

1-1-1998

The American Holiness Movement: Why did it Captivate Nineteenth Century Quakers?

Carole Spencer

Follow this and additional works at: <http://digitalcommons.georgefox.edu/qrt>



Part of the [Christianity Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Spencer, Carole (1998) "The American Holiness Movement: Why did it Captivate Nineteenth Century Quakers?," *Quaker Religious Thought*: Vol. 90, Article 3.

Available at: <http://digitalcommons.georgefox.edu/qrt/vol90/iss1/3>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by Digital Commons @ George Fox University. It has been accepted for inclusion in Quaker Religious Thought by an authorized administrator of Digital Commons @ George Fox University.

THE AMERICAN HOLINESS MOVEMENT:

WHY DID IT CAPTIVATE
NINETEENTH-CENTURY QUAKERS?

CAROLE SPENCER

“Christian perfection necessarily implies the mystical life.”¹

The nineteenth-century Holiness revival was a popular mass movement of religious renewal within both American and British Protestantism beginning in the 1830s and reaching its peak in the 1870s. This renewal of a vision of holiness both personal and social, had a vitalizing effect on most American denominations during that period. Ministers, evangelists, and religious leaders preached “holiness unto the Lord” and taught a variety of ways to reach a higher and deeper spiritual state, often termed “Christian perfection.” These evangelists were found chiefly among the Methodists, but prominent leaders arose among within every American Protestant denomination.² The Presbyterian minister Charles G. Finney, the leading revivalist of the period, is well-known for preaching a message of Christian perfection. Even some of the more culturally separatist Mennonite and Brethren communities were impacted by the Holiness revival during this era. But no other tradition came under the spell of Holiness to the depth and degree of the Society of Friends. Under the influence of the Holiness Movement entire communities of Quakers, particularly in the Midwest and far West, adopted new forms of worship, theology, and ecclesiology that transformed traditional Quaker meetings into Evangelical churches.³

Thomas D. Hamm has written the most definitive and well-researched study of the radical changes within Quakerism during the nineteenth century.⁴ Hamm’s work provides a sociological analysis and framework to understanding the various forces that shaped and altered Quaker traditions in that period of history. He presents Quakerism as a striking, yet complex example of the inevitable processes of acculturation to the dominant values of mainstream society that shape every “sectarian” group. Hamm examines the Holiness Movement’s impact on Quakers as one manifestation of this overall

phenomenon. But the process of acculturation cannot fully explain the most intriguing aspect of this phenomenon. Why were Quakers so receptive to *this particular form* of the revival movement and why did it have such *revolutionary impact* for the tradition as a whole? Hamm provides some insights into the period that help us understand why the venerable, but plain Society of Friends was ripe for change and renewal, and how the Holiness revival “apparently met a deep need in the lives of many Friends.”⁵ Acknowledging that a combination of sociological, cultural, and even economic factors ultimately played a major part in the divisions and transformations of Quakerism, as Hamm and others have shown,⁶ this paper will examine the underlying emotional and psychological appeal of the Holiness Movement for nineteenth-century Quakers. This paper will argue that the Holiness revival met “deep needs” in the lives of so many Friends because of its rootedness in the medieval mystical vision of perfection. The optimistic perfectionism of the Holiness Movement reignited among nineteenth-century Quakers the contemplative Christ-mysticism that had permeated and fueled the Quaker awakening of the seventeenth century. The medieval vision of perfection reclaimed by Holiness theology produced a very intentional, transformative spirituality that promoted both personal piety and an activist social ministry, in effect, an “ethical mysticism” that resonated with a deeply embedded Quaker call to holy living. Unlike earlier American revivalism (which had minimal impact on Quakers) personal salvation/conversion was not the primary concern of the American Holiness Movement. The primary concern was sanctification, the fruits of conversion lived out in a holy life of devotion to God and neighbor. The Holiness revival was clearly evangelistic in its outlook and deeply concerned with saving the sinner and redeeming the backslider. Nevertheless it focused primarily and uniquely on persuading people to seek and experience the mystical moment of sanctification that occurred subsequent to conversion. Holiness advocates saw sanctification as a union with Christ that empowered the individual to live a righteous and obedient life. This experience was often referred to as the “Baptism of the Spirit,” a phrase and concept familiar to traditional Quakers. The Holiness Movement also resonated with Quakers because both traditions shared the same rootedness in the contemplative, inner life of devotion and prayer. But the energetic spirituality of the Holiness Movement became for many Quakers an antidote to the intense inwardness and passive quietism to which the Society of Friends had drifted in the eighteenth century. It replaced

