salvation. Chapter VI indicated the way by which holiness could be renewed in man. It presented the subjective side of salvation. Chapter VII presented the holiness of God as it was manifested in last things. Chapter VIII presented the summary and conclusions reached.

⁶Theodore W. Engstrom (ed.), Victorious and Fruitful Living (Grand Rapids, Michigan: Zondervan Publishing House, 1942), p. 15.

THE DOCTRINE OF GOD

CHAPTER II

THE DOCTRINE OF GOD

The purpose of this chapter was to present Butler's doctrine of God. Since Butler based his doctrine of God on Scripture, his position concerning Scripture has also been presented in this chapter as a background for his doctrine of God. This chapter has treated Butler's position as to God's personality, trinity, will, attributes, and nature.

I. THE KNOWLEDGE OF GOD

Butler claimed that God created man a rational being. Since he was thus created, he ever seeks a cause for every effect. In that process of thinking he moves back from effect to cause till he reaches a cause great enough to account for all effects. When man discovers that cause he finds anchorage for his rational processes.¹

Butler believed that man's knowledge is partial in practically every field of investigation. This does not mean that the knowledge man possesses is inaccurate or undependable. It could be accurate, dependable and wholly adequate for man's purpose. This has been shown to be applicable in things material and temporal. Finite man has never compassed all the realities of life nor has he ever secured complete knowledge of the infinite. This knowledge, however, has been

¹C. W. Butler, "Faith-Building Messages," The Christian Witness, New Series LXVII (January 4, 1940), 1. Butler, "Holiness," ibid., New Series LIX (May 15, 1941), 1.

adequate to produce the desired spiritual results.²

Natural Revelation

Butler said that two sources of information concerning God are open to man for investigation. The first source with which he is confronted is the open book of nature. In this book man was brought face to face with the fact of design, of purpose, of plan and of intelligent forethought. The idea of thought necessitated man to think of a thinker or person. This led to the concept of personality. Butler believed that natural revelation would have been adequate if the Creator had only desired to reveal Himself and His glory. But since He had a great moral purpose, natural revelation proved inadequate.³

Special Revelation

Butler held that since natural revelation was inadequate for God's purpose, God gave man additional information concerning Himself. This second source God gave to man was the Scriptures or special revelation. The Scriptures made no attempt to prove the existence of God, but they began with the direct assertion of His personality and of the exercise of His wisdom and power "as the great first cause in the realm of creation."⁴

²C. W. Butler, "I Know in Part," The Christian Witness, New Series LIX (January 1, 1942), 8, 10.

³Ibid., p. 10.

⁴Ibid.

Revelation and inspiration. Butler maintained that the Bible was authoritative because it was divinely inspired. The objective of inspiration was revelation. The entirety of the Bible was inspired. The great objective of inspiration was the revelation of God and His will in His great redemptive undertakings for mankind. There was a holy purpose for every event recorded and every statement made in the Bible. Incidents were related under the Spirit's inspiration in the most concise and suggestive manner possible. If this had not been true the Bible would have become impractical and useless because of the multitude of things recorded.⁵

In spelling out the manner in which God inspired the authors of Scripture Butler noted that much that has been recorded in the Scriptures was information which the writer was acquainted with. It, therefore, did not need to be revealed to him. However, he needed the inspiration of the Holy Spirit to record only that which was necessary to serve the purpose of divine revelation. On the other hand, some Scripture was not only inspired but was directly revealed to the writer, "that is, the content of the message was divinely imparted by the revelation of God to the writer."⁶ Thus, a high view of inspiration was maintained.

⁵C. W. Butler, "Faith-Building Messages," The Christian Witness, New Series LXIV (January 11, 1940), 1.

⁶C. W. Butler, "Like Precious Faith," ibid., New Series LX (March 26, 1942), 8.

In pursuing the matter a step further, Butler said that there were recorded in the Scriptures, as a matter of completing the records, some incidents which do not show either the approval or disapproval on the part of a holy God. He indicated that it was possible for God to have permitted these to enter the book "to test the faith and loyalty of those to whom it has been given."⁷ This is how he explained some of the difficulties of inspiration.

Divine and human element. Butler realized that there were two sides to revelation, the divine and the human. II Peter 1:21 told him that, "Holy men of God spoke as they were moved by the Holy Ghost." He saw that it was men who spoke. This was further clarified by the statement that it was "men of God" and "Holy men of God" who spoke. This discovered to Butler the human element in revelation. From this view point the Bible was a wholly human book as it was written by men, and yet, the divine element was also brought out in this verse. "Holy men of God spoke as they were moved by the Holy Ghost." Thus, the same book is wholly divine in that men wrote under the inspiration of the Holy Spirit.⁸ The true author of the Bible is the uncreated sovereign of eternity. He is revealed to man as the adequate first cause. The Holy Spirit, the third person of the Trinity, was the person of the

⁷Ibid.

⁸C. W. Butler, "Like Precious Faith," The Christian Witness, New Series LX (March 26, 1942), 1, 8. Butler, "Great Doctrinal Truths, The Doctrine of Revelation," The Herald, LXVI (June 1, 1955), 2.

Godhead who authored the Book.⁹ Hence, the divineness of biblical revelation.

In describing the Spirit's work in revelation Butler made it clear that he did not believe that the Holy Spirit made the men dictaphones,

but rather that man in his intelligence was so elevated and illumined by a special operation of the Holy Spirit that he recorded truth without mistake or error. The human and the divine blended and united in the final result. Each inspired writer was left to so express the truth as to put upon it the stamp of his own personality and of his own literary style.¹⁰

Thus the book is both human and divine. It is not part human and part divine but rather in all of it there is the human and there is the divine.¹¹ Its humanness made it understandable to man, its diviness gave it authority over him.

Unity and purpose of revelation. Butler noted the unity of the Word of God is the strongest evidence that there was one intelligence who was the author of the whole. This great literature contains two main divisions or covenants between God and man. It is made up of sixty-six documents written by some forty different human authors. These men, whose lives span some sixteen centuries of time, recorded for

⁹C. W. Butler, "The Bible," The Herald, LXVIII (July 10, 1957), 2, 11. Butler, "Great Doctrinal Truths, The Doctrine of Revelation," ibid., LXVI (June 1, 1955), 2.

¹⁰C. W. Butler, "Faith-Building Messages," The Christian Witness, New Series LXVII (January 11, 1940), 1, 2.

¹¹Ibid., p. 2.

mankind what took place in the eternity before time, outlined some of the essential happenings of time and reached out to the everlasting future. Butler believed that the book marked by this fundamental principle of unity was nothing less than the miracle of the ages in the realm of literature.¹²

Butler cited several elements which make up this unity. First, there is the great central theme of the book, redemption. The Bible does not pretend to give an historical record of mankind but rather it incorporates only as much of history as is necessary to give a complete history of human redemption. It records only as much of the beginnings as was necessary to begin the history of redemption. The second element which bound the book together for Butler was the dominant personality of the Redeemer. Christ, the eternal Son in the Godhead, who in humiliation identified Himself with humanity, racially speaking, is the Redeemer. From its early pages, in types, shadows, predictive prophecy and in direct didactic teaching Christ is present. His presence permeates the entire written revelation. The third element which binds the book together is the method of redemption, by the shedding of blood. This method, according to Butler, was based on and grew out of the holiness of God Himself. The deep demerit of sin has thus been exposed and God's act of forgiveness on conditions of faith has been

¹²C. W. Butler, "Divine Revelation," The Herald, LXVI (July 13, 1955), 2. Butler, "The Indispensable Word," Pentecostal Herald, LXI (June 7, 1950), 3. Butler, "It is Written," The Christian Witness, New Series LXII (February 8, 1945), 1.

justified. In the final offering of Christ the righteousness of God is revealed and manifested. Butler held that it is on this basis, also, that grace and mercy can be released but only in such a way as will maintain the holiness of God and provide a way of salvation for man the sinner. This adequate remedy for sin was planned before the foundation of the world. The fourth element which bound the book together for Butler was the fact of predictive prophecy and its fulfillment. It was given in such a manner that men fulfilled God's word by following their own free choices. They were unaware of fulfilling God's word. The fifth element which bound the book together was its universal message. It was written for all men for all time. Whenever the conditions are met, the promised results are obtained. This last fact, according to Butler, has been tested in the laboratory of personal experience everywhere. He held that it has never failed to produce the desired results wherever it has been tried.¹³

Finished revelation. Butler recognized that in the past decades some have attempted to break with the authority of the written word. This has had the result of leaving man without the anchorage of a finished and final revelation, which had final and absolute authority. It was claimed that God was the source of authority, but they refused to recognize His written word as the final court of appeal. Butler, on the

¹³C. W. Butler, "Faith-Building Messages," The Christian Witness, New Series LXVII (January 25, 1940), 1, 2, 4, 10. Butler, "The Indispensable Word," Pentecostal Herald, LXI (June 7, 1950), 3, 11. Butler, "The Word of God," The Herald, LXIV (February 4, 1953), 3. Butler, "Great Doctrinal Truths, The Doctrine of Revelation," ibid., LXVI (June 1, 1955), 2.

other hand, argued that God has so revealed Himself and His will for all men and for all time "that the final court of appeals in all matters of faith and practice is the written word." God does not reveal Himself nor lead anyone except in harmony "with that which is both revealed and recorded in the Holy Scriptures."¹⁴

In assuring his readers of the adequacy of the Bible, Butler insisted that if the world should stand another million years, men would not need one word added to the Holy Scriptures. God has said His last word to man regarding all man needs to know for his eternal destiny. God has made His final statement concerning Himself, man, man's origin, his fallen state and his recovery by grace.¹⁵ Thus, no further revelation need be given. Man has a finished and final revelation.¹⁶

Central figure of revelation. Butler maintained that Christ is the central figure of all of revelation. He is not only the Christ of the entire Bible but He is the Christ of the eternities. He is the incomparable Christ. The Christian's faith is a book faith, but it is a book faith in which there is revealed a person in whom faith centers and from whom life and salvation flow. Christians hold to the written word and receive Him who is the living Word. Some claim to have the living Word but disclaim faith in and loyalty to the written word. The

¹⁴C. W. Butler, "Stand Firm Against False Teaching," The Herald, XIV, (January 7, 1953), 3.

¹⁵C. W. Butler, "Divine Revelation," The Herald, LXVI (July 13, 1955), 2.

¹⁶C. W. Butler, ibid., p. 13.

Christ who is revealed in the Bible is very God and very man. He is the one mediator between God and man. Butler was dogmatic on the fact that the written word and the living Word are indispensable in a true Christian faith.¹⁷

Authority of revelation. Butler said that the words of Christ are authoritative because of who He was and what He did in behalf of a lost Adam's race. His words are authoritative because He was God. Christians are not loyal to Christ because of what He taught, but they regard His teaching as final authority because of who He was.¹⁸ Though Butler did not apply the above principle to all of Scripture in this reference yet from his overall view this principle would apply to all of Scripture since the Holy Spirit was the real author.

Response to revelation. Butler held that man is a rational creature. He maintained, therefore, that man must make a response to that which has been revealed. The Word of God is addressed to man's whole personality, but by the route of rational thinking. Therefore, the first office of reason in relation to revelation "is to weigh the evidences for the claim of the documents involved in that revelation as to the divine inspiration of the same."¹⁹ When this has been

¹⁷C. W. Butler, "The Indispensable Word," Pentecostal Herald, LXI (May 3, 1950), 3.

¹⁸C. W. Butler, "The Test of Love," The Christian Witness, New Series LX (July 23, 1942), 12.

¹⁹C. W. Butler, "The Word of God and Faith," The Christian Witness, New Series LIX (August 21, 1941), 1.

established the second function of reason is the application of the laws of interpretation to ascertain the truth which the Scriptures teach. If the Scriptures are inspired it is reasonable for one to accept the teaching thereof by faith and test it in actual experience. However, it is expected that there will be truths in the Bible which pass possible human understanding. The following statement summarizes Butler's views on this matter.

The faith I recommend to you is a moral act of our whole self-hood. It involves our intellectual grasp of the truth and the choice of our will to accept it and obey it. There will be occasions all along the way of life where we shall need to exercise the act of faith. The basis for such action is a fixed attitude of belief in the authority of Scripture and in the faithfulness and holiness of God.²⁰

In summary then, it is possible to say that Butler accepted two sources of revelation, natural and special. Natural revelation was inadequate for the purpose God had in mind. He gave a special revelation to man, this is contained in the sixty-six books of the two testaments. The entire book is inspired and some of it specially revealed. It was written by man but the true author is the Holy Spirit. The central theme of the book is redemption, the central person of the book is the Redeemer. It is a finished and final revelation. It is authoritative because it was given by God. Reason must examine the book and interpret it, it is up to man to accept what reason interprets. With this in mind it was possible to determine the remainder of his

²⁰Ibid., p. 11.

theology and particularly the focal point upon which the remainder of his theology was built.

II. THE EXISTENCE OF GOD

It has already been noted that Butler believed that man is a rational being. He seeks a cause for every effect. When he finds a cause great enough to explain all effects he has discovered the First Cause. Butler quoted Herbert Spencer that, "nothing produces nothing," and agreed with Spencer that nothing produces nothing, but he did not accept Spencer's conclusion that matter is therefore eternal. Butler believed that matter was inadequate as an explanation for the original first cause. He further believed that the first cause must be one who has liberty and choice. If the first cause had mere necessity as its existence then nothing which is could not have been nor could it have had any other mode of existence. Such a position was absurd for Butler. In contrast to Spencer, Butler accepted a transcendent and sovereign God who was great enough to account for all that is.²¹ This gave to him anchorage for his rational processes, and he said it would do the same for others.

Butler opened his Bible to the first page and there he found, "In the beginning God." Here he found a transcendent, uncreated and

²¹C. W. Butler, "Faith-Building Messages," The Christian Witness, New Series LXVII (January 4, 1940), 1. Butler, "It is Written," ibid., New Series LXII (February 8, 1945), 1. Butler, "Anchorage of Faith," The Herald, LXVIII (November 6, 1959), 11.

and eternal God who was great enough to be the first cause of all things. He saw here one whose very glory would have burned men up if they had come into His presence as they were, this one created the universe and has chosen to enter into covenant relationship with man.²²

Butler held that there are two areas open to men in which they can determine more about this First Cause. They are natural revelation and special revelation.

God as Revealed in Natural Revelation

This first cause Butler referred to as God, the eternal, transcendent, uncreated one inasmuch as God is creator. The first area open to man for study about God is the book of nature. The study of this book is referred to as science. Science studies the works of God but what men call natural law is only God's usual way of doing things. A miracle is a record of God doing something in a way other than His usual way. The study of nature led him to conclude that God is a personal, intelligent, all-powerful and all-wise Being. The presence of plan, design, the law of adaption and the eternal fitness of things in the realm of the natural made a contribution to his understanding of His omnipotence and omniscience. From this study of nature, Butler also concluded that God was good and that He loved humanity. From the

²²C. W. Butler, "Be Ye Holy, For I am Holy," The Christian Witness, New Series LIV (September 17, 1936), 1, 9. Butler, "I Know in Part," ibid., New Series LIX (January 1, 1942), 8, 10. Butler, "God's Standard," The Herald, LXIII (February 6, 1952), 3.

luxuries He has given to man, Butler held that God was great and wise but also very good. This, however, would not make one absolutely sure about God. He could be good and benevolent and yet not altogether good. One might bow before Him in fear of His infinite greatness, but the element which calls for worship is not shown to man in natural revelation, therefore, man would not truly worship this one who only strikes awe into him.²³ Natural revelation does not give man information concerning the moral nature of God.

This area does not fully satisfy man in his quest of knowledge of Him, according to Butler, so it is necessary to turn to the second source of information concerning God.

God as Revealed in Special Revelation

Butler saw that special revelation presented the same things about God which natural revelation presented the one who looked into it. It brought these out in a more full and complete manner. It also confronted man with information about God which natural revelation could not reveal. The writer of this paper has attempted to arrange this information in a systematic form which would be characteristic of Butler's thinking.

Personality of God. In natural revelation, Butler saw that God was a person. Special revelation revealed to him that He was an

²³C. W. Butler, "Be Ye Holy, For I am Holy," The Christian Witness, New Series (September 17, 1936), 1, 9. Butler, "I Know in Part," ibid., New Series LIX (January 1, 1943), 8, 10. Butler, "God's Standard," The Herald, LXIII (February 6, 1952), 3.

uncreated personal God. Butler saw Him revealed as an infinite personality, also that He is a Spirit personality. When Butler spoke of personality he had the following in mind: He is some One, not something; He is a self-conscious some One who can exercise volition, intelligence and approval or disapproval. He is a being who possesses natural and moral attributes. His chief attribute is freedom.

He is the self-determined One. His determination is the perfect manifestation of Himself; this is the significance of the law of God; the holiness of God is the central principle in that law, the principle in which He cannot become other than He is.²⁴

He is a living being exercising the functions of a rational and intelligent nature.²⁵

Butler held that the Christian view is that while God is immanent in the world He is also personally distinct from the world and from the finite creatures which He has made. To identify God with the totality of the world would be to accept a pantheistic view of God. This would destroy Him as a person to whom one might appeal and in whom one may place implicit trust for help. For Butler, the Scriptures declared that He is transcendentally glorious, infinite in power, in wisdom and in holiness. The Scriptures further revealed to him that God is the Creator of the material universe and that He is the rightful moral ruler of all created intelligences. The quality of God's character,

²⁴C. W. Butler, "The Tragedy of the Present Drift in the Religious World," The Christian Witness, New Series LVII (April 6, 1939), 1.

²⁵C. W. Butler, "The Sovereign Will of God," The Christian Witness, New Series LIV (March 19, 1936), 1.

according to Butler, is revealed under the symbol of light. The moral content of His character is declared love. His mercy is described as from everlasting to everlasting. His justice is declared both directly and is illustrated by His visitations of judgment. His self-revelation is in the book He has given. This book presents Him to man's intelligence as the one great enough to account for all facts.²⁶

Trinity. The following quotation contains the essence of Butler's view of the trinity. "The fact of Godhood as revealed in the Holy Scriptures involves unity as to the nature of Godhood, but trinity in the mode of God's existence."²⁷ In the total revelation of Scripture, there is discovered the fact of the unity of God in nature and essence but it is also discovered that this nature and essence is manifest in three persons, co-equal and co-eternal. This is a mystery which man cannot explain, because man's knowledge of God, while reliable, is not exhaustive. God is the eternal Father, the Son is the eternal Son and the Spirit is the eternal Spirit. In their revealed relationships the Father is always recognized as the one occupying the place of final and absolute authority. He is never given nor is He ever sent. Any apparent or real subordination of any of the persons of the trinity is

²⁶Ibid., pp. 1, 8. Butler, "It is Written," The Christian Witness, New Series LIV (June 1, 1936), 1. Butler, "Faith-Building Messages," ibid., New Series LXVII (January 4, 1940), 2. Butler, "The Truth Series," ibid., New Series LX (July 9, 1942), 1. Butler, "It is Written," ibid., New Series LXII (February 15, 1945), 1.

²⁷C. W. Butler, "The Truth Series," The Christian Witness, New Series LX (July 9, 1942), 8.

by the united will of the Godhead and serves some high purpose of deity. The Father sent the Son to be the Saviour of men. The Son took a subordinate place in relation to the Godhead when He laid aside His glory and united Himself with the seed of Abraham. He did this for the purpose of giving the fullest revelation of God to man and to provide a complete redemption for the human race. "Thus as the Son of man, (not of a man) and as God the Son, He remained unbroken in the unity of the divine will in His self-giving for human redemption."²⁸ However, Butler adds a word of caution at this point. When one presses the illustrations of the father and son too far it breaks down. Man usually thinks of the father as existing prior to the son but in the Godhead this is not so. There never was a time when God the Father was not Father and when the Son was not the Son. The terms Father and Son in the Godhead are used to express the relation between the first and second persons of the holy trinity. It is further revealed that the Holy Spirit is the third person of the trinity and He is the eternal Spirit. The second person of the trinity is the creator and upholder of the universe. The eminence of the second person of the trinity with the universe does not identify Him with it but as having a continued relation to and interest in it. He remains independent of it.²⁹

²⁸C. W. Butler, "Christ Pre-eminent," The Christian Witness, New Series LXII (April 13, 1944), 1.

²⁹C. W. Butler, "Our Glorious Hope," The Christian Witness, New Series LII (March 29, 1934), 1. Butler, "The Truth Series," ibid., New

Names of God. Much emphasis has been made of the different names for God found in Genesis. Butler cut across much of this discussion by saying that all of the different terms used for God in the Genesis record simply reveal different facts regarding Him or throw light upon His infinite nature and attributes.³⁰ Beyond this, he does not discuss the documentary hypothesis.

The will of God. In Butler's study of special revelation, he saw at least two phases in the will of God, a sovereign will and a redemptive will. As for the first, God is the infinite sovereign inhabiting eternity. His sovereign will was exercised long before there was any occasion for Him to exercise His redemptive will. His sovereign will is exercised with reference to His wisdom and omniscience. God's sovereign will is moral as God is in totality a moral being. It is exercised in perfect harmony with His moral perfections. By His omnipotent fiat He created an orderly universe. In nature His will is obeyed completely. In God's creation of man He made him a morally responsible being. God respects man's will and will not violate it. God exercised His sovereign will when He decided to provide redemption for man. His sovereignty is controlled by His holiness, goodness, wisdom and power. His sovereign will for man is not revealed nor recorded.

Series LX (July 9, 1942), 8. Butler, "Christ Pre-eminent," ibid., New Series LXII (April 13, 1944), 1, 2.

³⁰C. W. Butler, "An Exalted God," The Christian Witness, New Series LXI (January 6, 1944), 1.

Butler believed physical healing, dispensing of gifts and manifestations of the Spirit are in relation to His sovereign will. God can build an universe or heal a leper by His sovereign will but He can not lift the guilt of one sinner apart from the work of Christ. Had He done the latter by His sovereign will He would have violated His moral government. Butler held that God's sovereign will is not revealed nor recorded, man can only discover it by personal inquiry and submission to that will. In this area His answer is sometimes "yes" and sometimes "no"³¹ as is illustrated in the area of bodily healing.

As for God's redemptive will, Butler believed that the present plan of redemption was in the mind of God before He spoke order out of chaos and organized the universe as a place for man to spend his probationary period. Redemption is one of the highest expressions of infinite wisdom. God's redemptive will is exercised with special reference to His holiness. Butler held that the benefits of Christ's death are conditionally bestowed but the finished work on the cross unconditionally makes all men savable. As was mentioned, God could build a universe by His sovereign will but the involvements of His moral will and nature are such that He could not forgive an erring sinner nor could He cleanse the pollution of one perverted heart without the

³¹C. W. Butler, "The Sovereign Will of God," The Christian Witness, New Series LIV (March 19, 1936), 1. Butler, "The Sprinkled Blood," Ibid., New Series LVI (March 24, 1938), 1. Butler, "The Will of God," ibid., New Series LX (April 23, 1942), 1. Butler, "Truth Series," ibid., New Series LXI (March 25, 1943), 1, 2. Butler, "The Commands of God," Pentecostal Herald, LXII (April 4, 1951), 3.

Supreme sacrifice and shed blood of His only begotten Son. Thus, God's redemptive will is backed by the blood of the atonement. Butler stated quite emphatically God's redemptive will is fully revealed and fully recorded. In prayer for redemption, it is out of order to pray "if it is the Lord's will." God never says "no" in matters pertaining to redemption when man meets the requirements. As God could not be just and deal with the sin problem apart from the atonement, now He cannot remain just and fail to hear the cry of penitent souls who meet the conditions. In redemption, God respects the will of man and does not force salvation on anyone.³² This is what Butler meant by the redemptive will of God.

Divine limitations. Butler recognized that because of the perfections of God, He is capable of doing anything He undertakes to do and He can do this in a perfect manner. Butler held that to think less of Him would destroy one's faith in a transcendently glorious being, perfect in wisdom, power and goodness. He must be able to do anything He undertakes to do providing He has an unhindered way. But, this statement implies a limitation. When God deals with other moral beings, He respects their choices. God is also limited by His own moral perfections. God cannot do evil, it is impossible for Him to lie. This is a necessity not because of nature and fate but of fitness and wisdom.

³²C. W. Butler, "God's Redemptive Will," The Christian Witness, New Series LIV (March 26, 1936), 1. Butler, "The Sprinkled Blood," ibid., New Series LVI (March 24, 1938), 1. Butler, "The Commands of God," Pentecostal Herald, LXII (April 4, 1951), 3, 7.

Further, this is consistent with the greatest freedom and most perfect choice. The foundation for this necessity is an unalterable rectitude of will and perfection of wisdom which makes it impossible for a wise being to act foolishly or for a nature infinitely good to choose to do evil.³³

Natural attributes. The Scriptures open with a declaration of God. They declare Him the great first cause in the realm of creation.³⁴ He is revealed as an infinite personality. By infinite, Butler meant that He was measureless, boundless, unlimited and perfect in an absolute sense.³⁵ Butler maintained that the one who looks into the Bible finds God and begins with Him as the uncreated, self-existent eternal One, the sovereign of eternity, He is ultimate reality. Life finds its ultimate meaning in and through this personal God. "From everlasting to everlasting thou art God,"³⁶ was a great truth with Butler. Butler also saw that this God possessed certain characteristics, which he called

³³C. W. Butler, "Christian Perfection," The Christian Witness, New Series LXVIII (August 22, 1940), 1. Butler, "Christ Pre-eminent," ibid., New Series LXII (April 20, 1944), 1. Butler, "Bible Perfection," ibid., New Series LXII (September 7, 1944), 1. Butler, "God's Will, Direct and Permissive, A study of Cause and Effect." The Herald, LXVII (February 1, 1956), 2. Butler, "In the Beginning God," ibid., LXIX (February 11, 1959), 2.

³⁴C. W. Butler, "I Know in Part," The Christian Witness, New Series LIX (January 1, 1942), 10.

³⁵C. W. Butler, "It is Written," The Christian Witness, New Series LXII (February 15, 1945), 1.

³⁶C. W. Butler, "Great Doctrinal Truths," The Herald, LXVI (April 6, 1955), 2.

attributes. He divided these attributes into two classes, natural and moral.

This God is revealed as infinite in all the attributes of His personality. This means that He is measureless, boundless and absolute in all the perfection of each attribute, and beyond the total of all of this, He is more than all that man knows about Him. He is omniscient, perfect in knowledge. This knowledge embraces all things, past, present and future. He is also possessed with perfect wisdom. "Wisdom is that quality with personality which enables one to apply knowledge or to choose ends, and then choose the best methods for realizing those ends."³⁷ Again, He is omnipotent, perfect in power. He limits the use of this power by His moral perfections. He is omnipresent, His presence embraces all duration and space and fills all of time and eternity. He is immutable, He is an unchanging God.³⁸ In fact, no improvement is possible in God.³⁹

Moral attributes. Butler did not define what he meant by moral attributes, yet from the qualities of personality which he describes

³⁷C. W. Butler, "The Sovereign Will of God," The Christian Witness, New Series LIV (March 19, 1936), 2.

³⁸C. W. Butler, "The Sovereign Will of God," The Christian Witness, New Series LIV (March 19, 1936), 1. Butler, "It is Written," ibid., New Series LXII (February 15, 1945), 1. Butler, "Great Doctrinal Truths," The Herald, LXVI (April 6, 1955), 2. Butler, "In the Beginning God," ibid., LXIX (February 11, 1959), 2.

³⁹C. W. Butler, "Enduring Values," The Christian Witness, New Series LVI (April 28, 1938), 1.

under moral attributes, it can be seen that he referred to those qualities of personality which affect the relationships between individuals.

Butler said that the infinity of God is not limited to His natural attributes but includes His moral attributes as well. He stated that the chief moral attribute of God is freedom. He is the self-determined one. He is absolutely free in the exercise of His sovereign will, He merely speaks and it is done. His works declare His freedom and His love of freedom. Every fish, every seed, every beast and every winged bird, each in its respective sphere, is fitted perfectly to its God-ordered environment, but each is free, gloriously free. These types of freedom have to do with creaturely activity but the same principle is declared to be God's purpose in the creation of man. Thus, God is free and He has created other things to enjoy freedom also.⁴⁰

Butler held that the chief moral attribute of God is freedom yet the greatest fact known about His moral attributes is that He is holy. He is infinite in holiness. Holiness, according to Butler, is a generic moral term. It includes all the moral principles and qualities known to man. Because God is holy, He is righteous, just, truth and love. Mercy and grace flow from the perfection of His moral nature. God is a moral personality. Since God is holy, He is righteous; His

⁴⁰C. W. Butler, "God's Evancipation Proclamation," The Christian Witness, New Series LVII (March 23, 1939), 1. Butler, "God is Sovereign," ibid., New Series LX (December 3, 1942), 1. Butler, "It is Written," ibid., New Series LXII (February 15, 1945), 1. Butler, "Great Doctrinal Truths," The Herald, LXVI (April 6, 1955), 2.

righteousness is His holiness in His relationship to other moral beings. Since He is absolute in holiness, He is just; His justice is perfect, as white as His mercy and truth. Since God is holy, He is love but His love is in perfect balance with His justice and His righteousness. The moral quality of holiness permeates all that God is and all that He does. Since He is absolute in His perfection, He must manifest these in all of His works.⁴¹

Butler believed that holiness was not just an attribute of God but His very nature, the totality of His being. Therefore, the holiness of God has been further dealt with under the Nature of God. Nevertheless, it was necessary to show its relation to the moral attributes first.

III. THE NATURE OF GOD

Butler held, quite emphatically, that holiness was not just one of several moral attributes with God but that His very nature was infinite holiness. The other moral attributes or qualities of personality spring from the fact that God is holy. God is righteous, just, love, light, merciful and gracious because He is holy.

Butler stated that "the greatest and best fact we know about God

⁴¹Theodore W. Engstrom (ed.), Victorious and Fruitful Living (Grand Rapids, Michigan: Zondervan Publishing House, 1942), p. 9. C. W. Butler, "It is Written," The Christian Witness, New Series LXIII (February 15, 1945), 1. Butler, "The True and Living God," Pentecostal Herald, LIX (September 3, 1947), 3. Butler, "Great Doctrinal Truths," The Herald, LXVI (April 6, 1955), 2. Butler, "In the Beginning God," ibid., LXIX (February 11, 1959), 2.

is that He is holy."⁴² Butler said that God's holiness was uncreated, self-existent and eternal. God's holiness, according to Butler, is absolute, therefore, He must be holy in all of His purposes, attitudes, activities, will and works. In the revealing of this fact to man, Butler believed that now man had One whom he could truly worship. He maintained that to think of God's holiness in a lesser light would mar His character and rob Him of supreme fitness as a proper object of worship. God's perfection in holiness makes Him free from mistakes and from sin. There can be no difference between His character and His conduct. This holiness of God involves and includes the perfect moral balance of the total of all that He is.⁴³

From his study of natural revelation, Butler concluded that God was good, yea very good. But it was from his study of special revelation and the discovery of the fact that God is holy that Butler concluded that God is absolutely good.⁴⁴ Thus, God as absolutely holy is absolutely good because "all moral perfection is inherent in this perfect quality of holiness."⁴⁵

⁴²C. W. Butler, "His Holiness," The Christian Witness, New Series LI (August 12, 1943), 1.

⁴³Ibid. Butler, "True Holiness," ibid., LXIII (February 7, 1946), 1.

⁴⁴C. W. Butler, "The Supreme Purpose of Redemption," The Christian Witness, New Series LIX (September 11, 1941), 1, 8.

⁴⁵C. W. Butler, "God's Standard," The Herald, LXIII (February 6, 1952), 3.

The moral attributes of God spring from the fact that He is holy. Righteousness, justice, mercy, truth and love are inherent qualities of His holiness, but holiness finds its highest definition in the fact that "God is love." God's love is an infinite love just as His holiness is an infinite holiness.⁴⁶ Thus, His holiness is original and underived, it is absolute in quality and in extent. It permeates all that He is, so that in Him there is complete moral perfection. He is glorious in holiness.⁴⁷ Butler referred to the term holiness as a beautiful moral term.

It is so inclusive of all that is good that the Scriptures identify this term with the moral quality of deity; thus the phrase, "the Holy One of Israel," becomes one of the loftiest expressions of the quality of the moral excellence of God Himself.⁴⁸

Butler held that the source of all holiness is God's own holiness. There was and can be only one grade of holiness whether in man or unfallen angels. God's own character is the source of this holiness as well as the standard by which moral values are judged. Butler held that moral beings may possess different quantities but the quality must be the same if it is true holiness.⁴⁹

⁴⁶C. W. Butler, "I Know in Part," The Christian Witness, New Series LIX (June 1, 1942), 10. Butler, "True Holiness," Pentecostal Herald, LIX (April 30, 1947), 3.

⁴⁷C. W. Butler, "His Holiness," Pentecostal Herald, LX (August 4, 1948), 3.

⁴⁸Engstrom, loc. cit.

⁴⁹C. W. Butler, "True Holiness," The Christian Witness, New Series LXIII (February 7, 1946), 2. Butler, "His Holiness," Pentecostal

Butler said that God must act in a holy manner in everything He does. As an example of what is meant, Butler said that man when he was created had to be created holy. Butler believed very strongly that this was true. He also held that in redemption man must be restored to this high moral possession. He believed that a lesser moral objective could not have motivated God to create or redeem.⁵⁰

Holiness, for Butler, is the moral quality which makes God the God that He is. It also gives a true sense of direction to all intelligent self-directing beings. Holiness gives God and all moral beings the standard for measuring moral values.⁵¹ This holiness is God's own eternal uncreated possession.⁵²

It was stated earlier that Butler believed that man is a rational being and he seeks a cause for every effect. When man finds a cause great enough to explain all effects, he then has mental anchorage.

Herald, LX (August 4, 1948), 3. Butler, "God's Standard," The Herald, LXIII (February 6, 1952), 3. Butler, "Observations," ibid., LXIX (July 9, 1958), 2, 15.

⁵⁰C. W. Butler, "A Heart Talk on Holiness," The Herald, LXV (February 3, 1954), 3.

⁵¹C. W. Butler, "Holiness," The Christian Witness, New Series LVI (March 10, 1938), 8. Butler, "His Holiness," ibid., New Series LI (August 12, 1943), 1. Butler, "True Holiness," ibid., New Series LXIII (February 7, 1946), 1. Butler, "True Holiness," Pentecostal Herald, LIX (April 30, 1947), 3. Butler, "God's Standard," The Herald, LXIII (February 6, 1952), 3. Butler, "A Heart Talk on Holiness," ibid., LXV (February 3, 1954), 3. Butler, "Observations," ibid., LXIX (July 9, 1958), 2.

⁵²C. W. Butler, "A Heart Talk on Holiness," The Herald, LXV (February 3, 1954), 3.

Butler found that this First Cause was the uncreated eternal Sovereign of the universe. Butler believed that man is also a moral being and that as such he seeks one who is great enough for him to worship and adore. In natural revelation Butler found one who was great in power, knowledge, love and goodness. However, the one whom Butler found only in natural revelation was one whom man would fear and stand in awe of but could not truly worship Him because he couldn't be sure that He wouldn't use His power for an ill effect. But, when in the study of special revelation man finds that God is holy, he then has one whom he can truly worship for he knows that this one will not use His powers for ill effects. Man's moral being has found anchorage in this one. Worship is the highest exercise of the whole man and before a holy God man can truly worship. This infinite holiness of God furnishes all moral beings an object and being capable and worthy of their utter abandonment to His will and supreme love and worship of His person. Man's moral nature seeks love and righteousness; in a holy God this is found. Thus, man's moral nature can be satisfied.⁵³

IV. SUMMARY

This chapter presented Butler's doctrine of God. His position

⁵³C. W. Butler, "Be Ye Holy, For I Am Holy," The Christian Witness, New Series LIV (September 24, 1936), 1. Butler, "A Right Approach to the Word of God," ibid., New Series LXIV (May 16, 1946), 1. Butler, "The True and Living God," Pentecostal Herald, LIX (September 3, 1947), 3. Butler, "God's Standard," The Herald, LXIII (February 6, 1952), 3. Butler, "Great Doctrinal Truths," ibid., LXVI (April 6, 1955), 2.

concerning revelation was also presented in this chapter to serve as a basis from which Butler developed his doctrine of God. Butler held that natural revelation was inadequate for God to reveal His great moral objectives. Special revelation revealed in a fuller way the things found in natural revelation but added the great fact that God is holy. Butler found that God is a person; that He exists as a trinity; that there are two phases to the will of God, a sovereign aspect and a redemptive aspect; and that He is limited by His own moral perfections and the choices of other moral beings. Butler recognized the natural attributes of God. But that which spoke the loudest to him from the pages of special revelation was the fact that God is holy. For Butler, this was not just a moral attribute but was God's very nature. The fact that God's nature is that of absolute holiness was the truth which shone for him above the splendor of any other truth.

THE HOLINESS OF GOD MANIFEST IN CREATION

CHAPTER III

THE HOLINESS OF GOD MANIFEST IN CREATION

The purpose of this chapter was to present the manner in which Butler saw the holiness of God manifested in creation. It has been an attempt to examine the moral quality of the two orders of moral beings as they came from the hand of God. In the preceding chapter, it was noted that God must act in a holy manner in everything that He does. The purpose of this chapter was to see if He did and how He did.

I. ANGELS

Butler believed that the Bible gave hints of a creation prior to the one known to man today. He believed that Genesis 1:1 told of that creation. He saw in Scripture that there is an order of moral beings called angels. Reasoning from Scripture, he believed that this order of moral beings was placed on the newly created universe. These spirit beings were created holy by a holy God. Since they were moral beings they needed to pass a period of probation to receive a fixed and final character. In this way, they could be referred to as holy angels, not just because God had made them so, but they were so by their own moral choice. Scripture which gave him support for his reasoning was Isaiah 14:13, 14. For one to possess moral character, he must be capacitated with both the possibility for good and holiness and with the possibility for sin and evil. This early creation was ruled over by Lucifer, the highest flaming angelic intelligence that God created.

Butler believed that he saw the origin of sin and the devil in Isaiah 14:13, 14. Some of the angels followed Lucifer and their characters became fixed in rebellion against God. But out of this creation, God received myraid hosts of holy angels who will serve Him forever. The angels who passed their probation and received their fixed character will retain this relationship forever. With the fall of Lucifer, the universe was plunged into a chaotic condition by the judgment of God.¹

II. MAN

Beginning with Genesis 1:2 Butler felt that it is revealed to man how God brought order out of the chaos. He began this organizing with the objective of providing a home for a new order of moral beings. God proceeded in an orderly manner from the simple to the complex. In this record is the origin of species. God created vegetable life first, then animal life. It is affirmed again and again "whose seed is in itself" and that it brought forth "after its kind." Butler maintained that this order was established for all time and will not be changed as long as the world stands.² God proceeded along this line towards

¹C. W. Butler, "The Supreme Purpose of Redemption," The Christian Witness, New Series LX (January 9, 1930), 1, 2. Butler, "Faith-Building Messages," ibid., New Series LXVII (February 1, 1940), 1, 2, 4. Butler, "Faith-Building Messages," ibid., New Series LXVII (February 22, 1940), 8. Butler, "The Supreme Purpose of Redemption," ibid., New Series LIX (September 11, 1941), 1. Butler, "The Truth Series," ibid., New Series LX (July 9, 1942), 1. Butler, "The Dream of a New World," ibid., New Series LXIII (January 17, 1946), 2.

²C. W. Butler, "Faith-Building Messages," The Christian Witness, New Series LXVII (February 8, 1940), 1.

the final act of His creation.

One is not to suppose that everything is recorded in the opening chapters of Genesis. Butler admonished his readers not to suppose that they happened as fast as one can read them. After all, the first ten chapters of Genesis is the only record man has of two thousand years of human existence.³

As God approached the creation of man, Butler likened the purpose of God to a cabinet meeting where the creation of the new order of moral beings was planned. Man, therefore, was created by the will of God and according to divine plan. Man was capacitated to know, to honor and to glorify his maker and to share in His felicity and glory.⁴ Thus, His creation was very good.

In considering the statement of Genesis 1:26, 27 that man was made in the image and likeness of God, Butler asked and answered the question, "Wherein does this image lie?" God is not a corporal being with a body form and parts. Therefore, the image of God is not in man's physical makeup. God did make man's physical body. He made it from the dust of the ground, but He changed this dust into a temple. The real image of God, then, consisted not of a physical likeness to God but in a rational, self-conscious, free being. But above all, he was a holy being, perfect and sound. Thus, the whole moral nature of man was

³C. W. Butler, "The Supreme Purpose of Redemption," The Christian Witness, New Series LX (January 9, 1930), 2.

⁴C. W. Butler, "Man's Place in . . . God's Plan," The Herald, LXVI (May 4, 1955), 2.

positively good with no mixture of evil. Butler quoted Dr. Hannah when he said that the image of God consisted in "light in the understanding, rectitude in the will, and sanctity in the purposes and affections."⁵

Butler further believed that man in his original state was an expression of divine perfection. He was perfect physically; the longevity of life is an illustration of this. Man had perfect mental powers, his intelligence was unclouded, he had unimpaired will power, he had freedom.⁶

The flesh which man possesses differs from birds, fish and beasts. Therefore, Butler believed man ought not to be classified as an animal. He has a physical temple but he was made only a little lower than the angels. Butler felt that the sense in which this was true was the fact that he had a body capable of dissolution whereas angels are spirit beings with no material body whatever. This material body is man's house but the inhabitant is the real responsible moral agent.⁷ Thus, God created responsible beings. Man was lifted from the level of irresponsible existence of nature to that of personality. This personality was made responsible and moral by possessing intellect,

⁵C. W. Butler, "The Supreme Purpose of Redemption," The Christian Witness, New Series LX (January 9, 1930), 2.

⁶C. W. Butler, "The Supreme Purpose of Redemption," The Christian Witness, New Series LIX (September 11, 1941), 1, 8. Butler, "It is Written," ibid., New Series LXII (February 15, 1945), 1. Butler, "Man's Place in . . . God's Plan," The Herald, LXVI (May 4, 1955), 2.

⁷C. W. Butler, "The Supreme Purpose of Redemption," The Christian Witness, New Series LX (January 9, 1930), 2.

sensibility and will.⁸

Butler held that God created a being which could walk in moral harmony with Himself, man was made for harmony with his Creator. Thus, of necessity, he would have to be a moral being. He was created a son of God, this involved filial relationship.⁹ God made man capable of fellowship with Himself: (1) in the realm of knowledge, (2) in the realm of free choice, and (3) in the realm of unfathomable love. He built a being He could respect and pity, one who could trace his Maker in His works and appreciate these.¹⁰

Butler saw that man, as a created being, has dependent life, God alone is self-existent.¹¹ Man was to have dominion in the realm of God's universe. This is an exalted position for the universe was created for him. Thus, man is the crowning work of God's creation and the central fact of his personality is the moral constitution of his nature.¹²

Since God is holy, Butler believed that He was holy in all of His

⁸C. W. Butler, "The Commands of God," Pentecostal Herald, LXII (April 4, 1951), 3.

⁹C. W. Butler, "Man's Nature and His Recovery Through the Atonement of Christ," The Herald, LXVI (December 7, 1955), 2. Butler, "A Study in Thessalonians," ibid., LXIX (April 8, 1959), 2.

¹⁰C. W. Butler, "Bible Perfection," The Christian Witness, New Series LXII (September 7, 1944), 1, 2.

¹¹C. W. Butler, "Restraints and Controls," Pentecostal Herald, LXI (August 2, 1950), 3.

¹²C. W. Butler, "Truth Series," The Christian Witness, New Series LXI (March 18, 1943), 1.

works and activities. This included His creation of man. Man bore the image of his Creator in the fact of spirit personality, but he also bore the image of his Creator in the moral quality of that personality. There was no taint of sin or admixture of anything that would spoil his purity, as he came from the hand of the Creator. God's own holiness was the prototype of man's original holiness. The quality was the same; the quantity was different.¹³ The holiness which man possessed at creation was like God's, yet man had no say about this holiness with which he was created. He, therefore, needed to be placed on probation so that with which he was created could be his by choice. The holiness he possessed was such that he had the power to remain holy. Adam was endowed with power and responsibility to make that holiness his own by moral choices in cooperation with the will of His Creator. He also had the power to do otherwise. Butler maintained that holiness in its content and relationship has the power for self-preservation.¹⁴

Since men are moral beings, they are also responsible beings and have obligations to meet. God has limited Himself by respecting the choices of moral beings. If He made men do right they no longer would

¹³C. W. Butler, "His Holiness," The Christian Witness, New Series LI (August 12, 1943), 1. Butler, "True Holiness," ibid., New Series LXIII (February 7, 1946), 1, 2. Butler, "Observations," The Herald LXIX (July 9, 1958), 2, 15.

¹⁴C. W. Butler, "The Supreme Purpose of Redemption," The Christian Witness, New Series LIX (September 18, 1941), 8. Butler, "Holiness," ibid., New Series LIX (May 22, 1941), 1. Butler, "It is Written," ibid., New Series LXIII (March 8, 1941), 1.

be moral beings.¹⁵ God honors the choice of man's will. Butler defined will as "the self in its appraising, organizing, and creative ability."¹⁶ Since man is a moral being, he has capacities to know and enjoy God and to be holy, but he also has the capacity for the opposite. These capacities are such an essential part of human personality that they are never destroyed either by holiness or sin. Individuals may rise to the heights or sink to the depths but the succeeding generation has these racial capacities and potentialities which remain unchanged. Sin may mar, hurt and darken these capacities but it does not destroy them. There remains throughout man's probationary period the capacity to respond to God and once again possess the character of holiness and the knowledge and love of God. Holiness does not exempt man from temptation and sin. Man's choice determines his character and conduct.¹⁷

In the Sermon on the Mount, Jesus restored the standard to the original paradise level. He raised the standard in human relations to their highest possible level when He commanded men to love their enemies.

¹⁵C. W. Butler, "Mountain-peak Experiences," The Christian Witness, New Series LXIII (August 9, 1945), 2. Butler, "Man's Nature and His Recovery Through the Atonement of Christ," The Herald, LXVI (December 7, 1955), 2. Butler, "God's Will, Direct and Permissive, A Study of Cause and Effect," ibid., LXVII (February 1, 1956), 2.

¹⁶C. W. Butler, "The Dignity of the Human Will," The Christian Witness, New Series LI (July 27, 1933), 1.

¹⁷C. W. Butler, "The Christian Philosophy of Life or the True Estimate of Human Worth," The Christian Witness, New Series LIV (August 13, 1936), 1. Butler, "Enduring Values," ibid., New Series LVI (April 28, 1938), 1. Butler, "The Superlative in Scripture," ibid., New Series LVII (August 3, 1939), 1. Butler, "The Top of Creation," The Herald, LXVIII (December 4, 1957), 2.

This capacity to be like God in loving one's enemies argues strongly for the divine origin of man. It also awakens in him the possibilities of a glorious future. "This soul capacity speaks eloquently of the image and likeness of God in which we were created."¹⁸

Creating man a moral being, according to Butler, necessitated that he have the power of contrary choice. God did create man a morally responsible being with the possibility of but not the necessity of sin. Man has the freedom of power to sin but not the moral right to do so. This very fact, of the power of choice, gives depth of quality to his right relationship with God. This ethical harmony which is to be maintained between God and man is enhanced by the fact that it is maintained by the choice of a being who can choose the opposite. This fact makes possible moral quality of character in man's personality.¹⁹ This capacity for contrary choice is amoral.²⁰

Butler argued that man is one of the highest forms of evidence for the truth of God Himself. One of the strongest arguments for the unity and divinity of the origin of the race is that they are one physiologically and psychologically.²¹

¹⁸C. W. Butler, "The Superlative in Scripture," The Christian Witness, New Series LVII (August 3, 1939), 1.

¹⁹C. W. Butler, "A Sovereign God and His Chosen Leaders," The Christian Witness, New Series LXII (August 10, 1944), 1. Butler, "It is Written," ibid., New Series LXIII (March 1, 1945), 1. Butler, "A Right Approach to the Word of God," ibid., New Series LXIV (May 16, 1946), 1.

²⁰C. W. Butler, "The Challenge of Holiness Education," The Christian Witness, New Series LV (September 30, 1937), 1.

As a rational being man seeks a cause for every effect. He has intellectual powers possessing capacity to acquire knowledge and to retain this knowledge. He can classify this, building great systems of thought, both scientific and philosophical. Man is not to be led about by his impulses but he is to control these impulses on the basis of rational thought and the measuring of moral consequences.²²

Man, as a moral being, can never rid himself of the sense of personal accountability for his conduct. Even fallen man has not been able to leave his conscience behind. This racial inheritance of a moral responsibility is present in the lowest pagan as well as the most highly civilized person. This persistent sense of moral accountability is a strong argument for the moral character of the Creator. "There is an abiding sense of "ought" and "ought not" in relation to man's conduct, which is omnipresent in the consciousness of the race."²³

Man, as a religious being, was created with soul capacities which reach their height in the act of worship. He has the capacity for God and holiness.²⁴ He needs One whom he can worship which results in his own

²¹C. W. Butler, "Enduring Values," The Christian Witness, New Series LVI (April 28, 1938), 1. Butler, "Great Doctrinal Truths," The Herald, LXVI (April 6, 1955), 2.

²²C. W. Butler, "Law, A Friend of Righteousness," The Christian Witness, New Series LV (August 19, 1937), 1. Butler, "The Challenge of Holiness Education," ibid., New Series LV (September 30, 1937), 1. Butler, "Holiness," ibid., New Series LIX (May 15, 1941), 1.

²³C. W. Butler, "Holiness," The Christian Witness, New Series LIX (May 15, 1941), 8.

²⁴Ibid. Butler, "The Challenge of Holiness Education," ibid., New Series LV (September 30, 1937), 1.

uplift and betterment.²⁵

Butler held that man has an affectual nature capable of love with the mind, the will and the heart combined in a unity of personality.²⁶

Butler believed that man was a trichotomist. He is a soul, he has a body and he has a spirit. The physical self is that by which man is earth conscious. Soulfully, man is self-conscious.²⁷

Butler maintained that man is of extreme value of God. This was shown to him not so much by man's original creation but by the amount God invested for his redemption. When God put a soul in the balance and all the wealth of the world on the other side, He said the soul was of more value.²⁸ God made the highest investment of which He was capable of making when He redeemed man. God sees man from the standpoint of his possibilities realized in the realm of moral and spiritual perfection.²⁹

III. SUMMARY

This chapter presented Butler's position concerning the original

²⁵C. W. Butler, "Faith-Building Messages," The Christian Witness, New Series LXVII (January 4, 1940), 2.

²⁶C. W. Butler, "Man's Nature and His Recovery Through the Atonement of Christ," The Christian Witness, New Series LXVI (December 7, 1955), 2.

²⁷C. W. Butler, "Deepening Our Spiritual Life," The Christian Witness, New Series LVI (December 1, 1938), 1. Butler, "Man's Place in . . . God's Plan," The Herald, LXVI (May 4, 1955), 2.

²⁸C. W. Butler, "Truth Series," The Christian Witness, New Series LXI (March 25, 1943), 1.

²⁹C. W. Butler, "The Christian Philosophy of Life or the True

moral quality of created responsible beings. Butler held that angels, the first order of created morally responsible beings, were created holy by a holy God. He, also, held that man, the second order of created morally responsible beings, was created holy by a holy God. Both groups had the power to retain this created holiness or to choose something else. This kept them morally responsible free beings.

THE HOLINESS OF GOD LOST IN MAN

CHAPTER IV

THE HOLINESS OF GOD LOST IN MAN

The problem of this chapter was to present Butler's position as to how morally responsible beings lost their original holiness. The procedure was the same as has been used in the two previous chapters, Butler's writings were examined to determine his theology and then this has been arranged in a systematic form which would have been characteristic of Butler's thinking.

I. ORIGIN OF EVIL

Butler believed that sin and the devil originated within God's first creation of morally responsible beings. They all had been made holy and had the power to stay holy. Lucifer, the highest angel God created, used his freedom and conceived the idea of usurping God's place. Butler found evidence for this in Isaiah 14: 12-14. Five times Lucifer said, "I will." God did not create the devil; he became such by the misuse of his freedom. Butler conjectured that Lucifer probably tried to carry out his plan but was struck by the omnipotent judgment of God and was changed from an angel of light to God's enemy. A group of angels joined Lucifer's rebellion and they too fell from their original state.¹ This was how sin began.