quietistic Quaker devotion with a more intentional, active, evangelical piety that had as its goal moral and social reformation. Such a combination of piety and prophecy found a ready audience among Quakers yearning for the exuberance and zeal of the heady days of early Quakerism. Among younger Quakers especially, the long periods of silence, which were so meaningful to previous generations, seemed deadening and unproductive.⁷ The first generation of Quakers had combined in a fresh new way the silence, inwardness, and introspection of the medieval mystical tradition with the outwardness of evangelism and social activism. When George Fox and his followers set out to spread the good news to the whole world, they trod both the spiritual path of the *via negativa*, emptying, suffering, and bearing the cross, with the spiritual path of the *via positiva* of preaching, charity, and social protest. But as with all liberating renewal movements, the joyful obedience of the first generation of Quakers evolved into duty-bound legalism for its successors. For many Quakers, the spirit of the Holiness Movement recaptured the freedom, joy, and spontaneity of the first Quaker awakening in seventeenth-century England.

A further characteristic of the Holiness revival that did not go unnoticed by Quaker women was its incipient feminism. With a significant core of female leadership promoting and defending women's right to preach, the historical parallels with early Quakerism were obvious. The Holiness Movement tapped into a deep stream of feminine spirituality that appropriated both imagery and authority from the classic mystical tradition.⁸

THE HOLINESS REVIVAL AS RECOVERY OF THE MYSTICAL HERITAGE OF THE CHURCH

The Holiness Movement not only tapped into the mystical heritage of Quakerism but it tapped into the mystical heritage of Wesleyanism as well. It first arose from within mainstream American Methodism in the 1830s as a reaction to the perceived neglect of John Wesley's doctrine of perfection. Leaders within the Methodist Church became convinced that the neglect of the doctrine manifested itself in declension in the Methodist Church. The doctrine of perfection had been the "crown jewel" of Methodism, its primary spiritual legacy to the Protestant church. Wesley's emphasis on sanctification/perfection harkened back to the spirituality of the monastic tradition in

Catholicism.⁹ This tradition was later undercut by the Protestant Reformation's emphasis on justification by faith alone. As an Anglican priest trained at Oxford, Wesley was steeped in the history and theology of Christendom and had deep appreciation for its spiritual traditions and disciplines. Wesley's theology of holiness and concern for spiritual formation and social ministry was deeply rooted in the monastic and mystical tradition of Catholicism.¹⁰ Early Quakers drank from the same deep well of spirituality. They absorbed through their Puritan roots much of the language, ideas, and practices of the contemplative tradition of the medieval church. Despite the fact that Quakers reacted against most of the rituals, traditions, and structures of the institutional church they never rejected the disciplines of prayer, contemplation, reading and reflecting on Scripture, itinerant preaching, and works of mercy, practiced by the monastics in their search for holiness down through the centuries. Quakers viewed the institutional church as apostate from the time of Constantine on, and believed Quakerism to be a recovery of the "Primitive Christianity" of the New Testament church. But in their desire for authentic, direct communion with God, they were heirs of a long tradition of Christian renewal through intentional, alternative communities that existed alongside and often in tension with the established church. Many medieval monks and mystics, like the Quakers, walked along that fine line between orthodoxy and heresy. Quakers, in a real sense, were "worldly monastics" practicing holy obedience and seeking the goal of perfection in their homes, towns, workplaces, and public arenas, rather than cloistered monasteries and abbeys. In seeking and teaching the reality of direct communion with God, and the possibility of personal transformation through the inward Light of Christ, they appropriated many of the forms and practices of the Christian mystical tradition and adapted them to their own unique political and social context. Rufus Jones's studies in mysticism are well-known classics (*Studies in Mystical Religion, Quakerism, A Spiritual Movement*) as is his much-debated thesis that Quakerism is essentially "ethical mysticism." Jones tried to establish direct links between Quakerism and continental mysticism, but his efforts proved inconclusive to many. But whether or not direct links can be proven, the Quakers' primary insistence on direct, intimate experience with God, their focus on simplicity (modified asceticism) and holy obedience, and the style and language of their spirituality have strong affinities with the contemplative tradition of Catholic mysticism. These similarities can be found in both the *via negativa* or apophatic stream of mysticism

with emphasis on silence, suffering, and self-emptying, and the *via positiva* or kataphatic stream of mysticism with its symbolism, spoken words, and “bodily works.”¹¹