¹C. W. Butler, "Faith-Building Messages," The Christian Witness, New Series LXVII (February 1, 1940), 2, 4. Butler, "The Supreme Purpose of Redemption," ibid., New Series LIX (September 25, 1941), 1. Butler,

Butler went on to show a parallelism in the case of man. Man, too, is and was a morally free responsible being; he, too, was created holy, but sin entered by an act of self-will and holiness was lost. No logical argument can be set forth, which contains the truth, to explain why men sin.² The rugged fact of sin's existence is everywhere. Yet, sin cannot be associated with the human body for then God would have been its creator. Since He is holy without any taint, He could not make an unholy being. Sin is not a physical entity.³

Butler insisted that sin must be related to the moral capacity of man.⁴ It is in this capacity that Butler found it impossible for sin to originate in mankind. It was the exerting of self-will against God's will which constituted the fall of man.⁵ Adam failed without having existed in a previous state of sin. A natural and pure desire was used by Satan to tempt Adam. He had the power to remain holy but he made the wrong choice and this involved a break with God. This

"The Commands of God," Pentecostal Herald, LXII (April 4, 1951), 3.
Butler, "The Fact and Origin of Sin," The Herald, LXVI (August 3, 1955), 2.

²C. W. Butler, "Holiness Desirable," The Christian Witness, New Series LIII (May 9, 1935), 1.

³C. W. Butler, "The Promise of Cleansing," The Christian Witness, New Series LXII (November 30, 1944), 1. Butler, "A United Heart," ibid., New Series LI (July 20, 1933), 1.

⁴C. W. Butler, "The Sufferings of Christ," The Christian Witness, New Series LXI (April 15, 1943), 1, 2.

⁵C. W. Butler, "The Tragedy of the Present Drift in the Religious World," The Christian Witness, New Series LVII (April 6, 1939), 8, 9.

introduced sin into God's new order of moral beings. When man exerted self-will against God's will, sin made him a rebel and related him to the devil as his child. Thus, man fell from his original state of holiness and harmony with God by an act of rebellion.⁶

Butler believed that if Adam had successfully met this test his character would have been fixed in holiness and he would never have fallen. He reasoned from the fact that the second Adam met similar tests to the ones which the first Adam faced but He was victorious.⁷ Thus, it was not necessary for man to have sinned.

Butler maintained that man in his created state was without sin, in his natural state he is a fallen corrupt being. Sin is self-will in contrast to God's will, it is the image of the devil. Self-will is the permeating principle of all sin. Sin resides in the heart of man. The term heart, according to Butler, refers to the whole inner man; reason volition and emotions. Sin blasts, perverts, brings ruin and defeat but it can never destroy the capacity in man to know God. It is not the enormity of the act which determines quality but it is the motive back of the act. In Adam and Eve's situation unbelief, ingratitude and rebellion were the principles involved in the act they committed.⁸

⁶C. W. Butler, "Faith-Building Messages," The Christian Witness, New Series LXVII (February 8, 1940), 1, 2. Butler, "The Supreme Purpose of Redemption," ibid., New Series LIX (September 25, 1941), 1. Butler, "The Commands of God," Pentecostal Herald, LXII (April 4, 1951), 3. Butler, "The Fact and Origin of Sin," The Herald, LXVI (August 3, 1955), 2. Butler, "A Study in Thessalonians," ibid., LXIX (April 8, 1959), 2.

⁷C. W. Butler, "The Supreme Purpose of Redemption," The Christian Witness, New Series LIX (September 25, 1941), 1.

Butler said that the final and perfect definition of sin is, "whatever is not of faith is sin."⁹ These statements constitute the essence of Butler's explanation for the fall of man.

II. ORIGINAL SIN AND TOTAL DEPRAVITY

Butler observed that all men are born into this world with an element of perverseness in them and an enfeeblement of natural powers to resist evil. They have a bias toward evil which is race wide.¹⁰ This is an effect of the fall of man and is inherited from Adam. Thus, it is a racial characteristic and springs from racial heredity. Butler said that theologians have called this original sin and total depravity. Total depravity does not mean that man is as bad as he is capable of being but it does mean that sin has pervaded and affected his entire selfhood. No part of man's personality is pure. It is total in that it influences every part of man's selfhood and that there is no righteousness in man. Thus, there is nothing he can present to God for His

⁸C. W. Butler, "Faith-Building Messages," The Christian Witness, New Series LXVII (February 15, 1940), 1. Butler, "Holiness," ibid., New Series LIX (May 22, 1941), 1. Butler, "Truth Series," ibid., New Series LXI (April 1, 1943), 2. Butler, "So Shall My Word Be," ibid., New Series LI (August 26, 1943), 1. Butler, "God's Remedy for the Heart," Pentecostal Herald, LXI (March 1, 1950), 3. Butler, "The Commands of God," ibid., LXII (April 4, 1951), 3.

⁹C. W. Butler, "The Single Standard Life," The Christian Witness, New Series LII (July 26, 1934), 1, 8. Butler, "Diamonds of Truth," Pentecostal Herald, LXI (January 5, 1949), 3, 7. Butler, "Holiness," The Herald, LXIX (June 4, 1948), 2.

¹⁰C. W. Butler, "A United Heart," The Christian Witness, New Series LI (July 13, 1933), 1. Butler, "Holiness," ibid., New Series LIV (October 15, 1936), 1.

acceptance.¹¹

Butler did not identify depravity with humanity. He recognized that the dividing line is a delicate one but the two are different and distinct.¹² This condition of depravity is not a part of man's real selfhood.¹³ This is what Butler had in mind when he spoke of original sin.

III. TWOFOLD NATURE OF SIN

Butler believed that sin was of a twofold nature. It is both an act and a state. As an act, sin involves the use of the will and the perversion of some of man's powers in terms of disobedience to the known will of God. The reprehensibility of this is seen in that men commit these acts of sin by intention. They sin when they are wide awake.¹⁴ Sin incurs guilt which can be done away only by pardon.

Butler went on to say that sin is also a condition affecting the whole nature of man. It is like a fever in the physical body, and this

¹¹C. W. Butler, "Sin in Our Nature," The Christian Witness, New Series LXVII (November 23, 1939), 1. Butler, "The Truth Series," ibid., New Series LX (September 17, 1942), 8. Butler, "The Truth Series," ibid., New Series LX (September 24, 1942), 1, 12. Butler, "Walk Worthy of God," ibid., New Series LX (January 21, 1943), 1, 12. Butler, "Meditations on Romans 7 and 8," ibid., New Series LXI (July 8, 1943), 1.

¹²C. W. Butler, "The Spirit Also Helpeth Our Infirmities," The Christian Witness, New Series LXII (May 11, 1944), 1, 2.

¹³C. W. Butler, "Sin in Our Heart," The Christian Witness, New Series LXVII (November 23, 1939), 1.

¹⁴C. W. Butler, "Be Ye Holy, For I am Holy," The Christian Witness, New Series LIV (September 24, 1936), 1. Butler, "Tampering with the Label,"

condition remains in the hearts of those who are converted. He went on to say that sin was a moral malady, a corruption of nature which affects all of man's moral nature. He saw that it was a condition never referred to in the plural but only in the singular in the Scripture.¹⁵ Further, this perversion is within everyone of Adam's race,¹⁶ although, "as a state, it does not incur guilt."¹⁷ Its remedy requires a deeper work than pardon. It needs cleansing.¹⁸ This condition of sin is an active, unlawful something. The permanent control of this principle is impossible. It is a moral poison in man's disposition.¹⁹ Butler indicated that this is not the human body but the fleshly, worldly, carnal spirit dwelling in man.²⁰

Two portions of Scripture illustrated this for Butler. The first

ibid., New Series LXI (April 29, 1943), 1. Butler, "Meditations on Romans 7 and 8," ibid., New Series LXI (July 1, 1943), 2. Butler, "The Zones of Salvation," Pentecostal Herald, LXI (September 6, 1950), 3. Butler, "The Fact and Origin of Sin," The Herald, LXVI (August 3, 1955), 2.

¹⁵C. W. Butler, "The Double Nature of Sin," Pentecostal Herald, LXI (February 2, 1949), 3.

¹⁶C. W. Butler, "Holiness," The Christian Witness, New Series LIV (June 9, 1938), 1.

¹⁷C. W. Butler, "Sound Doctrine," The Christian Witness, New Series LVI (June 9, 1938), 1.

¹⁸C. W. Butler, "There is a Reason Why," The Herald, LXV (November 3, 1954), 2.

¹⁹C. W. Butler, "Sin Enslaves," The Christian Witness, New Series LVII (April 20, 1939), 1. Butler, "The Fact and Origin of Sin," The Herald, LXVI (August 3, 1955), 2.

²⁰C. W. Butler, "Sound Doctrine," The Christian Witness, New Series LVI (June 9, 1938), 1.

was found in the decalogue. There is the command, "Thou shalt not steal." If sin was only an act, reasoned Butler, this commandment would have been sufficient. But there is a further command, "Thou shalt not covet." This command taught that sin was a state and condition of the heart as well as an act. Stealing can be forgiven, covetousness needs cleansing.²¹

The clearest portion of Scripture concerning this condition of sin for Butler was Romans 7. Here it is designated as "sin that dwelleth in me," "evil that is present with me" and "the law of sin." It is located not in a specific act but in the condition of man's natural selfhood, "It is in my members."²²

IV. PENALTY AND EFFECTS OF SIN

Butler said that the penalty for sin is death, which is three-fold in nature. First, it was death in the spirit department of man's nature. This is the reason for the imperative, "Ye must be born again." Second, it was the death sentence for the physical body. Third, it was eternal death. This meant final separation from God. This latter death is also known as the second death.²³

²¹C. W. Butler, "Be Ye Holy, For I am Holy," The Christian Witness, New Series LIV (September 24, 1936), 1.

²²C. W. Butler, "Meditations on Romans 7 and 8," The Christian Witness, New Series LXI (July 1, 1943), 2.

²³C. W. Butler, "Eternal Life," The Herald, LXIII (April 2, 1952), 3. Butler, "Man's Place in . . . God's Plan," ibid., LXVI (May 4, 1955), 2.

Other effects of sin which Butler listed are as follows: the loss of man's freedom; man's enslavement; the interruption of the moral harmony in the universe, creature was arrayed against Creator; the casting of rebel angels out of heaven and rebel man out of Paradise; it kindled the flames of an eternal hell; and it brought the curse of God on the earth.²⁴

Butler said that the sin unto death is the rejection of the sacrifice of Christ.²⁵

V. SUMMARY

This chapter dealt with the loss of holiness both by angels and by men as Butler understood it. Lucifer lost his original position when he displaced God's will with self-will. Man lost his position in holiness when he did likewise. Both angels and men were morally free responsible beings. They were capable of obeying God or of making a contrary choice. Whatever choice they made, they were responsible for it. Choosing self's way constituted sin and the fall. Consequently, every man is born into this world in a polluted moral condition. It is a racial heritage and it is total in that it affects the whole of

²⁴C. W. Butler, "Holiness Desirable," The Christian Witness, New Series LIII (May 9, 1935), 1. Butler, "God's Emancipation Proclamation," ibid., New Series LVII (March 23, 1939), 1.

²⁵C. W. Butler, "Faith vs. the Work and Witness of the Spirit," The Christian Witness, New Series L (March 17, 1932), 2.

man's being. It is a twofold entity in that is both an act and a state.

The penalty for sin was a threefold death.

THE HOLINESS OF GOD MANIFESTED AND PROVIDED BY REDEMPTION

CHAPTER V

THE HOLINESS OF GOD MANIFESTED AND PROVIDED BY REDEMPTION

In the preceding chapters it has been shown that, according to Butler's theology, God is a holy being. He created morally responsible beings. They were created holy, the quality being the same as God's holiness. Some of the angels fell and lost this holiness; others retained this holiness by their own choosing. Man, too, fell and lost his original holiness. The purpose of this chapter was to present Butler's views as to how God can and did redeem fallen man; it deals with the divine side of salvation.

I. INTRODUCTION

One might ask, did God have a plan whereby angels could be redeemed? Although he admitted that the element of conjecture entered into his reasoning, Butler gave three reasons why God had not made such provision. First, Butler believed each angel was an original creation. Since they were thus created, it was possible that a sacrifice for each angel would have been necessary. Second, their fall was of such a nature that they were immediately fixed in their attitude of rebellion and sin. Finally, the answer which Butler felt best answered the question was that angels were spirit beings and thus there was no sacrifice in the realm of spirit personality which could atone for their fall.¹

¹C. W. Butler, "Faith-Building Messages," The Christian Witness,

Before the matter of the recovery program was considered, it was necessary to deal with a few related matters which were fundamental to Butler's thinking. First, man was not worthy of redemption, but he was so endowed by his Creator that he was worth redeeming.² Second, man had been created holy, but he had fallen. Only the complete moral recovery of man was an objective great enough for an infinite God to make the supreme sacrifice which He invested in the provision for man's redemption.³

Butler believed that the fall of man was no surprise to God. He believed that in the precreation cabinet meeting it had been duly considered. Divine justice said that if man fell he would have to be separated from the fellowship of God forever. Infinite mercy, prompted by sovereign love, pleaded for some way whereby man could be recovered if he fell. Infinite wisdom

recognizing the righteousness of God, and yet seeking to express God's infinite love, devised the plan of the grace of God, by the route of the incarnation of the Son in humiliation and unspeakable sacrifice, providing the realm of grace, within the framework of which, salvation could be provided in harmony with the holiness of God, expressing His infinite love, and releasing the exercise of His omnipotent power to redeem and renew the fallen nature of man to again bear the image and likeness of his creator.

The Son volunteered, the Father agreed, the covenant was made in the Godhead, "Mercy and truth met together, and righteousness and

New Series LXVII (February 1, 1940), 4, 8.

²C. W. Butler, "Truth Series," The Christian Witness, New Series LXI (April 1, 1943), 1, 2.

³C. W. Butler, "Holiness," The Christian Witness, New Series LIX (May 22, 1941), 1.

peace kissed each other."

In view of this provision made before the foundation of the world, God was ready after the fall of man to announce the central fact of the plan when in Genesis 3:15 he announced the fact that "the seed of woman should bruise the serpent's head."⁴

With these matters in mind, it was possible to consider the person and work of Christ and the person and work of the Holy Spirit.

II. THE DOCTRINE OF CHRIST

Christology--Scriptural Approach

In setting forth his Christology, Butler made considerable use of Scriptural teaching. Christ's coming was foretold in the Old Testament, Genesis 3:15 and Isaiah 7:14. Butler saw these New Testament predictions of His Coming: Mathew 1:18; Luke 1:26, 35, 46, 47, 68-75. Butler maintained that He was the Christ of Old Testament prophecies, types and symbols, also that He was the Christ of the Gospels.⁵ His birth was an advent.⁶ His birth was not His origin or His beginning. He came from another sphere.⁷

Christ, according to Butler, was incomparable in the manner of

⁴C. W. Butler, "The Fact and Origin of Sin," The Herald, LXVI (August 3, 1955), 2, 15.

⁵C. W. Butler, "A True Christology," The Christian Witness, New Series LI (September 28, 1933), 1.

⁶C. W. Butler, "The Cross and the Resurrection," Pentecostal Herald, LXII (March 7, 1951), 3.

⁷C. W. Butler, "Christmas," The Christian Witness, New Series LXI (December 24, 1942), 1, 13.

His advent. The Holy Ghost came upon Mary; the most High overshadowed her. The supreme miracle of uniting Godhood and manhood took place within her womb. He became the Son, not of a man, but the Son of man racially.⁸ He was born of the virgin Mary.⁹ He was the incarnate one. His coming into this world, for Butler, stands alone from all the rest. He was God made manifest in the flesh.¹⁰

Christ lived a real human life on the level of human perfection. He lived in perfect conformity to the perfect will of God. He was without sin in His human origin.¹¹ He did not save Himself from human suffering and sorrow, which is the common lot of mankind, by any use of divine power which is denied other men.¹² His pure humanity was annointed by the Holy Ghost.¹³

He was tempted, but He met and foiled the tempter. His temptation was along lines parallel to those which the first Adam faced but He was victorious. His testing was along the lines of natural appetite,

⁸C. W. Butler, "Incomparable Christ," The Herald, LXVIII (April 3, 1957), 2.

⁹C. W. Butler, "The Messiahship of Christ," The Christian Witness, New Series LIX (March 27, 1941), 1.

¹⁰Ibid. C. W. Butler, "A Unique Event," The Christian Witness, New Series LXIII (December 20, 1945), 1.

¹¹C. W. Butler, "Incomparable Christ," The Herald, LXVIII (April 3, 1957), 2.

¹²C. W. Butler, "Easter Meditation Our Risen and Glorified Lord," The Christian Witness, New Series LXIV (April 18, 1946), 1.

¹³Ibid.

legitimate ambition and desire. These were real temptations and not a stage performance. Butler held that when Satan suggested bread, every fiber in Christ's body desired bread.¹⁴ Yet, He remained obedient, His obedience was absolute and complete. He was righteous, He did righteously. In Butler's own words,

He filled full every demand of the law both by that which He was inherently in His very nature and by the obedience which He rendered in His complete conformity to both the letter and the spirit of the entire law of God.¹⁵

Butler, in his interpretation of Scripture, maintained that Christ was made perfect through sufferings. This perfecting was not for any imperfections in His nature. It was in bringing of many sons into glory by His redemptive work.¹⁶

Christ's obedience involved death. Having conquered in life, He stepped under the curse of the law of God and became a voluntary sacrifice for the sins of the lost race. He died like a sinner in that, "He suffered the sorrows of death and the pains of hell."¹⁷ In His death, God judged and condemned sin. The warning of God is fully expressed as "He, by the Grace of God, tasted death for every man." The

¹⁴C. W. Butler, "The Supreme Purpose of Redemption," The Christian Witness, New Series LIX (September 25, 1941), 1, 8. Butler, "Our Conquering Christ," ibid., New Series LXIII (March 29, 1945), 2.

¹⁵C. W. Butler, "Our Conquering Christ," The Christian Witness, New Series LXIII (March 29, 1945), 2.

¹⁶C. W. Butler, "Bible Perfection," The Christian Witness, New Series LXII (September 28, 1944), 1.

¹⁷C. W. Butler, "Our Conquering Christ," The Christian Witness, New Series LXIII (March 29, 1945), 2.

loneliness and darkness of His work on the cross represented for Butler the loneliness and darkness of the second death.¹⁸

As victor over death, Christ came forth from the tomb. He had entered the dark domains of death and of the abode of lost men in the spirit and conquered Satan there. He came forth carrying the keys of death and hell. Butler insisted that the empty tomb seals, confirms, and makes effective His claims in life.¹⁹ He was and is the final revelation of God to man.²⁰

This constituted Butler's scriptural approach to Christology.

The Person of Christ

Deity. Butler insisted that the Christ revealed in the Bible is very God. He is the eternal Son, and there never was a time when He was not the Son of God. He had this one nature, it was perfect and complete. He was one with God from all eternity.²¹

¹⁸Ibid. Butler, "Incomparable Christ," The Herald, LXVIII (April 3, 1957), 11.

¹⁹C. W. Butler, "Our Conquering Christ," The Christian Witness, New Series LXII (March 29, 1945), 2. Butler, "Incomparable Christ," The Herald, LXVIII (April 3, 1957), 11.

²⁰C. W. Butler, "The Messiahship of Christ," The Christian Witness, New Series LIX (April 3, 1941), 1.

²¹C. W. Butler, "Christmas," The Christian Witness, New Series LIII (December 19, 1935), 1. Butler, "The Truth Series," ibid., New Series LX (August 20, 1942), 1, 13. Butler, "So Shall My Word Be," ibid., New Series LI (September 2, 1943), 1. Butler, "The Indispensable Word," Pentecostal Herald, LXI (May 3, 1950), 3. Butler, "The Incarnation and The Sacrifice," The Herald, LXVI (September 7, 1955), 2.

Humanity. Butler went on to say that while He had one perfect and complete nature for the purpose of redemption, He took another nature. He identified Himself with man racially, He became the Son of man. This was accomplished by the route of the incarnation. In the womb of Mary, He took on the nature of man, He was very man. He did not become the son of a man by natural generation, but He came into a perfect human body prepared for Him. He thus became the Son of man racially and generically.²²

Unity of person--diversity of natures. As he discussed the union of the two natures in one person, Butler began by saying that in Christ perfect Godhood and perfect manhood were united into one personality. That is, He was only one person. It was in this union that He became God's final and eternal revelation to man, for in the incarnation His essential character did not change. He remained perfect Godhood and perfect manhood. Butler did not indicate any commingling of the two natures but claimed that each remained distinct in spite of their union in the one person.

Thus, it was in the union of these two natures that He became the mediator between God and man. He became man that men might become sons

²²C. W. Butler, "Christmas," The Christian Witness, New Series LIII (December 19, 1935), 2. Butler, "The Truth Series," ibid., New Series LX (August 20, 1942), 1. Butler, "So Shall My Word Be," ibid., New Series LI (September 2, 1943), 1. Butler, "The Christ of the Eternities," Pentecostal Herald, LIX (December 3, 1947), 3. Butler, "The Indispensable Word," ibid., LXI (May 3, 1950), 3. Butler, "The Incarnation and the Sacrifice," The Herald, LXVI (September 7, 1955), 2.

of God.²³ These two natures are inseparably united, but the human nature was lifted to a glorified position in heaven.²⁴

Offices and Estates of Christ

State of humiliation. Butler saw in Scripture that when the second person of the trinity was to come into time, He laid aside the glory which He had from all eternity. This manifestation in the flesh was in self-humiliation. He took both the form and the place of a servant. He took a subordinate place in relation to the Godhead for the purpose of human redemption. The incarnation involved the miracle of the ages; the condescension, the abasement, the humiliation and the self-emptying of the glory of the eternal Son. Nevertheless, according to Butler, Christ accepted these limitations when He chose to unite Himself with the form of man.²⁵

State of exaltation. As he wrote of Christ's conquest over sin and death, Butler noted that Christ stepped under the curse of the holy

²³C. W. Butler, "Christmas," The Christian Witness, New Series LIII (December 19, 1935), 1. Butler, "The Incarnation and the Sacrifice of Christ," The Herald, LXVI (September 7, 1955), 2.

²⁴C. W. Butler, "Exposition of St. John, the 17th Chapter," The Christian Witness, New Series LII (September 27, 1934), 1.

²⁵C. W. Butler, "The Gift of God," The Christian Witness, New Series LIV (December 24, 1936), 1. Butler, "Christmas Message," ibid., New Series LV (December 16, 1937), 1. Butler, "The Truth Series," ibid., New Series LX (August 20, 1942), 1, 13. Butler, "Christ Pre-eminent," ibid., New Series LXII (April 13, 1944), 1. Butler, "Easter Meditation," ibid., New Series LXIV (April 18, 1944), 1.

law of God and became a voluntary sacrifice; He invaded the dark domains of death. He entered the abode of lost men in the spirit and He conquered Satan in the realm of his own domain. He came forth carrying the keys of death and hell.²⁶

Butler believed that the resurrection of Christ was the crowning miracle of Christ's mission. The resurrection of Christ made Him not the victim but the conqueror of death. His resurrection was the final seal to all the truth in the Holy Scriptures regarding His personality and His mission. Butler believed that this fact of His resurrection was as clearly foretold as was the fact that He would die for sin. By the resurrection He was declared the Son of God with power. The resurrection did not make Him the Son of God, rather, the resurrection declared His Sonship and it stands as an abiding evidence of His deity and Saviourhood. Further, it substantiates the entire Christian revelation for His resurrection was not merely the restoring of life to a dead body, but was a resurrection from the mortality that was in Him to immortality, from the corruptible state to the incorruptible. Therefore, He is alive forever more. In addition, His resurrection was the firstfruit of a racial resurrection of the bodies of all men. His glorified risen body provides the gracious hope for the complete immortality of the Christian's resurrection for He arose in eternal triumph over the world, sin and the devil. Thus, this was not for Himself alone

²⁶C. W. Butler, "Our Conquering Christ," The Christian Witness, New Series LXIII (March 29, 1945), 2.

but as the head of a new race of redeemed men.²⁷

Butler referred to Christ's birth as an advent and His departure as an ascension.²⁸ His ascension opened the path to the skies. The members of the old Adam race now have access to the throne of grace. The hope for the individual now is in Christ alone.

Upon His ascension He was again exalted to the right hand of the Father. He re-entered the glory which He had with the Father before the world was. According to Butler, He continues in the work of His Saviourhood,³⁰ and He is to have pre-eminence in the things to come.³¹

Offices of Christ. In speaking of the offices of Christ, Butler maintained that the God-Man is the mediator between God and men.³² As

²⁷C. W. Butler, "A True Christology," The Christian Witness, New Series LI (September 21, 1933), 1. Butler, "Our Glorious Hope," ibid., New Series LII (March 29, 1934), 1. Butler, "The Living Christ," ibid., New Series LV (March 25, 1937), 1. Butler, "He is Risen," ibid., New Series LIX (April 10, 1941), 1. Butler, "Easter Morning," ibid., New Series LX (April 2, 1942), 1, 2. Butler, "Easter Meditation Our Risen and Glorified Lord," ibid., New Series LIV (April 18, 1946), 1. Butler, "He Lives--An Easter Meditation," Pentecostal Herald, LXI (April 5, 1950), 7. Butler, "The Cross and the Resurrection," ibid., LXII (March 7, 1951), 3. Butler, "The True Estimate of Christ," The Herald, LXIV (May 6, 1953), 3.

²⁸C. W. Butler, "The Cross and the Resurrection," Pentecostal Herald, LXII (March 7, 1951), 3.

²⁹C. W. Butler, "The Living Christ," The Christian Witness, New Series LV (March 25, 1937), 1.

³⁰C. W. Butler, "But We see Jesus," The Christian Witness, New Series LX (December 10, 1942), 1. Butler, "Our Conquering Christ," ibid., New Series LXIII (March 29, 1945), 2.