John Wesley was deeply steeped in Catholic mysticism as well, though he eventually rejected certain aspects of mystical thought. Nevertheless many of the mystics such as Ignatius Loyola, Francis de Sales, Madame Guyon, Francois Fenelon,¹² John Tauler, and others, deeply influenced Wesley’s thought. He included many of their writings in his *Christian Library* (extracts on “practical divinity” that he recommended Methodists read). Although Wesley ultimately rejected apophatic mysticism, the *via negativa* of the “dark night of the soul,” and the quietism of complete passivity before God of Madam Guyon and Fenelon, he nevertheless appropriated many of their ideas and concepts. He later edited and abridged their works for his followers to read. For Wesley the mystics provided both models for Christian living and “practical theology,” as well as the inspiration for the dominant theme of holiness and perfection in all of his writings. Wesley tried to distance himself from the mystical tradition in order to counteract the pejorative charge of “enthusiasm” by his contemporaries, by developing a biblical and rationalistic theology to support his religion of experience. However, the experiential dimension of holiness cannot be captured or contained in theological rationalism. Holiness is ultimately a supernatural, mystical, and ineffable work of the Spirit that “necessarily implies the mystical life.” Wesley realized that the mystics were the great exemplars of Christian perfection, and thus he appropriated their lives, thoughts, and experiences into Methodist orthopraxis.

QUAKERISM’S UNSTABLE BLENDING OF DIFFERENT STREAMS OF MYSTICISM

The quest for perfection, both personal and social, of the American Holiness Movement resonated with nineteenth-century Quakers to such an extent it reshaped an entire generation of Quaker leaders. Within a span of less than 40 years (from 1860-1895) about two-thirds of the Quaker constituency gradually moved from a quietist, apophatic form of Christian spirituality to the pietistic, kataphatic spirituality favored by Wesley which has permanently shaped American Evangelicalism. Some of the reasons for this paradigm shift can be found in the inherent polarity and tension within Christian

mysticism between passivity and activity. This tension found expression within early Quakerism as well in its concern for “deep inwardness” and prophetic activism. The early Quaker movement uniquely combined the characteristics of a radical social reform movement with an ascetical and deeply mystical spirituality.¹³

The highly kataphatic visionary, ecstatic spirituality predominated in Quakerism’s earliest phases. The beginning of the Quaker movement can be characterized as highly charismatic. Quakers exhibited phenomena such as trance-like states and ecstasies. They were also zealously evangelistic with a strong missionary impulse, militantly anti-intellectual and anti-institutional. All of these were expressed in highly affective, biblical language, and highly symbolic actions and mannerisms.¹⁴ The quietist impulses that predominated in religious circles of the late seventeenth and early eighteenth century moderated the behavior of the second generation of Quakers, along with the injection of the more rationalistic mysticism of Quaker theologian, Robert Barclay. The extremes of “enthusiasm” and ecstasy of the earliest Quaker spirituality have their parallels in groups within the Holiness Movement of the nineteenth century as well. In fact by the turn of the century, American Pentecostalism emerged from the more radical fringes of the Holiness Movement, to spin off a new spiritual movement, and drew into this new stream some Quaker leaders as well.¹⁵

THE VALUE OF WOMEN’S EXPERIENCE

In addition to the ideal of perfection rooted in mystical theology, the Holiness Movement also embraced a feminine spirituality that affirmed the value and authority of women’s experience. The history of Christianity outside of the mystical tradition is a history of patriarchy and the marginalization of women. But within the mystical tradition, especially from the flowering of mysticism in the twelfth century onwards, women’s authority and spirituality find a voice and a presence within the patriarchal structures of the church. Granted, Catholic women mystics had to renounce their sexuality in order to join a religious order, but such renunciation could provide women who had a religious bent and an inquiring mind, liberation from a life of domestic servitude and constant childbearing. The monastic life offered instead the luxury of education and contemplation, and sometimes even public ministry of preaching and spiritual direction. Only two women in the history of Christianity are considered

“Doctors of the Church,” saints and theologians equal to their male peers—Teresa of Avila and Catherine of Siena, both visionary mystics.