³¹C. W. Butler, "Christ Pre-eminent," The Christian Witness, New Series LXII (April 27, 1944), 1.

mediator, His work is divided into the threefold office of Prophet, Priest and King.

Moses wrote, "A prophet shall the Lord your God raise up unto you like unto me; him shall ye hear." In interpreting this, Butler wrote that Christ came in the fulfillment of this prophecy. As a prophet, He restored the standards to their original paradise level. Butler believed that Christ did this in the Sermon on the Mount. There He changed them from the accommodated standards of the Old Testament to harmony with the paradise level. Again and again He said, "Ye have heard that it hath been said," and after He gave the Levitical code, He proceeded to give the standard which was in harmony with the Spirit's standard and which harmonizes with God's character and government.³³ Butler held that God had never changed His standard but man fell from this standard and God dealt with fallen man across the centuries to prepare the way to send His Son and restore the standard.³⁴

Butler believed that Mathew 7:21-29 showed that the standard established in Christ's sermon was to be lived in this life. Butler also realized that people object, "this standard is too high." "It can never be realized." "It is a standard of idealism at which one is to

³²C. W. Butler, "The Undisparaged Christ," The Herald, LXIV (April 1, 1953), 3.

³³C. W. Butler, "Bible Study Number One," The Christian Witness, New Series LIV (March 5, 1936), 1.

³⁴C. W. Butler, "Expositions of St. John, the 17th Chapter," The Christian Witness, New Series LII (September 20, 1934), 1.

aim but never to realize in this life."³⁵ Butler recognized that this standard is impossible apart from Christ's further work.

Beginning at John 17:1, Butler said that Christ assumed the office of high priest. He laid aside the prophet's garb and assumed the prerogatives of high priest. The passion of His prayer, as Butler understood it, was, "Father sanctify them." This intercession was personal for each one of a class and dispensational including each one of the class across the entire age of time. In the fulfilling of this office Christ became the Lamb and offered Himself to God as the sacrifice for sin. Butler said that

He so fulfilled the righteousness of the law of God and so manifested the righteousness and moral perfections of His person and character that His sufferings under the law were of indescribable depth and value. His dying for our sins was a great moral transaction in which He offered to a holy God something in the place of that which is due from the sinner, which God can, in righteousness, accept on the moral grounds upon which it is conditioned. His offering is adequate to satisfy the perfect justice and righteousness of God and His law so that when the receiving subject man takes the moral ground in relation to sin and self-will which enable him to embrace Christ as his Passover Lamb, he can walk into the presence of a holy God in the name and merit of the finished provision of this Redeemer and feel that his faith offers an all-sufficient atonement for all of his sins.³⁶

He was at one time both priest in office and sacrifice in reality.

Butler believed that Christ appears before God now as man's representative, intercessor and mediator. He continues His priestly functions.³⁷

³⁵C. W. Butler, "Expositions of St. John, the 17th Chapter," The Christian Witness, New Series LII (September 20, 1934), 1.

³⁶C. W. Butler, "The Truth Series," The Christian Witness, New Series LX (August 27, 1942), 1.

Butler believed that the day is coming when Christ will lay aside the robe of His priestly office and will clothe Himself in kingly array. Butler stated that the one who receives his Pentecost in this age crowns Christ as Lord and Master in his life. There is a time coming when He will rule the world, the whole universe of God. Butler emphasized that Christ will run the affairs of men as ruler for one thousand years. He stated that this world is not through with Christ. He is the Christ of coming judgment.³⁸

Having understood Butler's position concerning the person of Christ, it was possible to examine what he said concerning the work of Christ.

The Atonement

According to Butler, God created man for moral harmony with Himself. Man was to agree with His purposes and be conformed to His nature and will. This was in order that man and God might walk together in deep spiritual fellowship and that man might enjoy the felicity and glory of a holy God. Man was built with a capacity to know and share

³⁷Ibid., Butler, "Expositions of St. John, the 17th Chapter," ibid., LII (September 27, 1934), 1. Butler, "Expositions of St. John, the 17th Chapter," ibid., New Series LII (November 1, 1934), 1, 8. Butler, "Bible Study Number One," ibid., New Series LIV (March 12, 1936), 1.

³⁸C. W. Butler, "Expositions of St. John, the 17th Chapter," The Christian Witness, New Series LII (September 27, 1934), 1. Butler, "Bible Study Number One," ibid., New Series LIV (March 12, 1936), 1. Butler, "A True Christology," ibid., New Series LI (October 5, 1939), 1. Butler, "The True Estimate of Christ," The Herald, LXIV (June 3, 1953), 3.

in the pleasure of the perfection of the moral balance of the Infinite. As such, man was created a moral being, a rational being, a volitional being and a being capable of love. The fall of man thwarted the moral and spiritual results which God desired. However, the fall did not destroy the capacities with which God created man.³⁹

Butler's position was that

The perfect righteousness of God's character and of His office of moral Ruler, as well as the perfect character of His law and government, separated and shut God away from the saving of a rebellious and lost human race. He could not come past righteousness, His own, His law, His government, until He fulfilled and expressed that righteousness, by the demands of the law being met.⁴⁰

Butler referred to his view of the atonement as the moral view. He was careful to indicate that this was not the moral influence view. In making the distinction, he said,

the sufferings of Christ fulfilled the righteousness of the law and manifested the righteousness of God so that the entire transaction between a holy God and fallen man is on a moral basis.⁴¹

Butler also was careful to designate that his position was not that of the commercial view. This he designated as a literal debt-paying transaction. Those who hold this position, according to Butler, state that Christ paid the penalty due man's sins "in His own body on

³⁹C. W. Butler, "The Atonement," The Christian Witness, New Series LXIV (December, 1946), 1. Butler, "The Death of Christ," The Herald, LXIX (July 1, 1959), 2.

⁴⁰C. W. Butler, "Christ Jesus Whom God Hath Set Forth," The Christian Witness, New Series LIX (September 4, 1941), 1.

⁴¹C. W. Butler, "The Atonement," The Christian Witness, New Series LXIV (August 1, 1946), 1.

the tree." They also state that "Our salvation is all in what Christ has done for us on the cross." By these statements they mean to exalt Christ in His great work of Saviourhood. Butler felt that this position led to a threefold error: (1) a limited atonement, (2) unconditional election, and (3) eternal security. If the atonement was a commercial transaction, then this position would be correct. Butler felt that the atonement was not a commercial transaction and that there was a better way to exalt Christ and His atoning work.⁴²

When Butler took exception to those who held the commercial view, he was not attempting to unchristianize them but to show the error in their intellectual basis of their faith. He recognized that many of these people enjoyed the benefits of Christ's death in their own personal experience.⁴³

Butler held that the entire problem of sin and redemption was a moral problem.⁴⁴ Involved in this problem was the great moral nature of God, namely His holiness.⁴⁵

In the spelling out of his position, Butler held that the atonement, Christ's atoning death, was the highest expression of the love of

⁴²Ibid.

⁴³C. W. Butler, "What Does It Mean?," The Christian Witness, New Series LIX (April 17, 1941), 1.

⁴⁴C. W. Butler, "The Sufferings of Christ," The Christian Witness, New Series LXI (April 15, 1943), 1, 2.

⁴⁵C. W. Butler, "So Shall My Word Be," The Christian Witness, New Series LI (September 2, 1943), 1.

God. The sovereign holiness of God gave birth to the plan of redemption. Calvary was the supreme revelation of God's righteousness and of His love.⁴⁶ God's holiness and the righteousness of His law demanded such a plan. God's mercy and power were released in harmony with His perfect law. By the death of Christ God was able to forgive sin and to justify the believer in Jesus. Thus, He could forgive in harmony with His eternal law of righteousness.⁴⁷ The fact of a blood atonement included a deeper meaning of the holiness of God. It spoke of the utter demerit of sin. The shedding of blood represents the extreme and perfect penalty for sin.⁴⁸

Sin, for Butler, is a moral problem. God cannot and does not deal lightly with this malady. Before God could extend mercy and pardon the demands of moral law and holy character had to be met.⁴⁹

The moral view recognizes the absolute perfection of Christ as an adequate and all-sufficient offering for sin by virtue not only of His complete obedience to the law in all that He did, but by His perfect conformity to the law in all that He was. He not only did righteously; He was righteous. In Him was no sin. He was perfect in the union of the nature of Godhood and humanhood. His relation to the perfect law of God and to the infinite perfections of God Himself was such that His death filled full the righteousness of the law and revealed and declared the righteousness of God as the

⁴⁶C. W. Butler, "The Precious Blood," Pentecostal Herald, LXI (November 1, 1950), 3.

⁴⁷C. W. Butler, "Perfected Forever," The Herald, LXII (September 5, 1951), 3.

⁴⁸C. W. Butler, "So Shall My Word Be," The Christian Witness, New Series LI (September 3, 1943), 1.

⁴⁹C. W. Butler, "Miracle in the Realm of Moral Government," The Christian Witness, New Series LII (March 15, 1934), 1.

Lawgiver. He was the Lamb which God provided for Himself, and is referred to as "the unspeakable gift." His sufferings express unmeasured and unfathomable depths and heights of moral suffering.⁵⁰

Butler felt that the most meaningful text relating to the atonement was II Corinthians 5:21. In this verse, which goes beyond human understanding, according to Butler, both the righteousness of God's law and his holiness are involved. Butler believed that Christ was made sin for mankind only in the following sense: (1) His suffering was the suffering of sin, (2) His death was a death unto sin, (3) He did not die as a righteous person dies but as a sinner dies, and (4) there was darkness in His death.⁵¹

Christ did not bear literally the exact equivalent of the pain of those who deserved eternal torment. By His suffering He was a perfect offering under the law for sin. He offered a sacrifice by which all men could be saved. "His death was an acquittal for none, but a gracious and perfect provision for all."⁵²

Christ's death, for Butler, was a substitutional death, it involved vicarious suffering. His death was an entirely moral transaction which met the moral conditions of God's holiness and the holiness of His law and government. Butler felt that it also makes the strongest

⁵⁰C. W. Butler, "The Atonement," The Christian Witness, New Series LXIV (August 1, 1946), 2.

⁵¹C. W. Butler, "The Atonement," The Christian Witness, New Series LXIV (November 1, 1946), 2.

⁵²C. W. Butler, "The Atonement in Christ," The Herald, LXVI (October 5, 1955), 2.

moral appeal, of which God is capable of making, to win men, responsible moral creatures, back to Himself. Christ's substitutionary death was of such a nature that when man meets certain moral conditions the death of Christ can be accepted in the place of that which is due the penitent trusting sinner. When these moral conditions have been met by the sinner the death penalty is commuted, life is imparted and God and the sinner are reconciled. Butler felt that this view of the atonement made possible a universal atonement as provision for all but conditionally bestowed and conditionally retained.⁵³

Christ, the God-man, not only identified Himself with man's humanity but with man's sin problem, according to Butler. He gave Himself as a sacrifice for the sins of the world. It is by this finished sacrifice that the door of mercy swings open for all men.⁵⁴ Christ became the great sin-bearer.⁵⁵ The route of atonement was by the blood of Christ as the Lamb of God.⁵⁶ In the shedding of Christ's blood God's righteousness was revealed, His justice vindicated and His love and mercy fully revealed.⁵⁷

⁵³C. W. Butler, "What Does It Mean?," The Christian Witness, New Series LIX (April 17, 1941), 11.

⁵⁴C. W. Butler, "The Christ of Eternities," Pentecostal Herald, LIX (December 3, 1947), 3.

⁵⁵C. W. Butler, "Tested Values," Pentecostal Herald, LX (December 1, 1950), 3.

⁵⁶C. W. Butler, "The Precious Blood," Pentecostal Herald, LXI (November 1, 1950), 3.

⁵⁷C. W. Butler, "An Easter Meditation," The Herald, LXIII (April 2, 1952), 3.

This sacrifice made by God so that man could be redeemed cost God the supreme sacrifice. Nothing less than this could satisfy the demands of God's holy character and government.⁵⁸ Butler stated reverently that this sacrifice exhausted God's infinite resources. He did this to provide an adequate remedy for sin but also to provide the greatest moral appeal possible to win men.⁵⁹

God gave Himself in supreme sacrifice for the complete moral recovery of man. For a lesser objective He could not make such great sacrifice.⁶⁰ The atonement provides that man can be restored unto that holiness which prepares him to meet God.⁶¹

The death of Christ was vicarious in its character. By vicarious Butler meant, "the place or office of one person is assumed by another, on behalf of or representing another; performed or suffered by one person representing another, with results, or benefits, or advantages accruing to another."⁶² The remedy for sin is associated with the supreme and unspeakable sufferings of Christ.⁶³ His vicarious sufferings

⁵⁸C. W. Butler, "Miracle in the Realm of Moral Government," The Christian Witness, New Series LII (March 15, 1934), 1.

⁵⁹C. W. Butler, "Evangelism," Pentecostal Herald, LX (May 5, 1948), 3.

⁶⁰C. W. Butler, "He Lives," The Christian Witness, New Series LXIII (September 27, 1945), 1.

⁶¹C. W. Butler, "Man's Nature and His Recovery Through the Atonement of Christ," The Herald, LXVI (December 7, 1955), 2.

⁶²C. W. Butler, "The Death of Christ," The Herald, LXIX (May 6, 1959), 2.

⁶³C. W. Butler, "Holiness Preaching," The Herald, LXV

Butler was convinced that man would be satisfied when He awoke in glory but also that God Himself will be satisfied with the ultimate result of His work of creation and redemption.⁶⁹

The setting forth of Jesus Christ perfects such a moral balance in the universe of God that He will be forever vindicated for permitting the mystery of iniquity to work.

The setting forth of Jesus Christ so balances the moral order that no man will ever be finally lost because of Adam's sin. Men shall die, in the eternal sense, for their own sin only.

The setting forth of Jesus Christ stands out as the mightiest moral appeal God could make to a morally responsible and free race to win men to the choice of right and to turn to Himself.

He is a perfect sin offering. He is a perfect object of faith. He is, therefore, a perfect Saviour.⁷⁰

This constitutes Butler's position concerning the work of Christ which he called the moral view.

Benefits of the atonement. There are certain unconditional benefits bestowed because of the atonement, according to Butler: (1) the material universe was and is preserved.⁷¹ (2) By Christ's death, there has been a new and prolonged probation of the human race. Man is spared so that he may take advantage of the conditional benefits of the atonement.⁷² (3) The atonement covers all irresponsible persons; this

⁶⁹Ibid.

⁷⁰C. W. Butler, "Christ Jesus Whom God Hath Set Forth," The Christian Witness, New Series LIX (September 4, 1941), 1, 13.

⁷¹C. W. Butler, "Christ Jesus Whom God Hath Set Forth," The Christian Witness, New Series LIX (August 28, 1941), 1.

⁷²C. W. Butler, "The Will of God," The Christian Witness, New

includes infants and truly born-again Christians who die in a justified state.⁷³

The provision of Calvary covers the need of cleansing of Adamic sin, but if a converted man dies ignorant of this provision, and never rejects light, he dies in the same relation to the "free gift" that a little child dies. If he has light and rebels against it, he becomes a rebel and loses his right relation with God. Therefore, if he is ever lost it will be by his own willful rebellion against the will of God.⁷⁴

(4) Because of the atonement God is obligated to answer prayer which deals with the sin problem. God could not be just and deal with the sin problem apart from the atonement. He cannot now remain just and fail to hear the cry of penitents who confess their sins, turn and look by faith to the death of His Son to cure their sin problem.⁷⁵ (5) "One of the most direct and continued benefits of the provision of Christ's atonement in the carrying out this redemptive program is the giving of the Holy Spirit in His pentecostal dispensational fulness to this age."⁷⁶ These are the unconditional benefits which Butler found in the atonement.

Series LIV (April 2, 1936), 1. Butler, "Christ Jesus Whom God Hath Set Forth," ibid., New Series LIX (August 28, 1941), 1. Butler, "The Death of Christ," The Herald, LXIX (June 3, 1959), 1.

⁷³C. W. Butler, "The Death of Christ," The Herald, LXIX (August 12, 1959), 2.

⁷⁴C. W. Butler, "Divine Sonship," The Herald, LXVIII (February 6, 1957), 11.

⁷⁵C. W. Butler, "The Sprinkled Blood," The Christian Witness, New Series LVI (March 24, 1938), 1.

⁷⁶C. W. Butler, "Faith vs. the Work and Witness of the Spirit," The Christian Witness, New Series L (March 17, 1932), 2.

III. THE DOCTRINE OF THE HOLY SPIRIT

Butler held that the person and work of the Holy Spirit was intimately related to the provision and manifestation of the redemption which has been provided for man.

Person

Butler insisted that the Holy Spirit is a person and not an influence. He comes to abide, Pentecost is a presence.⁷⁷ His presence is a fiery presence, His is a mighty, sin-destroying, heart purifying presence. Only He has the power to reach into the depths of the human heart and eradicate sin.⁷⁸ His presence is a revealing presence, a searching presence, an illuminating presence, a healing and purifying presence, an abiding presence, a comforting presence, a protecting presence and an empowering presence.⁷⁹

He proceeds from the Father and the Son. He, according to Butler, is here to carry forward the work which Jesus began through the human agency of redeemed people.⁸⁰ The Holy Spirit is referred to as

⁷⁷C. W. Butler, "More About Pentecost," The Herald, LXII (August 1, 1951), 3. Butler, "Pentecost," The Christian Witness, New Series LXI (May 13, 1943), 1.

⁷⁸C. W. Butler, "The Sacred Flame," The Christian Witness, New Series LXIV (June 13, 1946), 1.

⁷⁹C. W. Butler, "Pentecost," The Christian Witness, New Series LXI (May 6, 1943), 1, 2.

⁸⁰C. W. Butler, "The Ministry of Jesus," The Christian Witness, New Series LVII (May 25, 1939), 1.

administering life. What the Father has willed and the Son provided, the Holy Spirit executes and makes real. To the Holy Spirit was ascribed the work of building the Holy Scriptures. In His redemptive activities He takes the place of a servant, never referring to Himself but He always exalts the Son.⁸¹ Thus, the Holy Spirit glorifies Christ.⁸²

His coming was at Pentecost, His coming is at Pentecost. His coming was and is sudden. It was and is the advent of a person. Butler was emphatic that there are four facts about Pentecost, three are incidental, one is fundamental. The sound of a rushing wind, the cloven tongues of fire and the speaking in tongues are incidental. The being filled with the Holy Spirit is fundamental.⁸³ Butler's position concerning the person of the Holy Spirit is the same as that which orthodox Christianity has held across the centuries.

Offices of the Holy Spirit

Dr. Butler listed nine offices of the Holy Spirit. They were as follows:

I. It is the office of the Holy Spirit to convict of sin. Conviction such as issues in genuine repentance is the inwrought work of God, the Holy Spirit, through truth.

⁸¹C. W. Butler, "Truth Series," The Christian Witness, New Series LX (January 28, 1943), 1, 2.

⁸²C. W. Butler, "The Fullness of Christ," Pentecostal Herald, LXII (June 27, 1951), 3, 16.

⁸³C. W. Butler, "Pentecost," The Christian Witness, New Series LXI (May 13, 1943), 1, 2.

II. It is the office of the Holy Spirit to regenerate the penitent, believing heart. He makes alive. He is the life-giving spirit.

III. It is His office also to witness to our adoption. It is He who assures the heart and gives confidence toward God.

IV. Having regenerated the heart and witnessed thereto, He sustains a personal relation to the believer. He is to be our leader. He guides us into all truth. He not only guides but He teaches us. He quickens our memory. He brings to our attention things we know, in our times of need.

V. He is an abiding Comforter, One near to help, or, our Paraclete. In this office He quickens promises to us which feed and build our faith.

VI. In His faithfulness, He discovers to us our own condition of need. He through the truth uncovers carnality and convicts the believer of indwelling sin.

VII. Having discovered to us our need of cleansing, it is His office to sanctify us through the truth. He is the active, divine agent, operating under the cover and merit of Calvary, making the yielded, trusting heart clean through divine grace.

VIII. It is His prerogative to again bear witness to our human spirits that we are clean. There is a witness to inwrought holiness as there is a witness to our justification, an adoption [sic] into the family of God.

IX. He indwells the believer to reveal the Godhead in us and to empower us by His abiding presence and the imparting of such gifts as He may choose from time to time, enabling us to perform the service of life to which we are appointed by the will of God.⁸⁴

The Holy Spirit, according to Butler, is here officially for the purpose of carrying into effect the provisions of Calvary.⁸⁵ Butler had more to say concerning some of the offices of the Holy Spirit. They

⁸⁴C. W. Butler, "Offices of the Holy Spirit," The Christian Witness, New Series LVI (May 19, 1938), 1.

⁸⁵C. W. Butler, "Faith vs. The Work and Witness of the Spirit," The Christian Witness, New Series L (March 17, 1932), 2.

have been listed and expanded in the following pages.

Birth of the Spirit

Butler thought that a sinner is one who is dead in trespasses and sins. When He has been convicted of his sin by the Holy Spirit, sincerely repented and looked to Christ in faith for salvation, he is born of the Spirit.⁸⁶ The new birth makes man alive in his spirit department. This brings him into God-consciousness, which issues in communion and fellowship with God. It also brings a knowledge which enables the professor to say, "I know in whom I have believed." The new birth is a fundamental change.⁸⁷

The evidences of the new birth or birth of the Spirit include:

- (1) God made real in the moral consciousness of the receiving subject,
- (2) a new love for one's fellowmen, (3) victory over the world, (4) dominion over sin, (5) standard of outward holiness, and (6) a love for the Word of God.⁸⁸

The Holy Spirit effects the adoption of the newborn child into the family of God.⁸⁹

⁸⁶C. W. Butler, "The Verdict of Destiny," Pentecostal Herald, LXI (July 12, 1950), 3.

⁸⁷C. W. Butler, "Sound Doctrine," The Christian Witness, New Series LVI (May 12, 1938), 1.

⁸⁸C. W. Butler, "Sound Doctrine," The Christian Witness, New Series LVI (May 5, 1938), 1.

⁸⁹C. W. Butler, "Bible Perfection," The Christian Witness, New Series LXII (October 12, 1944), 1.

Baptism of the Spirit

As a work subsequent to the birth of the Spirit, Butler preached that the baptism with the Holy Spirit or Pentecost was and is for every Christian. Pentecost was not an afterthought with God but was planned at the same meeting in which Calvary was planned. The relation between Calvary's sacrifice and the baptism with the Holy Spirit is that Calvary provided Pentecost.⁹⁰ Pentecost was God's day and it was planned by Him, it was the advent of God Himself to a human temple prepared for His presence.⁹¹

The negative work of the Holy Spirit in the baptism is to cleanse the temple of the dedicated Christian. The positive and constructive work of the Holy Spirit in baptism is to perfect in love and to reveal and unveil Christ in His indwelling fulness.⁹²

Butler thought that Christians need this baptism with the Holy Spirit for the full settlement of the sin problem, to reveal the glorified Christ in His indwelling fulness, to successfully manage their own human selfhood, to enable them to live successfully with others, to perform Christian service effectively and to secure to them things to

⁹⁰C. W. Butler, "Pentecost," The Christian Witness, New Series LIV (February 13, 1936), 1. Butler, "Pentecost," ibid., New Series LXI (May 27, 1943), 1.

⁹¹C. W. Butler, "Pentecost," The Christian Witness, New Series LIV (February 13, 1936), 1.

⁹²C. W. Butler, "Pentecost," The Christian Witness, New Series LXI (May 13, 1943), 1, 2. Butler, "He That is Spiritual," Pentecostal Herald, LX (April 7, 1948), 3.

come.⁹³

The Witness of the Spirit

Butler believed that the witness of the Spirit was given when His work of salvation was completed. The work took place when the receiving subject had made the proper moral adjustments. Butler maintained that when in faith an individual looked to the death of Christ as his substitute the work was done and when the work was done the Spirit bore witness to the fact.⁹⁴ The witness does not save nor does it sanctify. As there is a double cure in God's remedy for sin, so there is a double witness to the facts experienced. "Faith precipitates the facts in experience to which the witness of the Holy Spirit is added."⁹⁵

Butler recognized a threefold witness. (1) There is the witness of a man's own spirit. (2) There is the inner witness of the Holy Spirit to the epochal works of grace as there is the witness to God's pleasure or displeasure in one's conduct. These two must not be final for they can be mistaken. The final witness is: (3) the written Word of God. When these three agree one has a threefold cord which is not easily broken.⁹⁶

⁹³C. W. Butler, "Our Need of the Holy Spirit," The Christian Witness, New Series LVII (July 6, 1939), 1.

⁹⁴C. W. Butler, "Salvation by Faith," The Christian Witness, New Series LIII (July 18, 1935), 1, 8.

⁹⁵C. W. Butler, "Sound Doctrine," The Christian Witness, New Series LVI (June 2, 1938), 1.

⁹⁶C. W. Butler, "Spiritual Inventory," The Christian Witness, New Series LIII (January 10, 1935), 1.

Butler defined the witness of the Holy Spirit as that tender impression made by Him on our human spirit that causes a conscious assurance to arise within. This gives us confidence toward God. It becomes knowledge confirmed by the Word of God to us.⁹⁷

He also noticed that people often seek the witness before they believe. Butler pointed out that the witness is given in response to faith and not the witness given so that one may believe.⁹⁸ Butler realized that there is the danger of calling mere intellectual consent faith. Faith, according to Butler, is an act of one's total self-hood.⁹⁹

Manifestations of the Spirit

Butler noted that some have confused the manifestations of the Spirit with the witness of the Spirit. They would have received the blessing except they were seeking some manifestation and failed to heed or listen to the still small voice. The manifestations of God are subject to God's own choosing and are given for an individual's profit and for His glory, was Butler's thought along this line. They are not to be sought nor made an end in themselves. The manifestations are usually short and occasional whereas the witness remains as long as conditions

⁹⁷C. W. Butler, "Sound Doctrine," The Christian Witness, New Series LVI (June 2, 1938), 1.

⁹⁸C. W. Butler, "Salvation by Faith," The Christian Witness, New Series LIII (July 18, 1935), 1, 8. Butler, "Feelings versus Faith and Principle," ibid., New Series LX (October 29, 1942), 1.