When Luther “liberated” women from their monasteries to become pastors’ wives instead of preachers and spiritual directors, women’s opportunity for public ministry and leadership virtually vanished within Protestantism (despite the principle of priesthood of all believers) until the mid-seventeenth century. At that time Quakers reaffirmed the spiritual authority of women and gave them the freedom to preach, write, theologize, and once again fulfill the role of public ministers. But unlike medieval religious women, Quaker women could be both mothers and mystics, nurturers of both family and community. They discovered the freedom to explore all aspects of the religious life without renouncing the domestic role of wife and mother.

One of the most obvious external parallels within the Holiness Movement and Quakerism is the role women played in the leadership and development of both traditions. Wesley admired and valued women’s spirituality, beginning with the strong influence of his own mother, Susannah. He read and recommended as model Christians a number of women mystics (e.g. Madame Guyon). In opposition to most male theologians and church leaders he actively encouraged and supported the ministry of women (with certain limitations) within his Methodist society. His view of women in general was hardly egalitarian and thoroughly conditioned by his culture. He nevertheless provided a model for feminine leadership and spirituality that emerged forcefully in the nineteenth-century Holiness Movement. The founder and force behind the Holiness revival was none other than a Methodist woman, Phoebe Palmer, a grass roots organizer, a preacher, teacher, and popular theologian, humanitarian and proto-feminist.

The Holiness Movement, steeped as it was in the mystical theology of perfection, also tapped into the feminine spirituality that was such a powerful dimension of the medieval mystical tradition (e.g. Julian of Norwich, Hildegard of Bingen, Meththild of Magdeburg, Teresa of Avila, Catherine of Siena). Phoebe Palmer’s *The Way of Holiness*, one of the most widely read Holiness publications, is full of feminine mystical imagery.¹⁶ Madame Guyon, the French mystic, was immensely popular among Holiness adherents. A biography of Guyon, written by a well-known Holiness leader, Thomas Upham, became a best-seller. When the goal of perfection as well as the goal of spiritual equality merged within a popular renewal movement, the

26 • CAROLE SPENCER

resulting spiritual vision proved irresistible to many Quaker women. For example, Hannah Whitall Smith, nurtured in the mystical quietism of traditional Quakerism, found spiritual renewal and inspiration within the Holiness Movement and became one of its leading evangelists. In fact a substantial number of Quaker Holiness leaders were female.¹⁷ Among Orthodox Quakers in the nineteenth century, a number of women influenced by the Holiness revival became social activists with culturally radical agendas. They became the “evangelical” counterparts to the radical Hicksite feminists, such as Susan B. Anthony and Lucretia Mott.¹⁸

CONTEMPLATION AND ACTION

In the history of Christian spirituality, the contemplative life and the active life have tended to be dichotomized. The Protestant reformers (Lutheran and Calvinist) saw little relevance in the contemplative lifestyle and generally viewed mysticism negatively. The theology and practice of Holiness developed by John Wesley bridged the gap between mystical contemplation and active evangelism and reform. The mystic’s union with God, the “Perfect Love” of Bernard of Clairvaux, echoes throughout Wesley’s thought. The Holiness Movement as a recovery of Wesley’s theology of Christian perfection synthesized the opposites of contemplation and action as well, with its focus on the inner life and the outer life. Quakers, the most mystical of all Protestant denominations, are also recognized as being among the most socially active. From their earliest beginnings they were both mystical and political, contemplative and active—“picket and pray” is one way they are popularly described. Even during the eighteenth century when Quakers were at the height of their “quietist” phase, an American Quaker, John Woolman, embodied the seemingly opposite traits of a contemplative mystic and a prophetic reformer. He advocated for the abolition of slavery and other social justice issues far in advance of his time. Although mystical contemplation and social action are generally viewed as opposite forces, a vital stream within the mystical tradition combines both (e.g., Francis of Assisi, Ignatius Loyola, Teresa of Avila, Catherine of Siena). The Quakers, the Wesleyans, and the nineteenth-century Holiness Movement are three spiritual traditions that embrace that stream. It is my contention that the continuities between the traditions are not coincidental. The Quaker vision of holy obedience lived out in the

world with transforming power found new affirmation within the nineteenth-century Holiness revival and drew vast numbers of Quakers into its embrace.

HOLINESS QUAKERS TODAY

At the same time that the Holiness Movement brought renewal to Friends, the forces of acculturation were at work transforming a countercultural sect into a mainstream denomination. Holiness Quakers adopted the forms and practices of mainstream evangelical culture. Paid pastors, worship focused on preaching, hymn-singing, and altar calls became commonplace. Some congregations even practiced the rites of water baptism and communion with bread and wine. Quaker “meetings” became Quaker “churches.” Deep divisions in the nineteenth century tore apart the Society of Friends. Evangelical Friends became virtually a new denomination within American Protestantism. As the Quaker branches polarized and became entrenched in their positions they appeared to share with each other only a common history and founder. New alignments took place. Holiness Quakers joined the National Holiness Association and found more in common with Nazarenes and Free Methodists than with “unprogrammed” Quakers. Like other evangelicals they established their own colleges, publications, and mission fields. Beginning in the 1920s Fundamentalism infected Holiness Quakers (as well as the other Holiness denominations) and reshaped their Quaker orientation. Fundamentalism brought new emphases, doctrines, ideologies, and practices into Holiness Quakerism that transformed their identity once again. But the changes and adaptations were more subtle and more gradual than that of the Holiness revival. The Holiness Movement had built upon a contemplative, mystical approach to spirituality strongly connected to an active tradition of social witness. It shared the Quaker concern for the equality of all persons and for simplicity in lifestyle. Many nineteenth-century Holiness advocates were social radicals who protested against oppressive structures such as slavery and recognized systemic evil within society.¹⁹

The Fundamentalist leavening of the Holiness Movement has muted the social witness of Evangelical Quakers (including the peace testimony) and undermined the leadership of women. Furthermore, Fundamentalism has shifted Evangelical Quaker theology to a doctrine, rationalistic system, and a bibliocentric (rather than

28 • CAROLE SPENCER

Christocentric) spirituality completely alien to the Quaker tradition. In addition to these destructive tendencies, Fundamentalism has brought into Quakerism a suspicion of the Christian mystical tradition itself, which is at the heart of Quaker spirituality. Perhaps the nineteenth-century Holiness Movement can be cited as the door that opened the way for these Fundamentalist accommodations. But a recognition of the rootedness of the Holiness Movement in the mystical stream of the Christian tradition can help Quakers today understand its original appeal for spiritual seekers a century ago. Many Evangelical Quakers today are suffering from an identity crisis regarding their Holiness heritage. A few wish to reclaim it, but most wish to discard it. For some it is an oppressive heritage they need to “recover from.” For others it has been central to their spiritual experience.

A broader historical understanding of Holiness in Christian tradition can help us recover and appropriate those aspects of its nineteenth-century manifestation that enhanced and renewed the Quaker spiritual vision and eliminate those that detract from it. Perhaps, too few Evangelicals realize that the quest for holiness is the mystical quest for union with God common to all Christian spirituality, and is an integral dynamic of Quaker religious experience across the branches.

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION

The quest for personal holiness and belief in its attainment was central to the spirituality of George Fox and the first generation of Quakers. Fox, Fell, Penn, and the other early Quaker leaders were Anglican dissenters of the most radical stripe. They expressed in their beliefs and practices the most mystical, idealistic, and perfectionistic manifestations of the Puritan ethos of that revolutionary era in English history. The ongoing scholarly debate as to whether Quakers were essentially Puritans or essentially mystics can be resolved by recognizing their embodiment of both traditions. I would suggest the term *Puritan mystics* or *mystical Puritans* to describe George Fox and the early Quakers. The prominent place given to Robert Barclay’s *Apology* as the standard statement of Quaker theology early in the movement would lend support to this hypothesis.²⁰ Barclay was raised as a Puritan Calvinist in Scotland, but trained in a Jesuit University in Paris. The flavor of both traditions can be detected in his writings. Quakerism as a spiritual movement became a unique blending of the Puritan Protestant tradition and the mystical Catholic tradition. The

dynamic of perfectionism produced an ethical, pragmatic mysticism with strong parallels to the medieval monasticism of the Catholic church. The dialectic of grace and works, contemplation and action, were formally synthesized in Quakerism by Barclay in the seventeenth century and became the pattern for Quaker spirituality through the centuries.

The Holiness Movement of the nineteenth century traced its theology and spirituality to the perfectionism of John Wesley. Wesley's doctrine of Christian perfection was also rooted in the Catholic mystical tradition. Although Wesley was thoroughly Reformed and Protestant in his view of Scripture, grace, and justification by faith alone, his theology of sanctification as expressed in his doctrine of Christian perfection was essentially Catholic. The American Holiness Movement recovered Wesley's "peculiar doctrine" of Christian perfection and reshaped it for a new audience and culture. American Quakers came under the spell of the Holiness revival because it echoed long dormant mystical themes deeply embedded in the Quaker tradition. It captivated and energized a new generation of Quakers by providing an outlet for a vibrant, activist, reforming spirituality that emerged naturally from a renewed vision for Christian perfection.