⁹⁹C. W. Butler, "Feelings versus Faith and Principle," The Christian Witness, New Series LX (October 29, 1942), 1.

are met.¹⁰⁰

The Fruit of the Spirit

Butler insisted that the witness is received immediately upon the completion of the work. The fruit is implanted immediately but it takes time to manifest the fruit.

The fruit of the Spirit, as evidenced by love, involves our being made perfect in love by the removing, in the moral quality of our spirits, all that is contrary to love, and by the shedding abroad of divine love in our whole selfhood. The measure of love which marks the full fruit of the Spirit is indeed love made perfect. Where this is true, it is accompanied by the joy of the Lord which is our strength; then not simply peace with God, which is a relationship, but the "peace of God which passeth all understanding" which is a possession. These deep spiritual realities condition us so that the spirit of long-suffering, of gentleness, and of goodness will be evidenced in our daily living, accompanied by steadfastness in faith, meekness of spirit, and an ordering of our total living according to the principle of true temperance. Where this fruit abounds the statement that "against such there is no law" becomes a realized fact. You will note that the whole list of gracious facts given in the Scripture referred to are but manifestations of the Spirit's presence. They are not designated as the fruits of, but as the fruit of the Spirit.¹⁰¹

Butler held that the fruit of the Spirit is the final and abiding test of the baptism of the Spirit.¹⁰²

The Gifts of the Spirit

In Butler's thinking, the gifts of the Spirit are subject to God's

¹⁰⁰C. W. Butler, "The Manifestations of the Spirit," The Christian Witness, New Series LVI (July 14, 1938), 1. Butler, "The Truth Series," ibid., New Series LX (February 4, 1943), 1, 2.

¹⁰¹C. W. Butler, "The Truth Series," The Christian Witness, New Series LX (February 11, 1943), 1, 2.

¹⁰²Ibid.

own choosing. They are given for one's profit and for His glory. They are not to be sought.¹⁰³

Butler taught that one should not expect a gift as a token that the work is complete. If the witness has been given, a gift cannot add or detract.¹⁰⁴ One may have Him and possess the fruit and never have a special gift, according to Butler.¹⁰⁵

The Guidance of the Spirit

Many times the Christian will have the direct inward guidance of the Holy Spirit. Butler recognized that this was hard to explain but was precious to the one who knew it. Sometimes the Spirit quickens a verse of Scripture and applies it to the present need. Another method He uses is providences. Butler quoted from Martin Wells Knapp's book on Impressions. In this was given four rules to test supposed leadings: (1) it must be right, (2) it must be Scriptural, (3) It must be reasonable, and (4) it must be providential.¹⁰⁶ Butler admonished to obey the Holy Spirit's promptings and His checks.¹⁰⁷

¹⁰³C. W. Butler, "The Manifestations of the Spirit," The Christian Witness, New Series LVI (July 14, 1938), 1.

¹⁰⁴C. W. Butler, "The Truth Series," The Christian Witness, New Series LX (February 4, 1943), 1, 2.

¹⁰⁵C. W. Butler, "The Truth Series," The Christian Witness, New Series LX (February 11, 1943), 1, 2.

¹⁰⁶C. W. Butler, "Heart Talk on Guidance," The Christian Witness, New Series LVII (September 28, 1939), 1.

¹⁰⁷C. W. Butler, "More About Pentecost," The Herald, LXII (August 1, 1951), 3.

The Grieving of the Holy Spirit

Concerning the grieving of the Holy Spirit, Butler taught the following. The Holy Spirit is to take charge of every believer in Christ. He is to guide, protect and empower. The Holy Spirit is a gentle, tender leader, He is symbolized by the dove. His checks are given by a tender, quiet inward pull. By these, He attempts to keep the believer from harm. If one in whose heart He dwells begins to go from the path of right, He gives an inward warning. If this warning was not heeded, He is grieved. The Holy Spirit suffers long and deals patiently before He leaves. He will not leave without serving notice that He is going to depart, He desires to stay forever. If He is grieved seriously and repeatedly it is impossible for Him to abide.¹⁰⁸ This summarizes Butler's teaching concerning the person and work of the Holy Spirit.

IV. SUMMARY

This chapter presented Butler's position concerning God's recovery program whereby man could be restored to the holiness from which he fell. The objective side of salvation was presented. Butler held that Christ, the eternal Son of God, took on himself human nature in the womb of Mary. He was righteous and did righteously. Christ as the great high priest offered Himself as the Lamb of God. His atoning death was of such a nature that God could be just and yet justify the sinner. Because of

¹⁰⁸C. W. Butler, "A Message to Believers," The Christian Witness, New Series LVII (March 9, 1939), 1.

Christ's death, God could both forgive the penitent sinner and restore the believer unto that state of holiness from which man fell in the garden. Butler believed that the Holy Spirit was sent by the Father and the Son. He is here to make real in the hearts of men that which Christ provided at Calvary. The great truth of this chapter is that provision has been made to restore man to that state of holiness which he lost by sin.

THE HOLINESS OF GOD RESTORED IN MAN

CHAPTER VI

THE HOLINESS OF GOD RESTORED IN MAN

The purpose of this chapter was to present the subjective side of salvation as Butler understood and presented it. Butler spoke of three zones in salvation. These three zones have provided the division points of the majority of this chapter. They have been treated under the heading of the holiness of God restored in man, individually. The closing section of this chapter presented Butler's position concerning the church and has been treated under the heading of the holiness of God restored in man, collectively.

I. INDIVIDUALLY

Zone One of Salvation

Butler did not write much about the preliminary stages of grace such as prevenient grace and conviction. His position concerning these matters came mainly from what He said in regard to areas related to the preliminary stages of grace.

Repentance. Repentance, he spoke of as a heart broken for sin and from sin. It is a change of willing, of feeling and of love in respect to God. It implies an abhorrence of sin. In repentance, one begins to look upon sin as God does, for repentance is of such a nature that it secures a change in conduct and in character. It is a great moral reaction in the soul of man wherein he takes sides with God

against sin, even his own sin. Thus, the penitent sees sin as something hateful to God.¹

Repentance involves the forsaking of all known evil.² It is the preparation of the heart to believe on Jesus.³ His position concerning repentance would imply conviction for sin.

Saving faith. Butler's view on saving faith is that it is both a gift of God and an act of the person. In the realm of divine grace a provision has been made for the gift of faith. It is bestowed upon the individual the instant he makes proper moral adjustments in the realm of the known will of God. Power to believe is imparted when moral adjustments have been made by the choice of a responsible subject. Thus, God does not believe for an individual but He gives the power to believe, and this gift of faith makes possible a present, personal trusting of Jesus to save an individual in the here and now.⁴

It is an act of the individual in that he chooses to step out on the Word of God and believe God. This choice is a moral act of the soul

¹C. W. Butler, "A Note on True Repentance," The Christian Witness, New Series LIV (May 21, 1936), 1. Butler, "Sound Doctrine," ibid., New Series LVI (April 21, 1938), 1.

²C. W. Butler, "Reputation vs. Character," The Christian Witness, New Series LI (September 9, 1943), 1.

³C. W. Butler, "The Verdict of Destiny," Pentecostal Herald, LXI (July 12, 1950), 3.

⁴C. W. Butler, "The Gift of Faith," The Christian Witness, New Series LV (May 13, 1937), 1.

in that, in deep contrition of spirit, he confesses and forsakes sin.⁵

This law of faith operates in both zones one and two. After the facts have been made real in the individual, he must stand, walk and overcome by faith.⁶

Justification. Butler said that justification is forgiveness on a legal basis, or in harmony with the righteousness of the law, and involves therefore the whole redemptive work of Christ and the conditions of a moral approach on the human side for our appropriation of the benefits of his death.⁷

Further, it involves the cancelling of guilt and the lifting of condemnation in harmony with the righteous demands of the law of God.⁸ It is not simply a pardon but it is the full settlement of the sinner's account. This is on a basis that frees him from the condemnation of the law.⁹

This forgiveness is in harmony with the perfection of God's character and of His holy name,¹⁰ the death penalty is commuted.¹¹

⁵C. W. Butler, "The Unchanging Law of Faith," The Herald, LXVII (May 2, 1956), 2.

⁶Ibid.

⁷C. W. Butler, "The Importance of Holiness," Pentecostal Herald, LXII (February 7, 1951), 3.

⁸C. W. Butler, "Behold the Lamb," The Herald, LXVII (July 11, 1956), 3.

⁹C. W. Butler, "Justification by Faith," The Christian Witness, New Series LIV (July 20, 1936), 1.

¹⁰C. W. Butler, "A Meditation on Romans," Pentecostal Herald, LX (October 6, 1948), 3.

Butler held that in justification God imputes righteousness to the forgiven subject. He treats him as righteous before His holy law.¹² God accepts the finished work of Calvary on behalf of the broken law because of the sinner's repentance and faith.¹³

Justification is by faith. The experiential result is peace with God. The sinner is justified by faith before God but he is justified by works before men.¹⁴ The work itself is an instantaneous work although the approach oftentimes involves a time element.¹⁵

Regeneration. The first great imperative in salvation, according to Butler was, "ye must be born again." Butler did not believe this was an arbitrary ruling of a sovereign God but was a merciful provision meant to deal with an imperative need in man.¹⁶ The death sentence had been pronounced upon man. When he fell in the garden, one of the effects was death in his spirit department. This was the reason for the first

¹¹C. W. Butler, "The Gospel," The Herald, LXIX (October 7, 1959), 2.

¹²C. W. Butler, "Behold the Lamb," The Herald, LXVII (July 11, 1956), 3.

¹³C. W. Butler, "The Gift of Righteousness," The Christian Witness, New Series LIII (May 30, 1955), 9.

¹⁴C. W. Butler, "Justification By Faith," The Christian Witness, New Series LIV (July 30, 1936), 1.

¹⁵C. W. Butler, "The Double Cure," Pentecostal Herald, LX (April 6, 1949), 3.

¹⁶C. W. Butler, "Heart Talk on the Second Work of Grace," The Herald, LXV (March 3, 1954), 3.

imperative.¹⁷ Regeneration involves being made alive in the spirit department of man's personality. It brings man into God consciousness, which issues in fellowship, communion and a knowledge enabling one to say

I know whom I have believed. The new birth is a fundamental change, it brings the conscious self into the sphere of new realities. The change is so vital that not only new life has been given but new relationships and friendships are made. New adjustments also are made.¹⁸

Regeneration is a work of the Spirit.¹⁹ New life is imparted, man has passed from death to life.²⁰ When one is born of God he receives the adoption of sons.²¹

This is a real experience and is the first principle of true holiness. Butler insisted that holiness begins in repentance and regeneration. The attitude of true repentance is a holy attitude and this leads to a life of righteousness.²²

The marks of the new birth include the following: (1) God is

¹⁷C. W. Butler, "Man's Place in . . . God's Plan," The Herald, LXVI (May 4, 1955), 2.

¹⁸C. W. Butler, "Sound Doctrine," The Christian Witness, New Series LVI (May 12, 1938), 1.

¹⁹C. W. Butler, "There is a Reason Why," The Herald, LXV (October 5, 1954), 2.

²⁰Ibid. Butler, "Bible Perfection," The Christian Witness, New Series LXII (October 12, 1944), 1.

²¹C. W. Butler, "Bible Perfection," ibid. Butler, "The Proving of Faith," ibid., New Series LII (May 24, 1934), 1.

²²C. W. Butler, "Dangerous Deception," The Christian Witness, New Series LV (July 22, 1937), 1.

brought within a man's moral consciousness, (2) he has victory over the world, (3) he has dominion over sin, (4) he begins to practice righteousness, (5) he embraces all that is good and rejects the evil, and (6) there is a love for the people of God.²³

Regeneration takes place the same moment that the sinner receives his pardon from the sovereign of the universe.²⁴ Butler stated that this experience of justification and regeneration was properly called the first work of grace. It is a perfect part of a perfect whole, it is a perfect work.²⁵

The will in salvation. Butler recognized a weakness in much of today's approach to evangelism in that people are urged to make a decision for Christ, whereas an individual is not saved by a decision only, nor is he saved without a decision. Butler taught that God releases his power for salvation only upon a right use of the individual's will, which involves a decision.²⁶

The foregoing was Butler's teaching in regard to zone one of salvation. He did not write as much concerning this zone as he did zone

²³C. W. Butler, "The Will of God for the World," The Christian Witness, New Series LIV (April 16, 1936), 1.

²⁴C. W. Butler, "The Will of God," The Christian Witness, New Series LIV (April 9, 1936), 1, 8.

²⁵C. W. Butler, "The Double Cure," Pentecostal Herald, LX (April 6, 1949), 3. Butler, "Stepping Heavenward," The Herald, LXVII (May 30, 1956), 3.

²⁶C. W. Butler, "Decision Day Values and Fallacies," The Christian Witness, New Series LIX (December 11, 1941), 8.

two but this did not mean that he discounted its importance. Zone one was vital to his theology for if an individual had not entered zone one it would have been impossible for him to enter zone two.

Zone Two of Salvation

Holiness, the New Testament standard and command. Butler believed that holiness was the central idea of Christianity. It is a fundamental doctrine of the Book.²⁷ It is declared to be the will of God.²⁸ The greatest command given to man, according to Butler, was that found in I Peter 1:16, "It is written, Be ye holy; for I am holy." God was speaking here, He was disclosing His own infinite moral perfection and His desire was that His children be like Him, holy.²⁹

Butler went on to say that, as a doctrine of Scripture, it is definitely associated with the blood of Christ, Hebrews 13:12. It is also associated with the work of the Holy Spirit, Romans 15:16. It is revealed that it is obtained by faith, Acts 26:18. As an experience, it is directed at man's deep inner sin problem. It deals with the cure of sin which cannot be pardoned. Since it deals with the sin problem, it is part of the salvation experience and properly called full salvation.³⁰

²⁷C. W. Butler, "Helps to Holy Living," The Christian Witness, New Series LIV (January 9, 1936), 1.

²⁸C. W. Butler, "The Doctrine of Holiness," The Herald, LXIX (February 5, 1958), 2.

²⁹C. W. Butler, "It is Written," The Christian Witness, New Series LXVIII (February 13, 1941), 1.

Because it is a salvation experience, it is received by faith.³¹

The cure of this deep inner need is a doctrine of scripture, according to Butler. Butler taught that the in truth sanctification for which Jesus prayed was answered by God with Pentecost. God's original purpose at creation was for a being He could have fellowship with on the level of His holiness. This standard was the standard by which He redeemed and commanded His people to attain to.³²

Butler further noted that this command was for something that man was not by nature. Time could not cure this problem. This experience was and is necessary: (1) to make men what they ought to be, (2) to enable them to live right, (3) to be satisfied truly, (4) to condition and prepare them to meet their obligations in the realm of service, and (5) to condition them for their highest activity, that of worship of a holy God.³³

The in truth sanctification produces the experience of heart holiness.³⁴ Butler's own words show what is meant here.

³⁰C. W. Butler, "Helps to Holiness," The Christian Witness, New Series LIV (January 9, 1936), 1.

³¹C. W. Butler, "The Doctrine of Holiness," The Herald, LXIX (February 5, 1958), 2.

³²C. W. Butler, "The Importance of Holiness," The Christian Witness, New Series LXIV (February, 1947), 1, 2. Butler, "Holiness," The Herald, LXIX (May 7, 1958), 2.

³³C. W. Butler, "Sound Doctrine," The Christian Witness, New Series LVI (June 23, 1938), 1. Butler, "Sound Doctrine," ibid., (July 7 1938), 1.

³⁴C. W. Butler, "God's Remedy for Man's Ill," The Christian Witness, New Series LXIV (July 4, 1946), 1.

The truth of a God-provided, blood-bought, Spirit-wrought, personal sanctification, which is character deep in the believer's life, working in us the experience of true Christian holiness, is a doctrine of Scripture so deeply imbedded in the Word and so closely associated with the will of God and the provision made for us in redemption, that to miss this truth and the experience to which it leads is to miss the major objective of God's redeeming work for us.³⁵

Holiness--a possibility. Butler saw that most people believed God was holy, heaven was holy and in order to get there men need to be holy, but most believe that this experience is impossible in this life. On the contrary, Butler believed that what God had commanded, He had made provision for in the finished work of Calvary. He also sent the third person of the trinity to accomplish and make this real in the lives of His people.³⁶

Definition of holiness. Butler endorsed J. A. Wood's definition of holiness, which is as follows, "When the soul is consciously disentangled from all the sinful affinities and is in a state of present concurrence with the whole will of God, that is holiness,"³⁷ Butler felt that this definition expressed the very goal of God's redemptive purpose and that it is the most thinkable and believable proposition

³⁵C. W. Butler, "Holiness," The Christian Witness, New Series LIX (May 29, 1941), 1.

³⁶C.W. Butler, "An Exploration of--and a Testimony to--Holiness," The Christian Witness, New Series LXVIII (February 20, 1941), 1, 12.

³⁷C. W. Butler, "Holiness Possible," The Christian Witness, New Series LI (November 23, 1933), 1.

that man can enter such a state here and now.³⁸

Butler quoted from a number of men when giving a definition of holiness. He often quoted Dr. Halderman's definition:

Holiness is not goodness and kindness nor even morality. Holiness as the Bible sets it before us is the correspondence of the soul with God, the soul reflecting the intent, desire, and innermost character of God; so that were God to enter into the soul He should find Himself as much at home as upon His own exalted throne.³⁹

Butler liked this definition with the following changes.

I would say holiness is not only goodness and kindness and that it is more than morality. I would then accept the remainder of this definition as one of the richest and deepest conceptions of truth I have ever read or heard expressed.⁴⁰

Butler gave several other definitions and meanings. Because they are crucial to this phase of the study, they are given at length in the following quotation:

In all of its applications it involves first, making holy and secondly, making clean.

Biblically defined, it is being made free from sin and having our first fruit unto holiness and the end everlasting life. It is being crucified with Christ, yet living a life by the faith of the Son of God. It is the putting to death of our "old man" and the renewing of our whole nature after the image of Him that created us. In a word, it is being made pure as He is pure. It involves not only the cleansing of our hearts from all unrighteousness, but the possession of our yielded selves by the indwelling fullness of God.⁴¹

³⁸Ibid.

³⁹C. W. Butler, "Holiness Possible," The Christian Witness, New Series LI (November 23, 1933), 1.

⁴⁰Ibid.

⁴¹C. W. Butler, "Sound Doctrine," The Christian Witness, New Series LVI (June 16, 1938), 1.

. . . we would say we mean moral health or wholeness. Holiness means a moral recovery of the redeemed subject to a purity which is in quality like Christ's purity. It further involves an impartation of the gift of righteousness as an active moral force in human character and living. This gift of righteousness in its very nature eliminates sin. Having eliminated sin, properly speaking, it then permeates and likens to its own nature the entire human selfhood which it possesses. It is a moral state so distinct in its nature and so fixed in its essential relationships that it lives and functions independent of its world environment. It does this, however, through the continued moral choices and cooperation of the recipient of this grace. Holiness is both a principle and a passion. As a principle it directs conduct; as a passion it impells to and inspires holy service. It is the eternal standard of God.⁴²

Another of his own definitions was: "Holiness is not in itself a self-sustaining sufficiency, but is such a conditioning of our human self-hood morally, and an establishing of such a personal relationship with him, that in it we have him as our sufficiency."⁴³ In summary, it can be said that Butler defined holiness as the correspondence of the soul with God. It involves the cleansing of the selfhood of all the taints of sin. The individual is pure as Christ was pure. It is moral health to the soul of man.

Relation of justification and regeneration to sanctification.

Butler pointed out that some think they can keep their justified experience without going on to holiness. He said that this was a dangerous deception for ultimately the lower position would be utterly destroyed. He maintained that if one did not continue to obey God,

⁴²C. W. Butler, "The Christian Philosophy of Life," Witness, New Series LXVIII (March 28, 1940), 8.

⁴³C. W. Butler, "The Nature of True Holiness," The Christian Witness, New Series LIII (May 16, 1935), 1.

walk in the light and seek Christian holiness, he would lose his justified experience. Butler thought that the grace of holiness prepares the individual for a sustained experience of justification.⁴⁴

The relation of regeneration and Christian holiness, according to Butler, is a vital relationship. The new birth begets the hope for seeking the blessing of holiness. The new birth makes an individual an heir of glory but on the way to that glory God has included a definite work of grace begetting in men Christian holiness.⁴⁵ Butler did not teach that these experiences were unrelated but that they were dependent upon one another.

Time element for the obtainment of holiness. Butler noted that people's approach to entire sanctification may be gradual but the work itself was done instantaneously. There was a preparation on the human side but when the preparation was complete God's work was instantaneous.⁴⁶

Butler taught that the time element was negligible for the seeking of the baptism of the Spirit or Christian holiness except such as was necessary for an individual to recognize his needs and to make proper adjustments for the blessing. The time element was not the

⁴⁴C. W. Butler, "Lightening the Ship," The Christian Witness, New Series LV (September 16, 1937), 1.

⁴⁵C. W. Butler, "The Relation of the New Birth to Holiness and Heaven," The Christian Witness, New Series LXIII (January 3, 1946), 1, 2.

⁴⁶C. W. Butler, "The Ministry of Jesus," The Christian Witness, New Series LVII (June 1, 1939), 1.

essential point, it was the meeting of conditions.⁴⁷

Butler believed that the experience of holiness was not obtained by works or growth but by faith. The following propositions summarize what he meant here.

It is provided by the blood,
It is wrought by the Holy Spirit,
It is willed to us by the Father,
It is revealed to us by the written Word,
It is obtained by simple faith, and attested by the Holy Spirit,
It is therefore one part of essential salvation.⁴⁸

Butler reasoned that since it is a salvation blessing and obtainable by faith, there is no work or waiting that needs to be done. One can dedicate his all to God and believe immediately for the blessing.⁴⁹

Also, the "old man" cannot be worked to death nor starved to death. He is dealt with by an instantaneously wrought divine work through faith in Jesus Christ.⁵⁰

Finally, Butler believed it was obtainable now because God's Word revealed the provision for its covering of man's need with promises of immediate realization and many witnesses in the history of the church

⁴⁷C. W. Butler, "The Day of Pentecost," Pentecostal Herald, LXII (June 6, 1951), 3, 7.

⁴⁸C. W. Butler, "True Holiness," The Herald, LXIII (September 3, 1952), 3.

⁴⁹C. W. Butler, "God's Will for the Church," The Christian Witness, New Series LIV (May 7, 1936), 1.

⁵⁰C. W. Butler, "The Logic of True Holiness," The Christian Witness, New Series LII (May 10, 1934), 1, 8.

have witnessed to this fact.⁵¹

Holiness--a second crisis experience. Butler held that a second crisis was necessary for the obtainment of Christian holiness because it dealt with a part of the sin problem. He maintained that sin was of a twofold nature. The committed sins need pardon but there is a problem in the human breast which pardon cannot reach. This phase of the sin problem needs cleansing. Butler's own words concerning this are:

The grace of entire sanctification is for twice-born men, now styled believers in Jesus. For the believer it is parallel in many respects to the experience of the new birth for the sinner. For instance, it is a work of grace instantaneously wrought by God, the Holy Spirit. It is provided for by the atoning blood of our Lord Jesus Christ. It is obtained by faith. It deals with a phase of our sin problem. These facts afford us the foundation for classifying sanctification as one part of an uttermost salvation. They also afford us the logical foundation for referring to this work of grace as a second definite experience. In the first work of grace, the sins we have committed are forgiven. Their guilt is cancelled and their burden is lifted. In the second work of grace the sin which we inherited is purged and cleansed. Our moral natures are renewed in righteousness and true holiness after the image of Him who created us. The first gives us the peace of God by which our hearts and minds are kept in Jesus Christ. The first frees us from the captivity of Satan and the bondage of living in sin. The second purifies us, perfects us in love, and renews us in the moral likeness of God.⁵²

Butler went on to say that one need not tarry long but one needs to come a second time. In fact he urged that one enter in as

⁵¹C. W. Butler, "Holiness is Obtainable Now," The Christian Witness, New Series LVI (November 3, 1938), 1.

⁵²C. W. Butler, "God's Will for the Church," The Christian Witness, New Series LIV (April 30, 1936), 1.

soon as he sees his need.⁵³

Christian holiness or entire sanctification. Butler taught that the grace of entire sanctification is for those who have been born again. It deals with a phase of the sin problem which cannot be forgiven but needs purging and cleansing. It is the sin which mankind inherited that is dealt with.⁵⁴

The experience of justification and regeneration was entered by deep repentance and a stepping upon God's promises in faith. The grace of Christian holiness or entire sanctification is entered, according to Butler, by a perfect consecration. In repentance the rebellious will was surrendered. In consecration the highest use possible of this surrendered will is made.⁵⁵ Consecration involves a covenant of permanent obedience to the whole will of God. "It further involves a fixed moral attitude toward both God's will, and every question that arises in life."⁵⁶

A perfect consecration involves (1) a supreme moral choice, when a man by free choice determines to be wholly the Lord's; (2) "a covenant

⁵³C. W. Butler, "A Letter of Explanation," The Christian Witness, New Series LV (September 23, 1937), 1. Butler, "Holiness," ibid., New Series LIV (October 15, 1936), 1.

⁵⁴Ibid.

⁵⁵C. W. Butler, "A Perfect Consecration," The Christian Witness, New Series LIII (April 11, 1935), 8.

⁵⁶Ibid.

of permanent obedience to God."⁵⁷ "Consecration, according to Butler, is in its very nature an act of faith."⁵⁸

Consecration is an act of an individual determined by the choice of his will. Sanctification involves a divine act, something done in and for the individual who consecrates.⁵⁹

Having made a perfect consecration, the blessing of entire sanctification or the grace of Christian holiness is obtained by stepping on the promises and a look of faith to the Lamb of God.⁶⁰ This Butler spoke of again and again.

Sins committed are dealt with at justification. Entire sanctification deals with the second area of man's sin problem, the state or condition of sin.⁶¹ In entire sanctification there is a negative and a positive side to the experience. Negatively sin is destroyed, the temple is cleansed.⁶² Butler felt it was splendidly expressed in

⁵⁷C. W. Butler, "Consecration," The Christian Witness, New Series LVI (February 2, 1939), 1.

⁵⁸C. W. Butler, "A Perfect Consecration," The Christian Witness, New Series LIII (April 11, 1935), 8.