The quest for holiness is a central unifying theme in all branches of Quakerism, just as it is in all Christian mystical traditions. Quakers, in all of their various manifestations today, share more than a common history. They also share a common, distinctive Quaker spirituality that is deeply grounded in the classical, historical, Christ-centered, contemplative, and transformative mystical tradition of the Christian church.

NOTES

1. Antonio Royo, O.P. and Jordan Aumann, O.P., *The Theology of Christian Perfection* (Dubuque, Iowa: The Priory Press, 1962), p. 154.
2. See Timothy Smith, *Revivalism and Social Reform* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 1980), pp. 135-6.
3. Charles Jones, *Perfectionist Persuasion: The Holiness Movement and American Methodism, 1867-1936* (Metuchen, N.J.: Scarecrow Press), pp. 60-61.
4. Thomas D. Hamm, *The Transformation of American Quakerism* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1988).
5. *Ibid.*, p. 88.
6. cp. Hugh Barbour and J. William Frost, *The Quakers* (New York: Greenwood Press, 1988).

30 • CAROLE SPENCER

7. Hamm, *op. cit.*, p. 88.
8. See Kate Gales, "Anchored Behind the Veil: Mystical Vision as a Possible Source of Authority in the Ministry of Phoebe Palmer," *Methodist History* 31 (1993), 243-247 and Theodore Hovet, "Phoebe Palmer's Altar Phraseology and the Spiritual Dimension of Woman's Sphere," *Journal of Religion* 63 (1983).
9. See Glen Hinson, "Baptist and Quaker Spirituality" in *Christian Spirituality: Post Reformation and Modern*, ed. Louis Depre and Don E. Saliers (New York: Crossroads, 1991).
10. Robert G. Tuttle, *Mysticism in the Wesleyan Tradition* (Grand Rapids: Francis Asbury Press, 1989).
11. The apophatic way teaches that we can only know God by stripping away the self and entering into "the Cloud of Unknowing." God cannot be known by images, models, concepts. Representative of the apophatic stream of mysticism in the monastic tradition is St. John of the Cross and Meister Eckhart. For contemporary Quaker examples of this way see Brenda Clift Heales and Chris Cook, *Images and Silence* (Quaker Home Service, 1992); and Sandra L. Cronk, *Dark Night Journey* (Pendle Hill Publications, 1991). The kataphatic way teaches that we can arrive at knowledge of God by actively affirming aspects of the created order. The kataphatic path is reflected most clearly in the prophetic-missionary impulses of Quakerism. Gayle Beebe contends that the Franciscan order provided a rich source of insight for early Quakers in this regard. See his "The Nature of Mysticism" in *Truth's Bright Embrace*, ed. Paul Anderson and Howard Macy (Newberg, Oregon: George Fox University Press, 1996).
12. Guyon and Fenelon have had significant influence in Quaker thought and practice as well.
13. Other historical examples of this phenomena can be seen in the Spanish Carmelites, the Rhineland mystics, and the missionary-minded Franciscans and Jesuits.
14. A not uncommon reaction from students upon first reading George Fox's *Journal* is a comment such as "he reminds me of my Pentecostal grandmother!"
15. One notable example is A. J. Tomlinson, an Indiana Quaker who founded one of the largest Pentecostal denominations, the Church of God, Cleveland.
16. See Kate Gales, "Anchored Behind the Vale."
17. Thomas Hamm mentions at least ten by name, *op. cit.*, pp. 78-84.
18. See Carole Spencer, "Evangelism, Feminism, and Social Reform," *Quaker History*, 80 (1991) pp. 24-48.
19. For example, Catherine and William Booth, founders of the Salvation Army, were radical Holiness Methodists who created a Christian social service institution to alleviate poverty in England in the late nineteenth century.
20. Further exploration of Barclay's interpretation of Quaker faith and practice is beyond the scope of this paper but continues to be an area ripe for further research. Dean Freiday's pioneering work in his introduction to *Barclay's Apology in Modern English* provides tantalizing evidence of John Wesley's dependence upon and appropriation of Quaker thought despite his public denunciation of Quaker doctrine. Wesley often sharply criticized many of the mystics he readily borrowed from including his own spiritual mentor, William Law.