⁵⁹C. W. Butler, "Consecration versus Sanctification," The Christian Witness, New Series LIX (July 31, 1941), 1.

⁶⁰C. W. Butler, "The Truth Series," The Christian Witness, New Series LX (September 3, 1942), 1, 11. Butler, "Behold the Lamb," The Herald, LXVII (July 11, 1956), 11. Butler, "True Holiness," ibid., LXVIII (October 1, 1952), 3.

⁶¹C. W. Butler, "The Truth Series," The Christian Witness, New Series LX (September 17, 1942), 1.

⁶²C. W. Butler, "Holiness," The Herald, LXIX (June 4, 1958), 2.

Romans 6:22, "But now being made free from sin, and become servants to God, ye have your fruit unto holiness, and the end everlasting life."⁶³ The heart of man is delivered from that deep inner corruption. The phase of man's sin problem which cannot be forgiven is dealt with.⁶⁴ It is complete deliverance from the inbeing of sin.⁶⁵ It is deliverance from that indwelling sin called carnality.⁶⁶ It is the curing of the deep inner hurt of man's moral nature.⁶⁷ It removes all resentment and the strike-back attitude from man's heart.⁶⁸ It means freedom from the presence of jealousy, envy, strife and self seeking. In these places are placed humility, patience, longsuffering, zeal, faith, and courage for aggressive service.⁶⁹ Bad tempers, irritability, covetousness, pride and foolishness are remedied.⁷⁰ It is not humanity which is

⁶³C. W. Butler, "It is Written," The Christian Witness, New Series LXIII (March 22, 1945), 1.

⁶⁴C. W. Butler, "Like Precious Faith," The Christian Witness, New Series LIX (February 12, 1942), 1.

⁶⁵C. W. Butler, "Holiness," The Christian Witness, New Series LV (August 19, 1937), 1.

⁶⁶C. W. Butler, "Dangerous Deception," The Christian Witness, New Series LV (July 29, 1937), 1.

⁶⁷C. W. Butler, "A Balanced View of Sanctification," The Herald, LXIV (November 4, 1953), 3.

⁶⁸C. W. Butler, "Three Great Appointments of God," The Christian Witness, New Series LV (January 27, 1938), 1.

⁶⁹C. W. Butler, "A Life of Spiritual Good Health," The Christian Witness, New Series LII (July 19, 1934), 1.

⁷⁰C. W. Butler, "That Besetting Sin," The Herald, LXV (August 4, 1959), 2.

destroyed but the moral pollution dwelling within man's humanity.⁷¹

Butler taught that it deals with what Scripture refers to as "the sin that dwelleth in me," "the carnal mind," "the sin which doth so easily beset me," "the law of sin in my members," "our old man," "the law of sin and death," "the stony heart," and "the body of sin."⁷² It means the eradication of sin.⁷³

Some have argued that man cannot know the depths of sin, Butler believed that if human consciousness could be trusted to know anything, it could know when the heart was pure.⁷⁴

On the positive side, Butler said that man is made the possessor of imparted righteousness.⁷⁵ This "righteousness is a positive moral quality and condition which the Spirit imparts to the believer."⁷⁶ This righteousness becomes a new expression of the infinite righteousness of God by the route of recovered moral beings. They will stand out as an

⁷¹C. W. Butler, "It is Written," The Christian Witness, New Series LXIII (March 29, 1945), 1.

⁷²C. W. Butler, "The Truth Series," The Christian Witness, New Series LX (September 17, 1942), 1.

⁷³C. W. Butler, "Expositions of St. John, the 17th Chapter," The Christian Witness, New Series LII (November 22, 1934), 1, 8.

⁷⁴C. W. Butler, "Bible Perfection," The Christian Witness, New Series LXII (September 21, 1944), 2.

⁷⁵C. W. Butler, "Doctrinal Aspects of the Holiness Movement," The Herald, LXVII (November 7, 1956), 6.

⁷⁶C. W. Butler, "The Gift of Righteousness," The Christian Witness, New Series LIII (May 30, 1935), 9.

eternal justification of a holy God for His creating of man.⁷⁷ This righteousness involves a state of moral health in man's personality. Holiness means the moral recovery of man.⁷⁸ It is the renewing of the believer in the image of God in righteousness and true holiness. This is a moral miracle⁷⁹ and man becomes a partaker of the divine nature.⁸⁰

There is a revelation of the mystery hidden from ages and generations, "Christ in you, the hope of glory."⁸¹ The Spirit reveals the things spoken of in I Corinthians 2:9.⁸²

There is a deep moral and spiritual union with God. Butler taught that this is spoken of in John 17:17, 21, 23. This is not a union of essence with essence physically but a spiritual union analogous to the union which existed between Christ Jesus in His human nature and His Heavenly Father. Butler maintained that there is no loss of personality or accountability in this union. There is a uniting of the human

⁷⁷C. W. Butler, "Faith's Saving Power Depends Upon Our Renouncing of Sin," The Herald, LXVI (November 2, 1955), 2.

⁷⁸C. W. Butler, "It is Written," The Christian Witness, New Series LXIII (March 22, 1945), 1.

⁷⁹C. W. Butler, "Pentecost," The Christian Witness, New Series LXI (May 20, 1943), 1, 2.

⁸⁰C. W. Butler, "Like Precious Faith," The Christian Witness, New Series LIX (February 12, 1942), 1.

⁸¹C. W. Butler, "The Presence of God," Pentecostal Herald, LX (July 13, 1949), 3.

⁸²C. W. Butler, "Holiness," The Herald, LXIX (June 4, 1958), 2.

will with the divine will.⁸³

There is the happiness of love, of purity and of His pleasure. Butler quoted John Wesley that Christian perfection is nothing less than pure love.⁸⁴ This holiness imparts its nature to all that it does not destroy. It enables its possessor to form holy habits of thinking, speaking and doing.⁸⁵

This holiness does not make an individual independent of God but it establishes a relationship and condition where God is made the abiding sufficiency.⁸⁶ His presence becomes the source of inward empowering which enables an individual to live a sustained life of victory.⁸⁷

According to Butler, this experience of entire sanctification or Christian holiness deals with God's second imperative, "Follow peace with all men, and holiness (the sanctification) without which no man shall see the Lord."⁸⁸ This, too, was not just an arbitrary decree

⁸³C. W. Butler, "Dwelling in God," The Christian Witness, New Series LIX (July 24, 1941), 1, 8.

⁸⁴C. W. Butler, "It is Written," The Christian Witness, New Series LXIII (April 26, 1945), 1.

⁸⁵C. W. Butler, "The Value of Holiness," The Christian Witness, New Series LXVIII (January 30, 1941), 1.

⁸⁶C. W. Butler, "Two Divine Imperatives," The Herald, LXIX (December 2, 1959), 2.

⁸⁷C. W. Butler, "Holiness," The Christian Witness, New Series LV (August 19, 1937), 1.

⁸⁸C. W. Butler, "Stepping Heavenward," The Herald, LXVII (May 30, 1956), 6.

but a gracious provision.⁸⁹ Butler held that holiness was the only doctrine spoken of in the Bible as having a part in God's plan before the foundation of the world, Ephesians 1:4.⁹⁰

He insisted that this work is so thorough that it produces genuine witnesses unto Him.⁹¹

This constitutes what Butler taught concerning the negative and positive aspects of Christian holiness or entire sanctification. The following pages amplify what Butler meant by Christian holiness and also what he did not mean.

Eradication of sin. Butler recognized that there were three terms used by the theologians to represent God's dealing with original or birth sin; suppression, counteraction and eradication. Butler checked the dictionary meanings of these terms and then compared them with the Bible to see which word best described what the Bible spoke of. "Counteract" meant to act in opposition to; to frustrate by a contrary agency or influence. "Suppress" meant an instance of suppressing; state of being suppressed; as the suppression of an insurrection, of truth, and so forth. "Eradicate" meant to pluck up by the roots; to root up or out; hence to extirpate; as, to eradicate disease. Some

⁸⁹C. W. Butler, "Heart Talk on the Second Work of Grace," The Herald, LXV (March 3, 1954), 3.

⁹⁰C. W. Butler, "The Importance of Holiness," Pentecostal Herald, LXII (February 7, 1951), 7.

⁹¹C. W. Butler, "Ye Shall Receive Power," The Christian Witness, New Series LIII (November 7, 1935), 1.

synonyms for eradicate are: to abolish, destroy, annihilate. Scripture references which Butler used to determine what Scripture meant include Psalm 68:13; Isaiah 1:18, 25; Ezekiel 36:25-27; Malachi 3:2b, 3a; Romans 6:6, 22; 8:2; Ephesians 4:22 and I John 1:7. He added to these those Scriptures which spoke to him of sanctification as a definite divine work done in and for the believer. The Bible, according to Butler, also speaks of the "body of sin" being destroyed and the putting off of the "old man" and the putting on of the "new man" "which after God is created anew in righteousness and true holiness." From these references Butler concluded that the best term to describe what the Bible speaks of is eradication. In Scripture, some of the terms used would make sin sound as if it were a physical or material entity. Butler was very emphatic that sin was not a physical entity but it was and is a moral condition. He said that fever in the body was like the depravity in man's humanity. When the fever was removed it left the person normal. When depravity is removed man's humanity is free from sin. Eradication best expressed this for Butler although he claimed that this term was not a Biblical term.⁹²

In his discussion of eradication, Butler recognized that this was a rugged term and many were opposed to it because of wrong connotations. In delineating its meaning, Butler was quite emphatic that

⁹²C. W. Butler, "Eradication, Suppression, or Counteraction, Which?," The Christian Witness, New Series LVI (July 21, 1938), 1, 8. Butler, "Eradication, Suppression, or Counteraction, Which?," ibid., New Series LXVIII (September 26, 1940), 1, 8, 10.

eradication did not dehumanize a man's selfhood.⁹³ Depravity and humanity were and are not inseparably united. The depravity may be cleansed and man can keep his true humanity. Butler held that God does not destroy man's natural affections, tempers and desires. Man can be tempted, suffer being tempted and yet remain pure.⁹⁴

Butler believed that it would be a great calamity for an infinite God to undertake to save men from sin and then actually allow that man always had to have some on hand and could never be free from it. The most logical position for Butler was that God, when dealing with sin, would utterly destroy it, eradicate it.⁹⁵

Distinction between sanctification and holiness. Butler said that although these terms are frequently used synonymously, there is a distinction between them. "Sanctification is the act of God's grace whereby we are made holy. Holiness is the state or condition resultant upon the work of God in sanctifying us."⁹⁶

Christian perfection. Another term which Butler used to describe Christian holiness or entire sanctification was Christian perfection.

⁹³C. W. Butler, "A Balanced View of Sanctification," The Herald, LXIV (October 7, 1953), 3.

⁹⁴C. W. Butler, "Echoes From Chapel Talks at John Fletcher College," The Christian Witness, New Series LV (April 29, 1937), 1, 8.

⁹⁵C. W. Butler, "Holiness," The Christian Witness, New Series LXIII (September 27, 1945), 2.

⁹⁶C. W. Butler, "The Relative Position of Sanctification in the Plan of Salvation," The Christian Witness, New Series LII (December 20, 1934), 1.

It has been included in this discussion because of the confusion in some people's minds concerning the meaning of perfection. Butler made himself clear as to what he meant and also what he did not mean.

Butler taught that Christian perfection is an obtainable experience in this life. It is coming to adulthood. The baptism of the Holy Spirit accomplishes this in the lives of people. They put off their swaddling clothes of spiritual babyhood and put on the purity and strength of spiritual manhood. This experience does not exclude growth but removes the hindrances. Growth comes by the processes of discipline and experience in living and serving which requires a time element.⁹⁷

Christian perfection is not absolute perfection, according to Butler. This belongs to God alone.⁹⁸ It is not legal perfection although it harmonizes with the law by perfect attitudes toward the law and by being possessed of the spirit of the law. The only difference between Christian perfection and legal perfection is the mistakes which are possible because of limitations of knowledge or misinformation which may lead to a mistake in judgment and possibly in conduct. It is not angelic perfection nor is it human perfection such as Adam possessed prior to the fall. It is evangelical perfection. It is a state of freedom from sin and a perfection of love, a state of dwelling in Him

⁹⁷C. W. Butler, "Henceforth," The Christian Witness, New Series LV (October 28, 1937), 8.

⁹⁸C. W. Butler, "Walk Thou Before Me," The Christian Witness, New Series LXII (August 31, 1944), 1.

and He in the one perfected.⁹⁹ It is love fulfilling the law. This is the heart of evangelical perfection for which Butler stood.¹⁰⁰

Growth in grace. The first activity of holiness is to destroy all that is contrary to its very essence. There are some who believe that they can grow into this experience. Butler pointed out that there is a difference between growing into a state of grace and growth in grace once that state had been entered. He indicated that no one can grow into the grace of Christian holiness.¹⁰¹ Growth in grace does not cure sin nor does the cure of sin mature character, nor does it bring one to that place of maturity which involves the time element and is the result of living the life after one is purified.

Once the person has entered this grace of holiness by faith in the blood of the Lord Jesus, the second activity of holiness, according to Butler, is that it imparts its own moral quality to all that it does not destroy.¹⁰³ The sanctified person has been made pure and has

⁹⁹C. W. Butler, "Bible Perfection," The Christian Witness, New Series LXII (September 14, 1944), 1.

¹⁰⁰C. W. Butler, "Diamonds of Truth," Pentecostal Herald, LXI (January 5, 1949), 3, 7.

¹⁰¹C. W. Butler, "Progress in the Life of Christian Perfection," The Christian Witness, New Series LXII (December 14, 1944), 1.

¹⁰²C. W. Butler, "Purity and Growth," The Christian Witness, New Series LII (February 15, 1934), 8. Butler, "Purity and Growth," ibid., New Series LVI (September 29, 1938), 1.

¹⁰³C. W. Butler, "It is Written," The Christian Witness, New Series LXIII (April 5, 1945), 1.

entered a new state but he has just entered. There are areas of growth opened up for him. He now has the inward barriers for growth removed and he is now in the condition for normal development in the things of God.¹⁰⁴ Butler taught that II Peter 1:5-7 gives a list of things to be added in the Christian life. The idea is not for something new to be added but rather the increase of those ingredients which one already possesses.¹⁰⁵ Butler referred to John Wesley's distinction between perfect love and perfect light. Perfect love is an instantaneous blessing received by grace through faith when one has sensed his inward need. Light comes day by day as one studies the Word and faces the reality of daily living. Light is associated with knowledge and is therefore capable of ever increasing. This is the route of growth in grace and the building of holy character. When one who is fully saved receives new light, he should not cast away his confidence and become an altar seeker, was Butler's thinking, but he should adjust to the light, accept it gladly and obey it completely. He held that this is the secret of abiding and advancing in this grace.¹⁰⁶

Purity, according to Butler, is a blessing received instantaneously but maturity involves a time element and disciplinary processes.¹⁰⁷

¹⁰⁴C. W. Butler, "Progress in the Life of Christian Perfection," The Christian Witness, New Series LXII (December 14, 1944), 1.

¹⁰⁵C. W. Butler, "Like Precious Faith," The Christian Witness, New Series LIX (February 19, 1942), 1.

¹⁰⁶C. W. Butler, "Message to Young Christians," The Christian Witness, New Series LVII (March 9, 1939), 1.

¹⁰⁷C. W. Butler, "Perfection," The Herald, LXII (October 3, 1951), 3.

He maintained that this experience in grace is not a substitute for the study of the Scriptures, nor for daily communion with God, nor for the constant use of all means of grace, nor for the performance of Christian duty which is possible and which honors Christ and furthers His cause among men.¹⁰⁸

Butler noted that progress is often made by the route of great suffering. Trials and temptations met in the proper spirit of faith and submission build the fiber of holy character. A man who walks with God can form habits of holy living just as the man who walks with the devil will form habits of unholy living. This does not mean he will become independent of God but it means that his character will mature. He will form holy habits of thinking, feeling and choosing. He will form the habit of holy reactions, choices and living. There is no finality in this moral advancement but there is constant and eternal progress. Butler's idea was that the teaching in II Peter 1:5-7 is, that by applying these principles to one's faith in everyday living, there will be a growth in grace and an advancement in both the measure and power of all of these qualities. This builds for maturity here and glory hereafter.¹⁰⁹

Butler's teaching was that the experience of holiness is entered

¹⁰⁸C. W. Butler, "Progress in the Life of Christian Perfection," The Christian Witness, New Series LXII (December 14, 1944), 1.

¹⁰⁹C. W. Butler, "Like Precious Faith," The Christian Witness, New Series LIX (February 19, 1942), 1. Butler, "Progress in the Life of Christian Perfection," ibid., New Series LXII (December 14, 1944), 1, 2. Butler, "It is Written," ibid., New Series LXIV (April 5, 1945), 1.

by faith. It is retained by a continued meeting of God's conditions. The faith by which one receives this grace is an immediate gift provided by His infinite grace. Another phase of faith is that by which one walks and performs the service of life. This phase of faith is capable of increase by the experiences of everyday life. The one who walks by faith finds that it is an ever increasing commodity both in quantity and quality.¹¹⁰

A matter that is related to growth is that of attitude. Butler defined an attitude as the thinking of one's heart which has the consent of his will. He recognized that thoughts may come to one of which he does not approve, but these are not representative of his attitude. When the very best attitude is taken toward everything which one has to face, and, in harmony with that attitude, adjustments are made, it will create in the soul an atmosphere in which it is easy for faith to operate. This experience of faith will make it possible for the anchor to hold.¹¹¹ Butler taught that there is growth in the grace of Christian holiness but one cannot grow into this grace. He thought of growth as a necessity.

Infirmities, suffering and disease. The grace of holiness cleanses the heart from sin. Butler taught that, while it is true that

¹¹⁰C. W. Butler, "Faith as a Growth," The Christian Witness, New Series LV (May 20, 1937), 1. Butler, "Like Precious Faith," ibid., New Series LX (March 5, 1942), 1.

¹¹¹C. W. Butler, "Like Precious Faith," The Christian Witness, New Series LX (March 12, 1942), 1, 8.

all human beings have limitations and infirmities, these are wrongly called when they are called sins.¹¹² Holiness as an experience of the heart does not clear the human personality of infirmities and imperfections, but it does clear the soil of the heart of all evil. It clarifies the motive and furnishes a pure inward urge for everything that is good and Godlike. Perfection of mind and body are reserved for that part of the redemptive program when men will be raised to immortality and eternal life.¹¹³

Butler insisted that humanity and depravity are not one and the same. They are not inseparably united until death parts them. God created humanity but not depravity. Butler, therefore, insisted that it was not a sin to be human. Sin involves the volition of a free responsible being, but limitations and infirmities, inasmuch as they are not volitional in nature, are not to be referred to as sin. Butler did not contend for absolute or legal perfection as was noted earlier. He recognized that there could be a margin between what a man is in character and what he does in conduct. He further recognized the need of Christ's atonement for the covering of such faults which fail to measure up to the absolute perfection of the law. Yet, in this margin, he did not allow for any known sin or known faculty conduct. This

¹¹²C. W. Butler, "Victory in Jesus," *The Herald*, LXVIII (August 7, 1957), 2.

¹¹³C. W. Butler, "True Holiness," *The Christian Witness*, New Series LI (August 3, 1933), 1. Butler, "The Supreme Purpose of Redemption," *The Christian Witness*, New Series LIX (October 2, 1941), 1.

margin refers only to such sins of ignorance and shortcomings which would not stand the test of law yet are not out of harmony with purity and perfect love within. Lack of information or misinformation may be the occasion for a mistake in practice. Yet, this would not be sin, scripturally speaking. The evangelical perfection for which Butler contended recognizes that "love is the fulfilling of the law."¹¹⁴

Butler was quite emphatic in his teaching that sickness and disease are a part of the probationary plan in the world in which Christians live. They are not to be taken as direct judgments of God upon afflicted people. Christians are not to expect exemptions from these things because they belong to Him, but in the fact of these to find His all sufficient grace. One of two alternatives is to accept Satan's lie that if one were right with God this wouldn't happen. Acceptance of this mistake could lead to a loss of faith. The other alternative is to make these afflictions work for one's own good. One sure way to detect the man filled with the Spirit is the way he receives suffering.¹¹⁵ Butler spoke out in this area because of the confusion he found in the minds of many people.

Temptation. Butler taught that it must be recognized that there is no state in grace in which one is free from temptation. He said

¹¹⁴C. W. Butler, "Why Not Trust the Blood?," The Christian Witness, New Series LIV (July 23, 1936), 1, 8, 9.

¹¹⁵C. W. Butler, "Mistaken Notions," The Christian Witness, New Series LXIII (June 14, 1945), 1. Butler, "Our Common Heritage," The Herald, LXIII (March 15, 1952), 3. 7.

that the term temptation is used in Scripture in two ways. In one situation it means the testing of the individual's faith. In another situation it means the solicitation to evil. He held that in the first sense, God can tempt individuals but never in the second. Therefore, in the second instance, it must originate with Satan.¹¹⁶ Even the individuals who have entered into entire sanctification have the capabilities of being tempted. God made man with the possibility of being tempted and also the possibility of sinning. This capacity is amoral in its nature.¹¹⁷ These capacities are not destroyed by Christian holiness. There are several parallels between Christ and the person who is entirely sanctified, according to Butler. Christ was free from sin and so is the one who is entirely sanctified. His pure humanity was anointed by the Holy Spirit, the Holy Spirit is given to those who are sanctified. The Holy Spirit reveals the Father and the Son. Since the Holy Spirit is given in His fullness the sanctified one then has all the fullness of God. Jesus was tempted, He used the written Word to resist and overcome the tempter. The sanctified person can also use the Word of God through faith to overcome the world, the flesh and the devil.¹¹⁸

¹¹⁶C. W. Butler, "Holiness and Temptation," The Christian Witness, New Series LIV (January 23, 1936), 1.

¹¹⁷C. W. Butler, "Helps to Holy Living," The Christian Witness, New Series LIV (January 16, 1936), 1. Butler, "Holiness and Victorious Living," ibid., New Series LXII (March 23, 1944), 1.

¹¹⁸C. W. Butler, "Temptations of the Sanctified," The Christian Witness, New Series LVII (September 7, 1939), 1.

The cleansing from all sin does not dehumanize the individual. It is not always easy to discern between the impulses of one's humanity which could be temptation and the stirrings of carnality within. The one who has appropriated the merit of the cleansing blood and has come into a clear experience will be able to make the distinction.¹¹⁹

Butler taught that temptations generally originate in the form of thoughts. There is a difference between thoughts of evil being suggested to one from without and evil thinking possessing the mental processes from within. The sanctified heart will instantly resist these thoughts and bring them into the obedience of Christ. Men sin because they are wicked and because they are weak. The grace of full salvation deals with the sin within and gives inward power to resist the tempter.¹²⁰

The sanctified life is a life of faith. It is maintained by maintaining the life of faith. However, this is the central target of Satan's attacks. He attacks the individual's faith and the holding fast of that profession. He often appears as an angel of light magnifying the limitations and infirmities of the individual and seeks to precipitate self-condemnation. At other times, he uplifts some mistake and attempts to get the individual to cast away his confidence. Oftimes when the individual's feelings have run low because of manifold temptations, physical fatigue or exhausted nerve force, he suggests that

¹¹⁹Ibid.

¹²⁰C. W. Butler, "Holiness and Temptation," The Christian Witness, New Series LIV (January 23, 1936), 1.

the individual profess no higher than he feels or lives. He knows that soon the individual will only be living as high as he professed. He may even get the individual to cast away his confidence. This has been a direct attack upon the person's faith. Butler taught that the way to overcome under this attack is for the person to stick to his facts. It is not a question of feelings but settled facts. In one's profession he should profess his faith rather than his feelings. It takes the same kind and measure of faith to abide as it did to receive in the first place. The second proposition, according to Butler, is that the basis of a person's faith is the Word of God. Thirdly, the soundness and certainty of the promise of God is based upon His own faithfulness. The secret of overcoming is a perfect will attitude and a humble trust which will mean a quiet assurance which is the content of the witness of the Spirit.¹²¹

Butler said that what a man is at heart is the measure of his true self. The heart involves the total conscious self. Temptation comes as an appeal to one's inner self. There are dangerous inlets from the outer world to the inner self which remain as dangerous inlets to the natural and human self even after it is cleansed from all sin and indwelt by a holy God. Among such inlets are: (1) the love of money; (2) ambition for place or for the honor that a place brings; (3) natural affection; (4) sins of the spirit--pride, self-will; and (5) all forms

¹²¹C. W. Butler, "Our Profession of Faith," The Christian Witness, New Series LXIII (December 13, 1945), 1, 2. Butler, "Stepping in the Light," Pentecostal Herald, LX (June 1, 1949), 3. 7.

of selfishness. Butler insisted that the only effective equipment for these dangerous inlets is a pure heart, filled with divine love and indwelt by God Himself.¹²² Butler taught that Christian holiness does not cause temptations to cease but that it is the greatest protection one can have for the successful overcoming of these temptations.

Possibility of falling into sin. It has already been pointed out that Butler said God made man with a capacity wherein sin was a possibility. Yet, this capacity is amoral in its nature and does not involve a necessity to sin. This simply represents the possibility in the personality of a free moral agent. It has also been observed that there is no state of grace in this life which is not on probationary tenure. With this in mind, Butler noted that it is possible for a sanctified believer to once again fall into sin. In 1940, Butler gave three editorials for the reprinting of the chapter, "The Blessing May Be Lost" from Beverly Carradine's book, The Sanctified Life. (This book was instrumental in helping Butler into the experience of entire sanctification, particularly the chapter on, "The Loneliness of the Life.") Butler recognized the possibility of losing out after the individual has experienced this fullness in his heart. He also recognized that it is possible to lose heart purity without losing justification. This is true where there has been a leakage of love and a failure to abide in the gracious grace of holiness. Also, it is

¹²²C. W. Butler, "Dangerous Inlets," The Christian Witness, New Series LXIII (October 25, 1945), 1, 2.

possible to lose both places in grace and it is possible to be reestablished. What an individual has lost, that he must seek was Butler's teaching. He witnessed to the fact of having lost the blessing of holiness for several years but that he continued to maintain a justified experience. Later, he regained this experience and walked with God.¹²³

Butler recognized several ways by which one may fail of the grace of God. They are: carelessness, selfishness, foolishness, by little compromises, unfaithfulness to duty, by giving place to the devil in one's attitude toward others and by grieving the Holy Spirit even in small areas. Success requires careful living, watching unto prayer and prompt obedience to all the known will of God.¹²⁴

Besides the possibility of losing the grace of God, Butler recognized that it is possible for the person whose habitual practice is not to sin to be betrayed into an act of sin which does not represent his habit of life. He recognized that in Jesus there is a remedy, I John 2:1. Nevertheless, the course of life to be followed by the believer is that he does not continue in sin.¹²⁵

However, because of the deceitfulness of sin, the utmost watchfulness is essential to preserve every element of Christian experience

¹²³C. W. Butler, "The Blessing May Be Recovered," The Christian Witness, New Series LXVIII (June 20, 1940), 1, 2.

¹²⁴C. W. Butler, "Lessons From Hebrews," The Christian Witness, New Series LXVIII (June 20, 1940), 1, 2.

¹²⁵C. W. Butler, "True Holiness," The Herald, LXIII (November 5, 1952), 3.

from its inroads.¹²⁶

This comprises Butler's teaching concerning zone two of salvation. This was the great truth which he preached and which he gave himself so vigorously to propagate.

Zone Three of Salvation

Butler also referred to zone three of salvation as glorification. This zone is entered after one has successfully run the course of life. "In this final perfection, there is deliverance from all consequences of sin."¹²⁷ This zone deals with man's suffering and his mortality. There has been a perfect provision for his immortality. It is at this point that death is swallowed up in victory and man becomes truly immortalized. According to Butler, this includes salvation from pain, tears, sorrow and all the elements of decay. This hope consummates the redemption which Christ provided for man. In Butler's own words,

The redeemed and glorified saints will then be on a level where they may abide in the fellowship, association and the co-operation with an infinite God and move out into the eternals with all the possibilities wrapped up in their God-created self-hood for holy advances in the realm of knowledge, and co-operation with Him who both created originally and who has redeemed a believing people forever.¹²⁸

Butler held that man had been created a little lower than the

¹²⁶C. W. Butler, "Thorough Holiness," The Christian Witness, New Series LXII (March 9, 1944), 1.

¹²⁷C. W. Butler, "The Truth Series," The Christian Witness, New Series LX (October 1, 1942), 1.

¹²⁸C. W. Butler, "Easter Meditation Our Risen and Glorified Lord," The Christian Witness, New Series, LXIV (April 18, 1946), 1, 2.

angels but man is to be lifted so high that it is stated of him that he will judge angels. Thus, the perfection of the redemptive program includes the total of man's personality. Only this high objective was a sufficient motive for God to make the investment which He made.¹²⁹ Butler wrote only a small amount concerning this zone.

This is what Butler thought concerning the individual aspect of the restoring of holiness.

II. COLLECTIVELY

The church, according to Butler, is made up of those who are Christians. It consists of twice born men and women. They one time were of the world, they were members of the first Adam's race. They are still in the world but are now members of the second Adam's race. They are members of a new race with a new head. By a miraculous work of the Spirit, a man passes out from the world into the church. Butler said that the church means the called-out ones, the ecclesia of God. They are not of the world whether in the organized church or out.¹³⁰

The church is the body of Christ, He being its head.¹³¹ The mission of the church is not to reform society or build a new social

¹²⁹C. W. Butler, "The Truth Series," The Christian Witness, New Series LX (October 1, 1942), 1.

¹³⁰C. W. Butler, "Expositions of St. John, the 17th Chapter," The Christian Witness, New Series LII (October 4, 1934), 1, 8.

¹³¹C. W. Butler, "To Fulfill the Word of God," Pentecostal Herald, LX (November 2, 1949), 3.

order but to bring men face to face with God and their sin problem which can be settled on the basis of the Gospel of Christ.¹³²

The church triumphant will be made up of those out of every nation, kindred, tribe and tongue. The multitudes which have been, are and will be saved will make up the church triumphant. When the rest of the world order has gone into final wreckage the moral beings who embraced Christ and became children of God will inhabit the new heavens and earth. The mission of the church is to save men out of the wreckage of this present world order and get them prepared for the new Christian order.¹³³

Christianity, besides saving those who believe, establishes restraints and aids in the raising of standards among even those who reject Christ personally.¹³⁴

Butler did not write a great deal concerning the church or the restoring of the standard of holiness in group.

III. SUMMARY

This chapter presented Butler's position concerning the subjective aspects of salvation both individually and collectively. It presented His three zones of salvation experience. Zone one dealt with

¹³²C. W. Butler, "The Church and Proposed New World Order," The Christian Witness, New Series LXII (August 24, 1944), 1.

¹³³C. W. Butler, "The Dream of a New World," The Christian Witness, New Series LXIII (January 17, 1946), 1.

¹³⁴C. W. Butler, "The Advent of Our Lord," The Christian Witness, New Series LXII (December 21, 1944), 2.

the committed sins. Holiness was begun here. Zone two dealt with the inherited sinful nature. Holiness was made full here, the individual was established in Christian holiness. Butler taught that the climatic objective of the redemptive program centered in this experience of Christian holiness. Zone three dealt with the effects of sin which are not removed by grace in this life. Holiness was finished here. The church, according to Butler, is made up of those who have been born again, it has a savory influence even on men who reject Christ completely.

THE HOLINESS OF GOD IN LAST THINGS

CHAPTER VII

THE HOLINESS OF GOD IN LAST THINGS

The purpose of this chapter was to present Butler's position concerning last things. It was treated under these four divisions: Death and Immortality; the Second Coming; Resurrection and Judgment; and Final Consummation.

I. DEATH AND IMMORTALITY

Butler believed that when man sinned, he came under the death sentence; this was a threefold sentence. First, it was death in the spirit department of man's nature. Second, it was the death sentence for the physical body. Third, it was eternal death also called the second death.¹

Man is immortal; death does not end all, not even conscious existence. Butler gave the following as a definition of death, "Death does not mean annihilation, but separation from conditions and relationships which make existence worthy of the term life."²

The scriptural reference which Butler used in discussing the matter of death was Luke 16. He also said that Paul referred to a state of the dead as being with Christ immediately. He noted that the rich

¹C. W. Butler, "Eternal Life," The Herald, LXIII (April 2, 1952), 3.
Butler, "Man's Place in . . . God's Plan," ibid., LXVI (May 4, 1955), 2.

²C. W. Butler, "Eternal Life," The Herald, LXIII (April 2, 1952), 3.

man had conscious existence but it was in separation from God and from all that makes existence worth defining as life. Spiritual death is separation from God and all that is normal for man's true life or for the purpose he was created originally. If men continue in spiritual death till they meet physical death it will result in the second death or final separation from God.³

Man is immortal, his strongest desire is to continue to live. The question which ever recurs is, "If a man die shall he live again?" Man was not made for the things of time. He was built for eternity. Sin has marred this original purpose but it cannot destroy it.⁴

II. CHRIST'S SECOND COMING

Butler believed that this world was not through with Christ. He is coming again to reign as King. He is the Christ of coming judgment and of the new order of the future dispensation.⁵ He will

come again and take possession of the world he has purchased, and run the affairs of men as ruler and king for a sabbatical period of one thousand years.

That He is coming is as truly a doctrine of Scripture as that we need to be sanctified wholly in order to be ready for that event.⁶

³C. W. Butler, "Created or Uncreated Life, Which," The Christian Witness, New Series LXVIII (September 19, 1940), 1, 8.

⁴C. W. Butler, "Shall We Live Again," The Christian Witness, New Series LXVII (October 26, 1932), 1, 4, 5.

⁵C. W. Butler, "A True Christology," The Christian Witness, New Series LVII (October 5, 1939), 1.

⁶C. W. Butler, "The True Estimate of Christ," The Herald, LXIV (June 3, 1953), 3.

Butler held the position that Christ would appear in the clouds of the air to take the dead in Christ with Him to the marriage supper of the Lamb. Christ would return in this manner at the beginning of Antichrist's reign. At the close of Antichrist's reign, which lasts about seven years, Christ will return with His saints to the earth. Antichrist will be destroyed, Satan will be bound and the living nations of the earth will be judged. Christ will establish His reign of righteousness. Butler urged people to secure the wedding garment of perfected holiness and maintain a spotless garment to the end of their stay on earth.⁷

III. RESURRECTION AND JUDGMENT

This paper has treated the matter of the resurrection of Christ in an earlier chapter. In addition, Butler held that Christ's resurrection was a surety of the resurrection of the bodies of all men.⁸ Butler believed that Scripture taught there will be a universal resurrection both of the just and the unjust. The just will be raised to light, life and immortal glory with God. The unjust unto the judgment of death and eternal separation from God.⁹

⁷C. W. Butler, "The Day of the Lord," The Christian Witness, New Series LI (September 30, 1943), 1.

⁸C. W. Butler, "Easter Meditation Our Risen and Glorified Lord," The Christian Witness, New Series LXIV (April 18, 1946), 1.

⁹C. W. Butler, "Our Glorious Hope," The Christian Witness, New Series LII (March 29, 1934), 1.

One of the great appointments made by God is a judgment after death.¹⁰ At this judgment, God will require of moral creatures that which he provided at Calvary,¹¹ the standard which will measure moral values in that judgment will be holiness.¹²

IV. FINAL CONSUMMATION

Hell

Sin kindled the flames of hell and will furnish the fuel for those flames for everlasting burning.¹³ In his own words, Butler said:

Man in final separation from God will find himself in a state of hopeless despair and of eternal moral darkness, with nothing to satisfy the deep of his own nature. Hell will be eternal unrest, with no place for the sole of man's foot to rest for a single second. It will be despair without hope, and darkness without light, and sorrow without any alleviation of even temporary joy. It will be sin let loose on itself, without any of the mollifying influences of the presence of righteousness.¹⁴

His admonition was to secure the garment of pure holiness.

Heaven

Butler's works concerning the future place of the righteous were

¹⁰C. W. Butler, "Three Great Appointments of God," The Christian Witness, New Series LV (November 11, 1937), 1.

¹¹C. W. Butler, "A Holiness Manifesto" (Louisville, Kentucky: The Herald Press, n. d.), p. 108.

¹²C. W. Butler, "Faith-Building Messages," The Christian Witness, New Series LXVII (February 22, 1940), 1.

¹³C. W. Butler, "Holiness Desirable," The Christian Witness, New Series LIII (May 9, 1935), 1.

¹⁴C. W. Butler, "Faith-Building Messages," The Christian Witness, New Series LXVII (February 22, 1940), 1, 8.

brief.

Heaven represents to us eternal rest; not the rest of inactivity, but the rest of perfect harmony, the absence of all friction and care, the presence of fullness of joy. It will be light without darkness and joy unmingled with sorrow; yea, in the finality of redemption which includes the glorification of our humanity, we shall be prepared to actually see and live in the presence of and share the eternal felicity and glory of our infinite Redeemer.¹⁵

The necessity for entrance into heaven is to possess a moral quality which is like that moral quality which God possesses.¹⁶

The basis of reward is not success in service nor achievement in undertakings for God but faithfulness to God.¹⁷

V. SUMMARY

This chapter presented Butler's position concerning last things; Death and Immortality, the Second Coming, Resurrection and Judgment and the Final Consummation. His admonitions were that one should possess that holiness which God has provided, he then will be ready for that which is to come.

¹⁵C. W. Butler, "Faith-Building Messages," The Christian Witness, New Series LXVII (February 22, 1940), 8.

¹⁶Ibid., pp. 1, 8.

¹⁷C. W. Butler, "Faithfulness the Basis of Reward," The Christian Witness, New Series LX (October 15, 1942), 1.

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

CHAPTER VIII

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

I. SUMMARY

The problem of this paper was to investigate C. W. Butler's theology in order to: (1) ascertain the focal point of his theology, (2) set forth the effect this focal point had on the rest of his theology, and (3) systematize his theology in the light of that influence.

All of Butler's written works which were available to this writer were surveyed at least once. Those works which presented his theological position were examined more closely a second time and a third time. This enabled this writer to view the entirety of Butler's theological position and to see his strong emphases which stood out like towering mountain peaks. Once these "mountain peaks" were seen, this writer was able to systematize Butler's theology according to the emphasis Butler placed on the various mountain peaks.

Chapter II contained the first towering mountain. In this chapter, Butler's doctrine of God was discussed. The summit of this mountain was reached when Butler told his readers that God is holy. The holiness of God, for Butler, was not just one of God's several attributes but he said it was God's very nature, and that the other moral attributes spring from His nature.

The third chapter presented the manner in which Butler claimed that the holiness of God was manifested in creation. He believed that

God created two orders of morally responsible beings whose moral natures were like unto God's moral nature, i.e. angels and men. They were created holy and had the power to retain this holiness, making it their own by their choosing.

Chapter IV's mountain peak contained a dark and mysterious truth. From this mountain, Butler told his readers that part of the first order or morally responsible beings and the entirety of the second order did not keep their original holiness. In each group those who rebelled replaced God's will with their self-will and in doing this, they lost the holiness with which they were endowed at creation.

Butler's position concerning God's recovery program was presented in Chapter V. This chapter dealt with the objective side of redemption as Butler understood it. Christ, the eternal Son of God, offered Himself as a sacrificial lamb to God to make atonement for human sin. This atonement was of such a nature that God could be just and justify the sinner. The provision made at Calvary also provided that man could be restored to that state of holiness from which he fell in the garden. The Holy Spirit has been sent by the Father and the Son to make real, in the lives of those who allow Him, the provisions Christ made at Calvary.

The subjective side of salvation, as Butler taught it, was presented in Chapter VI. This mountain of truth contained Butler's three zones of salvation experience. Zone one, which includes justification and regeneration, was the beginning of the restoration of holiness in man. Zone two Butler called Christian holiness. This is the zone where, according to Butler, the individual is restored to that state

of holiness from which man fell in the garden. If the individual remains true to God the rest of his life, upon death he will enter the third zone of salvation. In this zone all the effects of sin are removed and the individual can grow in holiness forever.

Chapter VII presented Butler's doctrine of last things. This mountain of truth is more vague than any of the others, he wrote comparatively little about last things. The truth, however, which glistens from this distant mountain is that men need holiness to be ready for these things. God will require at that time that which His Son provided at Calvary.

II. CONCLUSIONS

1. The focal point of Butler's theology was his teaching that God is an infinitely holy being who requires holiness of morally responsible beings.
2. This focal point influenced the entirety of his theology making it possible to systematize his works in the light of that influence.
3. Butler's emphasis on the holiness of God kept him from the concept of a God who is a sentimental rubber stamper of men's activities.
4. Butler's emphasis on the holiness of God kept him from a cheap concept of sin.
5. Butler's emphasis on the holiness of God helped him to have a high concept of the atonement of Christ.
6. Butler's emphasis on the holiness of God helped him to give proper credence to the person and work of the Holy Spirit.

7. Butler's emphasis on the holiness of God helped him to emphasize the importance and necessity of the second work of grace which he called Christian holiness.

8. The written record of Butler's theology was weak in the following areas: preliminary stages of grace, doctrine of the church and doctrine of last things.

9. If Butler was acquainted with the original languages it was not obvious in his writings. If he had known these, he could have built a stronger Biblical argument.

III. SUGGESTIONS FOR FURTHER STUDY

1. The personal and social ethics of the Holiness movement would be profitable for study.

2. A comparison of Butler with John Wesley or Joseph H. Smith could be an interesting study also.

APPENDIX

APPENDIX A

BIOGRAPHY OF C. W. BUTLER

Charles William Butler was born May 13, 1872 and died April 17, 1960. At his home going he was almost eighty-eight years old. He was born in Caro, Tuscola County, Michigan, and died in Portland, Oregon. He was called to preach at the age of seventeen and was licensed to preach by the Detroit Conference of the Methodist Church while he was yet in his teens. While he pastored a church in Detroit, Michigan, his church knew a five year revival. He spent forty years as a camp meeting speaker. He was president of Cleveland Bible Institute for fifteen years. While he was there he taught pastoral theology, systematic theology and homiletics. Following this, he was president of John Fletcher College for another ten years. He served as editor of The Christian Witness for thirteen years. He contributed articles, which appeared monthly, to the Pentecostal Herald and The Herald for an additional thirteen years. He was president of the National Holiness Association for fourteen years. He was the founder of Michigan Holiness Association and served as its president for forty-eight years. In January, 1960, the Butler-Valade Chair of Biblical Theology was named in the honor of Mr. C. C. Valade, a layman, and Dr. C. W. Butler, at Asbury Theological Seminary.¹

¹J. C. McPheeters, "The Home Going of Dr. C. W. Butler," The Herald, LXXI (May 4, 1960), 8, 17.

Dr. Butler witnessed to the fact that he knew the experience of Christian holiness in his own heart and life.²

²C. W. Butler, "The Believers Relation to Holiness," The Christian Witness, New Series LII (December 13, 1934), 1, 8.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

BIBLIOGRAPHY

I. PRIMARY SOURCES

Books

Butler, C. W. A Holiness Manifesto. Louisville, Kentucky: The Herald Press, n. d.

_____. Faith-Building Messages. University Park, Iowa: The College Press, n. d.

Engstrom, Theodore W. (ed.). Victorious and Fruitful Living. Grand Rapids, Michigan: Zondervan Publishing House, 1942.

Periodicals*

Butler, C. W. "The Supreme Purpose of Redemption," The Christian Witness, New Series LX (January 9, 1930), 1-3, 5.

_____. "Faith vs. the Work and Witness of the Spirit," ibid., New Series L (March 17, 1932), 2-4.

_____. "A United Heart," ibid., New Series LI (July 13, 1933), 1, 8.

_____. Ibid., (July 20, 1933), 1, 8.

_____. "The Dignity of the Human Will," ibid., (July 27, 1933), 1.

_____. "True Holiness," ibid., (August 3, 1933), 1.

_____. "A True Christology," ibid., (September 21, 1933), 1, 8.

_____. Ibid., (September 28, 1933), 1.

_____. Ibid., (October 5, 1933), 1.

_____. "The Relation of Holiness to a True Christology," ibid., (October 12, 1933), 1.

*The periodicals have been entered in chronological order rather than in alphabetical order. The volume numbers of The Christian Witness, Pentecostal Herald and The Herald have been recorded as they appeared on the paper. It will be obvious that mistakes had been made by their publishers. There has been no attempt to show the correct volume number.

- _____. "Holiness Possible," ibid., (November 23, 1933), 1.
- _____. "Helps to Holiness," ibid., New Series LII (February 15, 1934),
1.
- _____. "Purity and Growth," ibid., 1, 8.
- _____. "Miracle in the Realm of Moral Government," ibid., (March 15,
1934), 1.
- _____. "Our Glorious Hope," ibid., (March 29, 1934), 1, 8.
- _____. "Should We Discard Truth Because of Imitators?," ibid.,
(May 3, 1934), 1.
- _____. "The Logic of True Holiness," ibid., (May 10, 1934), 1, 8.
- _____. "The Proving of Faith," ibid., (May 24, 1934), 1, 8.
- _____. "The Intolerance of Love," ibid., (June 28, 1934), 1.
- _____. "A Life of Spiritual Good Health," ibid., (July 19, 1934), 1.
- _____. "A Divinely Centered Life," ibid., (July 19, 1934), 1, 8.
- _____. "The Single Standard Life," ibid., (July 26, 1934), 1, 8.
- _____. "The Attitude of Faith," ibid., (August 30, 1934), 1, 8.
- _____. "Expositions of St. John, the 17th Chapter," ibid.,
(September 20, 1934), 1, 8.
- _____. Ibid., (September 27, 1934), 1, 8.
- _____. Ibid., (October 4, 1934), 1, 8.
- _____. Ibid., (October 11, 1934), 1.
- _____. Ibid., (October 18, 1934), 1.
- _____. Ibid., (October 25, 1934), 1.
- _____. Ibid., (November 1, 1934), 1, 8.
- _____. Ibid., (November 8, 1934), 1, 8.
- _____. Ibid., (November 22, 1934), 1, 8.
- _____. Ibid., (November 29, 1934), 1, 8.

- _____. Ibid., (December 6, 1934), 1, 8.
- _____. "The Believers Relation to Holiness," ibid., (December 13, 1934), 1, 8.
- _____. "The Relative Position of Sanctification in the Plan of Salvation," ibid., (December 20, 1934), 1, 8.
- _____. "Spiritual Inventory," ibid., New Series LIII (January 10, 1935), 1, 8.
- _____. "A Perfect Consecration," ibid., (April 11, 1935), 1, 8.
- _____. "Holiness Desirable," ibid., (May 9, 1935), 1.
- _____. "The Nature of True Holiness," ibid., (May 16, 1935), 1.
- _____. "Short Talks on Sound Doctrine," ibid., (May 30, 1935), 1.
- _____. "The Gift of Righteousness," ibid., (May 30, 1935), 1, 9.
- _____. "Salvation by Faith," ibid., (July 11, 1935), 1, 8.
- _____. Ibid., (July 18, 1935), 1, 8.
- _____. "Evolution as a Theory, or the Bible as a Tried Authority--Which?," ibid., (September 5, 1935), 1, 8.
- _____. "The Wealth of the Christian," ibid., New Series LIII (October 24, 1935), 1.
- _____. "Ye Shall Receive Power," ibid., (November 7, 1935), 1, 8.
- _____. "Christmas," ibid., (December 19, 1935), 1, 9.
- _____. "Helps to Holy Living," ibid., New Series LIV (January 9, 1936), 1.
- _____. Ibid., (January 16, 1936), 1, 8.
- _____. "Holiness and Temptation," ibid., (January 23, 1936), 1, 8.
- _____. "Pentecost," ibid., (February 13, 1936), 1.
- _____. "Bible Study Number One," ibid., (March 5, 1936), 1.
- _____. Ibid., (March 12, 1936), 1.
- _____. "The Sovereign Will of God," ibid., (March 19, 1936), 1, 8.

- _____. "God's Redemptive Will," ibid., (March 26, 1936), 1.
- _____. "The Will of God," ibid., (April 2, 1936), 1.
- _____. Ibid., (April 9, 1936), 1, 8.
- _____. "The Will of God for the World," ibid., (April 16, 1936), 1.
- _____. "God's Will for the Church," ibid., (April 30, 1936), 1, 8.
- _____. Ibid., (May 7, 1936), 1, 8.
- _____. Ibid., (May 14, 1936), 1.
- _____. "A Note on True Repentance," ibid., (May 21, 1936), 1.
- _____. "It is Written," ibid., (June 11, 1936), 1.
- _____. "Fruitless Seeking, of How to Miss the Blessing," ibid.,
(July 2, 1936), 1.
- _____. "Why Not Trust the Blood," ibid., (July 23, 1936), 1, 8, 9.
- _____. "Justification by Faith," ibid., (July 30, 1936), 1.
- _____. "The Christian Philosophy of Life or the True Estimate of
Human Worth," ibid., (August 13, 1936), 1, 9.
- _____. "A Pure Mind," ibid., (August 27, 1936), 1.
- _____. "Be Ye Holy, For I Am Holy," ibid., (September 17, 1936), 1.
- _____. Ibid., (September 24, 1936), 1.
- _____. Ibid., (October 1, 1936), 1.
- _____. "Holiness," ibid., (October 15, 1936), 1, 8.
- _____. Ibid., (October 22, 1936), 1, 8, 9.
- _____. Ibid., (October 29, 1936), 1, 8.
- _____. "Holiness in Prophecy," ibid., (December 10, 1936), 1.
- _____. "The Gift of God," ibid., (December 24, 1936), 1.
- _____. "The Question of Immortality," ibid., (January 28, 1937), 1.
- _____. "The Living Christ," ibid., New Series LV (March 25, 1937), 1.

- _____. "Truth for the Times," ibid., (April 15, 1937), 1, 8.
- _____. "Errors Which Need Correcting," ibid., (April 22, 1937), 1, 8,
9.
- _____. "God's Minorities," ibid., (May 6, 1937), 1, 13.
- _____. "The Gift of Faith," ibid., (May 13, 1937), 1.
- _____. "Faith as a Growth," ibid., (May 20, 1937), 1.
- _____. "Dangerous Deception," ibid., (July 22, 1937), 1.
- _____. Ibid., (July 29, 1937), 1.
- _____. "Holiness," ibid., (August 19, 1937), 1.
- _____. "Law, A Friend of Righteousness," ibid., (August 19, 1937), 1.
- _____. "Helps to Entering the Sanctified Life," ibid., (September 9,
1937), 1.
- _____. "Lightening the Ship," ibid., (September 16, 1937), 1.
- _____. "A Letter of Explanation," ibid., (September 23, 1937), 1, 9.
- _____. "The Challenge of Holiness Education," ibid., (September 30,
1937), 1, 8.
- _____. Ibid., (October 14, 1937), 1.
- _____. "Henceforth," ibid., (October 28, 1937), 1, 8, 9.
- _____. "Three Great Appointments of God," ibid., (November 11, 1937),
1, 8.
- _____. "Christmas Message," ibid., (December 16, 1937), 1, 8.
- _____. "Three Great Appointments of God," ibid., (January 27, 1938),
1, 8.
- _____. "The Law Made Spiritual," ibid., New Series LVI (March 3, 1938),
1, 8.
- _____. "Holiness," ibid., (March 10, 1938), 1, 8.
- _____. "The Sprinkled Blood," ibid., (March 24, 1938), 1, 9.

- _____. "Sound Doctrine," ibid., (April 21, 1938), 1.
- _____. "Enduring Values," ibid., (April 28, 1938), 1.
- _____. "Sound Doctrine," ibid., (May 5, 1938), 1.
- _____. Ibid., (May 12, 1938), 1, 8.
- _____. "Helps to Abiding," ibid., (May 19, 1938), 1.
- _____. "Offices of the Holy Spirit," ibid.
- _____. "Sound Doctrine," ibid., (June 2, 1938), 1.
- _____. Ibid., (June 9, 1938), 1, 8.
- _____. Ibid., (June 16, 1938), 1, 8.
- _____. Ibid., (June 23, 1938), 1.
- _____. Ibid., (July 7, 1938), 1.
- _____. "The Ministry of the Holy Spirit," ibid., (July 7, 1938), 1.
- _____. "The Manifestations of the Spirit," ibid., (July 14, 1938), 1.
- _____. "Eradication, Suppression, or Counteraction, Which?," ibid.,
(July 21, 1938), 1, 8.
- _____. "Purity and Growth," ibid., (September 29, 1938), 1.
- _____. "Created or Uncreated Life, Which?," ibid., (October 13, 1938),
1, 8, 9.
- _____. "Holiness a Possibility," ibid., (October 20, 1938), 1.
- _____. "Holiness Desirable," ibid., 1, 9.
- _____. "Holiness is Obtainable Now," ibid., (November 3, 1938), 1, 8.
- _____. "Holiness and Its Alternative," ibid., (November 24, 1938), 1.
- _____. "Deepening Our Spiritual Life," ibid., (December 1, 1938), 1.
- _____. "Question Editorial," ibid., (January 26, 1939), 1, 8.
- _____. "Consecration," ibid., (February 2, 1939), 1.

- _____. "A Message to Young Christians," ibid., New Series LVII
(March 9, 1939), 1.
- _____. "A Message to Believers," ibid., (March 9, 1939), 1, 8.
- _____. "God's Emancipation Proclamation," ibid., (March 23, 1939), 1,
8.
- _____. "The Goodness of God," ibid., (March 30, 1939), 1.
- _____. "The Tragedy of the Present Drift in the Religious World,"
ibid., (April 6, 1939), 1, 8, 9.
- _____. "Sin Enslaves," ibid., (April 20, 1939), 1.
- _____. "The Ministry of Jesus," ibid., (May 25, 1939), 1, 8.
- _____. Ibid., (June 1, 1939), 1, 8.
- _____. "Lessons From Hebrews," ibid., (June 8, 1939), 1.
- _____. Ibid., (June 15, 1939), 1.
- _____. "Our Need of the Holy Spirit," ibid., (July 6, 1939), 1.
- _____. "The Superlative in Scripture," ibid., (August 3, 1939), 1.
- _____. "Holiness," ibid., (August 10, 1939), 1.
- _____. "Temptations, Their Use and How to Meet Them," ibid.,
(August 31, 1939), 1, 8, 9.
- _____. "Temptations of the Sanctified," ibid., (September 7, 1939), 1.
- _____. "Helps to Abiding," ibid., (September 7, 1939), 1, 8.
- _____. Ibid., (September 14, 1939), 1.
- _____. "Heart Talk on Guidance," ibid., (September 28, 1939), 1, 8.
- _____. "Divine Guidance," ibid., New Series LXVII (October 5, 1939),
1, 8.
- _____. "Shall We Live Again?," ibid., (October 26, 1939), 1, 4, 5.
- _____. "Let the Word Speak," ibid., (November 2, 1939), 1, 7.
- _____. "Sin in Our Nature," ibid., (November 23, 1939), 1, 2.

- _____. "Faith-Building Messages," ibid., (January 4, 1940), 1, 2, 4, 8.
- _____. Ibid., (January 11, 1940), 1, 2.
- _____. Ibid., (January 18, 1940), 1, 2, 4.
- _____. Ibid., (January 25, 1940), 1, 2, 4, 10.
- _____. Ibid., (February 1, 1940), 1, 2, 4, 8.
- _____. Ibid., (February 8, 1940), 1, 2, 4.
- _____. Ibid., (February 15, 1940), 1, 2, 4, 8.
- _____. Ibid., (February 22, 1940), 1, 8.
- _____. "The Christian Philosophy of Life," ibid., New Series LXVIII
(March 28, 1940), 1, 8.
- _____. "The Blessing May Be Recovered," ibid., (June 20, 1940), 1, 2.
- _____. "Biblical Mysteries," ibid., (July 4, 1940), 1, 8.
- _____. "Knowing His Will," ibid., (August 1, 1940), 1, 8, 10.
- _____. "Christian Perfection," ibid., (August 15, 1940), 1, 8.
- _____. Ibid., (August 22, 1940), 1, 8.
- _____. Ibid., (September 5, 1940), 1, 12.
- _____. "Eradication, Suppression, or Counteraction, Which?," ibid.,
(September 26, 1940), 1, 8, 10.
- _____. "Holiness," ibid., (November 14, 1940), 1.
- _____. "Utterly Destroy," ibid., (December 5, 1940), 1, 11.
- _____. "The Value of Holiness," ibid., (January 30, 1941), 1.
- _____. "It is Written," ibid., (February 13, 1941), 1, 12.
- _____. "An Explanation of--and a Testimony to--Holiness," ibid.,
(February 20, 1941), 1, 12.
- _____. "The Law of Faith," ibid., New Series LIX (March 13, 1941),
1, 8.
- _____. "The Messiahship of Christ," ibid., (March 27, 1941), 1, 11.

- _____. Ibid., (April 3, 1941), 1, 6.
- _____. "He is Risen," ibid., (April 10, 1941), 1, 8.
- _____. "What Does It Mean?," ibid., (April 17, 1941), 1, 11.
- _____. "Holiness," ibid., (May 15, 1941), 1, 8.
- _____. Ibid., (May 22, 1941), 1, 8.
- _____. Ibid., (May 29, 1941), 1, 8.
- _____. "Our Need of the Holy Spirit," ibid., (June 12, 1941), 1, 12.
- _____. "Dwelling in God," ibid., (July 24, 1941), 1, 8.
- _____. "Consecration versus Sanctification," ibid., (July 31, 1941),
1.
- _____. "The Word of God and Faith," ibid., (August 21, 1941), 1, 11,
12.
- _____. "Christ Jesus Whom God Hath Set Forth," ibid., (August 28,
1941), 1, 8.
- _____. Ibid., (September 4, 1941), 1, 13.
- _____. "The Supreme Purpose of Redemption," ibid., (September 11,
1941), 1, 8.
- _____. Ibid., (September 18, 1941), 1, 8.
- _____. Ibid., (September 25, 1941), 1, 8.
- _____. Ibid., (October 2, 1941), 1, 8.
- _____. "The Christian View of Man," ibid., (November 27, 1941), 1, 8.
- _____. "The Separation of Believers," ibid., (December 11, 1941), 1,
8.
- _____. "Decision Day Values and Fallacies," ibid., (December 11, 1941),
1, 8.
- _____. "I Know in Part," ibid., (January 1, 1942), 8, 10.
- _____. "Like Precious Faith," ibid., (January 15, 1942), 1, 8.
- _____. Ibid., (January 29, 1942), 1, 8.

- _____. Ibid., (February 12, 1942), 1, 8.
- _____. Ibid., (February 19, 1942), 1, 8.
- _____. Ibid., New Series LX (March 5, 1942), 1.
- _____. Ibid., (March 12, 1942), 1, 8.
- _____. Ibid., (March 26, 1942), 1, 8.
- _____. "Easter Morning," ibid., (April 2, 1942), 1, 12.
- _____. "The Will of God," ibid., (April 23, 1942), 1.
- _____. "The Truth Series," ibid., (May 7, 1942), 1, 8.
- _____. Ibid., (July 9, 1942), 1, 8.
- _____. "The Test of Love," ibid., (July 23, 1942), 1, 12.
- _____. "Christ Our Example," ibid., (August 6, 1942), 1, 12.
- _____. "The Truth Series," ibid., (August 20, 1942), 1, 3.
- _____. Ibid., (August 27, 1942), 1, 14.
- _____. Ibid., (September 3, 1942), 1, 11, 14.
- _____. Ibid., (September 10, 1942), 1, 12.
- _____. Ibid., (September 17, 1942), 1, 12.
- _____. Ibid., (September 24, 1942), 1, 12.
- _____. Ibid., (October 1, 1942), 1, 12.
- _____. "Faithfulness the Basis of Reward," ibid., (October 15, 1942),
1, 12.
- _____. "Feelings versus Faith and Principle," ibid., (October 29,
1942), 1, 13.
- _____. "God is Sovereign," ibid., (December 3, 1942), 1, 12.
- _____. "But We See Jesus," ibid., (December 10, 1942), 1, 12.
- _____. "Christmas," ibid., (December 24, 1942), 1, 13.
- _____. "New Year's Message," ibid., (January 7, 1943), 1, 13.

- _____. "Savorless Christians," ibid., (January 7, 1943), 1, 13.
- _____. "Walk Worthy of God," ibid., (January 21, 1943), 1, 2.
- _____. "Truth Series," ibid., (January 28, 1943), 1, 2.
- _____. Ibid., (February 4, 1943), 1, 2.
- _____. Ibid., (February 11, 1943), 1, 2.
- _____. "Holiness and the Desired Revival," ibid., New Series LXI
(March 4, 1943), 1, 2.
- _____. "Evidences of Christianhood," ibid., (March 11, 1943), 1, 2.
- _____. "Truth Series," ibid., (March 18, 1943), 1, 2.
- _____. Ibid., (March 25, 1943), 1, 2.
- _____. Ibid., (April 1, 1943), 1, 2.
- _____. Ibid., (April 8, 1943), 1, 2.
- _____. "The Sufferings of Christ," ibid., (April 15, 1943), 1, 2.
- _____. "Tampering With the Label," ibid., (April 29, 1943), 1, 2.
- _____. "Pentecost," ibid., (May 6, 1943), 1, 2.
- _____. Ibid., (May 13, 1943), 1, 2.
- _____. Ibid., (May 20, 1943), 1, 2.
- _____. Ibid., (May 27, 1943), 1, 2.
- _____. Ibid., (June 3, 1943), 1.
- _____. Ibid., (June 10, 1943), 1, 2.
- _____. "Why the Opposition to Sanctification," ibid., (June 17, 1943),
1, 2.
- _____. "Meditations on Romans 7 and 8," ibid., (July 1, 1943), 1, 2.
- _____. Ibid., (July 8, 1943), 1.
- _____. Ibid., (July 15, 1943), 1, 2.

- _____. "The Spirit of Christ," ibid., (July 22, 1943), 1, 2.
- _____. Ibid., (July 29, 1943), 1, 2.
- _____. "His Holiness," ibid., (August 12, 1943), 1.
- _____. "So Shall My Word Be," ibid., (August 26, 1943), 1, 2.
- _____. Ibid., (September 2, 1943), 1, 2.
- _____. "Reputation vs. Character," ibid., (September 9, 1943), 1.
- _____. "The Day of the Lord," ibid., (September 23, 1943), 1, 2.
- _____. Ibid., (September 30, 1943), 1, 2.
- _____. "A God-Centered Life," ibid., (October 14, 1943), 1, 2.
- _____. "Success," ibid., (November 11, 1943), 1, 2.
- _____. "An Exalted God," ibid., (January 6, 1944), 1, 2.
- _____. "Do You Believe the Return of Our Lord is Near at Hand?," ibid., (January 27, 1944), 1, 2.
- _____. "Thorough Holiness," ibid., New Series LXII (March 9, 1944), 1, 2.
- _____. "Advantages of Holiness," ibid., (March 16, 1944), 1, 2.
- _____. "Holiness and Victorious Living," ibid., (March 23, 1944), 1, 2.
- _____. "Holiness and Tests," ibid., (March 30, 1944), 1, 2.
- _____. "Christ Pre-eminent," ibid., (April 13, 1944), 1, 2.
- _____. Ibid., (April 20, 1944), 1, 2.
- _____. Ibid., (April 27, 1944), 1, 2.
- _____. "The Spirit Also Helpeth Our Infirmities," ibid., (May 11, 1944), 1, 2.
- _____. "A Sovereign God and His Chosen Leaders," ibid., (August 10, 1944), 1, 2.
- _____. "The Church and the Proposed New World Order," ibid., (August 24, 1944), 1, 2.

- _____. "Walk Thou Before Me," ibid., (August 31, 1941), 1, 2.
- _____. "Bible Perfection," ibid., (September 7, 1944), 1, 2.
- _____. Ibid., (September 14, 1944), 1, 2.
- _____. Ibid., (September 21, 1944), 1, 2.
- _____. Ibid., (September 28, 1944), 1, 2.
- _____. Ibid., (October 12, 1944), 1, 2.
- _____. "The Promise of Cleansing," ibid., (November 30, 1944), 1, 2.
- _____. "Progress in the Life of Christian Perfection," ibid.,
(December 14, 1944), 1, 2.
- _____. "The Advent of Our Lord," ibid., (December 21, 1944), 1, 2.
- _____. "It is Written," ibid., (February 8, 1945), 1.
- _____. Ibid., (February 15, 1945), 1.
- _____. Ibid., New Series LXIII (March 1, 1945), 1.
- _____. Ibid., (March 8, 1945), 1.
- _____. Ibid., (March 15, 1945), 1.
- _____. Ibid., (March 22, 1945), 1.
- _____. Ibid., (March 29, 1945), 1.
- _____. "Our Conquering Christ," ibid., 1, 2.
- _____. "Intolerance," ibid., (April 5, 1945), 1, 2.
- _____. "It is Written," ibid., 1.
- _____. Ibid., (April 12, 1945), 1.
- _____. Ibid., (April 19, 1945), 1.
- _____. Ibid., (April 26, 1945), 1.
- _____. Ibid., (May 3, 1945), 1.
- _____. "Mistaken Notions," ibid., (June 14, 1945), 1, 2.

- _____. "Encouragement for the Saints," ibid., (June 21, 1945), 1, 2.
- _____. "The Necessity of Holiness," ibid., (June 28, 1945), 1, 2.
- _____. "Attitudes," ibid., (July 5, 1945), 1, 2.
- _____. "The Attitude of Faith," ibid., (July 12, 1945), 1, 2.
- _____. "Mountain-peak Experiences," ibid., (August 9, 1945), 1, 2.
- _____. Ibid., (August 16, 1945), 1, 2.
- _____. Ibid., (August 23, 1945), 1, 2.
- _____. "Holiness," ibid., (September 27, 1945), 1, 2, 4.
- _____. "Holiness Without Which No Man Shall See the Lord," ibid.,
(October 11, 1945), 1, 2.
- _____. "Dangerous Inlets," ibid., (October 25, 1945), 1, 2.
- _____. "Our Profession of Faith," ibid., (December 13, 1945), 1, 2.
- _____. "A Unique Event," ibid., (December 20, 1945), 1, 2.
- _____. "The Dream of a New World," ibid., (January 3, 1946), 1, 2.
- _____. Ibid., (January 17, 1946), 1, 2.
- _____. "The Relation of the New Birth to Holiness and Heaven," ibid.,
(January 31, 1946), 1, 2.
- _____. "True Holiness," ibid., (February 7, 1946), 1, 2.
- _____. Ibid., (February 14, 1946), 1, 2.
- _____. Ibid., (February 21, 1946), 1, 2.
- _____. "Different Prayer Zones," ibid., New Series LXIV (March 21,
1946), 1, 2.
- _____. Ibid., (March 28, 1946), 1, 2.
- _____. Ibid., (April 4, 1946), 1, 2.
- _____. Ibid., (April 11, 1946), 1, 2.
- _____. "Easter Meditation Our Risen and Glorified Lord," ibid.,
(April 18, 1946), 1, 2.

- _____. "A Right Approach to the Word of God," ibid., (May 16, 1946), 1, 2.
- _____. Ibid., (May 23, 1946), 1, 2.
- _____. "The Sacred Flame," ibid., (June 13, 1946), 1, 2.
- _____. "A Sovereign God and His Chosen Leaders," ibid., (June 27, 1946), 1, 2.
- _____. "God's Remedy for Man's Ill," ibid., (July 4, 1946), 1, 2.
- _____. "The Atonement," ibid., (August 1, 1946), 1, 2.
- _____. Ibid., (November 1, 1946), 1, 2, 11.
- _____. Ibid., (December, 1946), 1, 2.
- _____. "Identification," ibid., (January, 1947), 1, 2.
- _____. "The Importance of Holiness," ibid., (February, 1947), 1, 2.
- _____. "True Holiness," Pentecostal Herald, LIX (April 30, 1947), 3.
- _____. Ibid., (June 4, 1947), 3.
- _____. Ibid., (July 9, 1947), 3, 7.
- _____. "The True and Living God," ibid., (September 3, 1947), 3, 7.
- _____. "A Mountain Peak of Vision," ibid., (November 5, 1947), 3.
- _____. "The Christ of the Eternities," ibid., (December 3, 1947), 3, 7.
- _____. "He That Is Spiritual," ibid., New Series LX (April 7, 1948), 3, 7.
- _____. "Evangelism," ibid., (May 5, 1948), 3, 7.
- _____. "A Single Standard," ibid., (June 2, 1948), 3.
- _____. "The Inheritance of Believers," ibid., (July 7, 1948), 3.
- _____. "Sanctify Them--That They May Be one," ibid., 3, 7.
- _____. "His Holiness," ibid., (August 4, 1948), 3.
- _____. "Holiness," ibid., (August 4, 1948), 3, 7.

- _____. "A Meditation on Romans," ibid., (September 1, 1948), 3.
- _____. Ibid., (October 6, 1948), 3.
- _____. "The Reign of Grace," ibid., (November 3, 1948), 3, 7.
- _____. "Diamonds of Truth," ibid., LXI (January 5, 1949), 3, 7.
- _____. "The Double Nature of Sin," ibid., (February 2, 1949), 3.
- _____. "The Double Cure," ibid., LX (April 6, 1946), 3.
- _____. "Stepping in the Light," ibid., (June 1, 1949), 3, 7.
- _____. "The Presence of God," ibid., (July 13, 1949), 3.
- _____. "A Bible Centered Ministry," ibid., (September 7, 1949), 3.
- _____. "Holiness Under Test," ibid., (October 5, 1949), 3.
- _____. "To Fulfill the Word of God," ibid., (November 2, 1949), 3.
- _____. "Tested Values," ibid., (December 7, 1949), 3.
- _____. "I Am the Way," ibid., LXI (February 1, 1950), 3.
- _____. "God's Remedy For the Heart," ibid., (March 1, 1950), 3.
- _____. "He Lives--An Easter Meditation," ibid., (April 5, 1950), 7.
- _____. "The Indispensable Word," ibid., (May 3, 1950), 3.
- _____. Ibid., (June 7, 1950), 3, 11.
- _____. "The Verdict of Destiny," ibid., (July 12, 1950), 3, 7.
- _____. "Restraints and Controls," ibid., (August 2, 1950), 3, 6.
- _____. "The Zones of Salvation," ibid., (September 6, 1950), 3.
- _____. "The Precious Blood, I Peter 1:19," ibid., (November 1, 1950),
3.
- _____. "The Incarnate Christ," ibid., (December 6, 1950), 3.
- _____. "The Importance of Holiness," ibid., LXII (February 7, 1951),
3, 7.
- _____. "The Cross and the Resurrection," ibid., (March 7, 1951), 3.

- _____. "The Commands of God," ibid., (April 4, 1951), 3, 7.
- _____. "Pentecost," ibid., (May 2, 1951), 3.
- _____. "The Day of Pentecost," ibid., (June 6, 1951), 3, 7.
- _____. "The Fullness of Christ," ibid., (June 27, 1951), 3, 16.
- _____. "More About Pentecost," The Herald, LXII (August 1, 1951), 3.
- _____. "Perfected Forever," ibid., (September 5, 1951), 3.
- _____. "Perfection," ibid., (October 3, 1951), 3, 7.
- _____. "Spiritual Surgery--Enter Into Life," ibid., (December 5, 1951),
3.
- _____. "God's Standard," ibid., LXIII (February 6, 1952), 3.
- _____. "Our Common Heritage," ibid., (March 5, 1952), 3, 7.
- _____. "An Easter Meditation," ibid., (April 2, 1952), 3.
- _____. "Eternal Life," ibid., 3, 7.
- _____. "The Kingdom of God," ibid., (May 7, 1952), 3.
- _____. "A Glorious Day," ibid., (July 9, 1952), 3, 7.
- _____. "True Holiness," ibid., (September 3, 1952), 3.
- _____. Ibid., (October 1, 1952), 3.
- _____. Ibid., (November 5, 1952), 3, 7.
- _____. "The Incomparable Christ," ibid., 3.
- _____. "Stand Firm Against False Teaching," ibid., LXIV (January 7,
1953), 3, 6, 7.
- _____. "The Word of God," ibid., (February 4, 1953), 3.
- _____. "The Logic of Holiness Evangelism," ibid., (March 4, 1953), 3.
- _____. "The Undisparaged Christ," ibid., (April 1, 1953), 3.
- _____. "The True Estimate of Christ," ibid., (May 6, 1953), 3.
- _____. Ibid., (June 3, 1953), 3.

- _____. "The Secret of Victorious Living," ibid., (July 8, 1953), 3.
- _____. "A Balanced View of Sanctification," ibid., (October 7, 1953),
3.
- _____. Ibid., (November 4, 1953), 3, 7.
- _____. "A Heart Talk on Holiness," ibid., LXV (February 3, 1954), 3,
7.
- _____. "Heart Talk on the Second Work of Grace," ibid., (March 3,
1954), 3, 6.
- _____. "Holiness Preaching," ibid., (June 3, 1954), 2, 3.
- _____. "That Besetting Sin," ibid., (August 4, 1954), 2.
- _____. "Advantages of True Holiness," ibid., (September 1, 1954), 2,
3, 11.
- _____. "There is a Reason Why," ibid., (October 5, 1954), 2.
- _____. Ibid., (November 3, 1954), 2.
- _____. "Why Christ Came," ibid., (December 1, 1954), 2.
- _____. "Holiness Essential," ibid., LXVII (February 2, 1955), 2, 6, 7.
- _____. "Great Doctrinal Truth," ibid., LVI (April 6, 1955), 2.
- _____. "Man's Place in . . . God's Plan," ibid., (May 4, 1955), 2.
- _____. "Great Doctrinal Truth, The Doctrine of Revelation," ibid.,
(June 1, 1955), 2.
- _____. "Divine Revelation," ibid., (July 13, 1955), 2, 13.
- _____. "The Fact and Origin of Sin," ibid., (August 3, 1955), 2, 15.
- _____. "The Incarnation and the Sacrifice of Christ," ibid.,
(September 7, 1955), 2.
- _____. "The Atonement in Christ," ibid., (October 5, 1955), 2.
- _____. "Faith's Saving Power Depends Upon Our Renouncing of Sin,"
ibid., (November 2, 1955), 2.
- _____. "Man's Nature and His Recovery Through the Atonement of Christ,"
ibid., (December 7, 1955), 2.

- _____. "God's Will, Direct and Permissive, A Study of Cause and Effect," ibid., LXV (February 1, 1956), 2, 15.
- _____. "Choose the Better Part . . . Enduring Values in a Changing World," ibid., LVII (March 7, 1956), 2.
- _____. "The Basis of Christian Fellowship," ibid., (April 4, 1956) 2, 15.
- _____. "The Unchanging Law of Faith," ibid., (May 2, 1956), 2.
- _____. "Stepping Heavenward," ibid., (May 30, 1956), 3, 6.
- _____. "Behold the Lamb," ibid., (July 11, 1956), 3, 11.
- _____. "The Sacred Flame," ibid., (July 25, 1956), 2, 6.
- _____. "Spiritual Gold Mine," ibid., (October 3, 1956), 2.
- _____. "Doctrinal Aspects of the Holiness Movement," ibid., (November 7, 1956), 6, 11.
- _____. "Divine Sonship," ibid., LXVIII (February 6, 1957), 2, 7, 11.
- _____. "The Problem of Evil," ibid., (March 6, 1957), 2, 11.
- _____. "Incomparable Christ," ibid., (April 3, 1957), 2, 11, 15.
- _____. "The Bible," ibid., (June 5, 1957), 2, 11.
- _____. Ibid., (July 10, 1957), 2, 11.
- _____. "Victory in Jesus," ibid., (August 7, 1957), 2, 15.
- _____. "Anchorage of Faith," ibid., (November 6, 1957), 2, 11.
- _____. "The Top of Creation," ibid., (December 4, 1957), 2.
- _____. "The Doctrine of Holiness," ibid., LXIX (February 5, 1958), 2.
- _____. "Holiness," ibid., (May 7, 1958), 2.
- _____. Ibid., (June 4, 1958), 2, 15.
- _____. "Observations," ibid., (July 9, 1958), 2, 15.
- _____. "Advantages of Holiness," ibid., (August 6, 1958), 2, 13.

- _____. "Holiness and Worship," ibid., (October 1, 1958), 2.
- _____. "Holiness Obtained," ibid., (November 5, 1958), 2.
- _____. "In the Beginning God," ibid., (February 11, 1959), 2, 18.
- _____. "A Study in Thessalonians," ibid., (March 11, 1959), 2, 3.
- _____. Ibid., (April 8, 1959), 2, 3.
- _____. "The Death of Christ," ibid., (May 6, 1959), 2, 24.
- _____. Ibid., (June 3, 1959), 2, 21.
- _____. Ibid., (July 1, 1959), 2, 24.
- _____. Ibid., (August 12, 1959), 2.
- _____. "Helps to Abiding," ibid., (September 9, 1959), 2, 23.
- _____. "The Gospel," ibid., (October 7, 1959), 2, 23.
- _____. "Winning the Crown," ibid., (November 4, 1959), 2.
- _____. "Two Divine Imperatives," ibid., (December 2, 1959), 2.
- McPheeters, J. C. "The Home Going of Dr. C. W. Butler," ibid., LXXI
(May 4, 1960), 8, 17.

II. SECONDARY SOURCES

- Albright, Raymond W. A History of the Evangelical Church. Harrisburg, Pa.: The Evangelical Press, 1942.
- Carradine, Beverly. Sanctification. Columbia, S.C.: L. L. Pickett, 1891.
- Lindstrom, Harald. Wesley and Sanctification. London: Epworth Press, 1946.
- McDonald, H. D. Theories of Revelation. London: George Allen and Unwin Ltd., 1963.
- Peters, John Leland. Christian Perfection and American Methodism. New York: Abingdon Press, 1956.

Plass, Ewald M. This is Luther. St. Louis, Mo.: Concordia Publishing House, 1948.

Roberts, David E. and Henry Pitney Van Dusen. Liberal Theology an Appraisal. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1942.

Spreng, Samuel P. What Evangelicals Believe. Cleveland, Ohio: The Evangelical Publishing House, 1929.

Turner, George Allen. The More Excellent Way. Winona Lake, Indiana: Light and Life Press, 1952.