

Quaker Religious Thought

Volume 131

Article 2

9-2018

Primitive Christianity Revived-The Original Quaker Vision

Paul N. Anderson George Fox University

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.georgefox.edu/qrt

Part of the Christian Denominations and Sects Commons, and the Christianity Commons

Recommended Citation

Anderson, Paul N. (2018) "Primitive Christianity Revived—The Original Quaker Vision," *Quaker Religious Thought*: Vol. 131, Article 2. Available at: https://digitalcommons.georgefox.edu/qrt/vol131/iss1/2

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by Digital Commons @ George Fox University. It has been accepted for inclusion in Quaker Religious Thought by an authorized editor of Digital Commons @ George Fox University. For more information, please contact arolfe@georgefox.edu.

PRIMITIVE CHRISTIANITY REVIVED—THE ORIGINAL QUAKER VISION

PAUL ANDERSON

Quaker histories over the last century or so have been highly interpretive in their interests and approaches, yielding a number of diverse results as to the character of the early Quaker movement, with varying implications. Obviously, one of the interests in history involves seeking to understand more about the past in order to shed light on the present and the future of the Friends movement itself. What, however, if such an interest is itself misguided? What if the founders of the Friends movement did not seek to start a movement, but rather, were solely invested in something entirely different? In their own terms, the first two generations of Friends were seeking to recover "Basic Christianity" or "Primitive Christianity Revived," seeking to be "Friends of Jesus" because they claimed to know and carry out his will, as referenced in John 15:14-15.¹

If the experience and goal of early Friends was the recovery and restoration of Apostolic Christianity, this is a radically different trajectory than seeking to foster and perpetuate a particular denomination or sect. Such was *not* the vision for which early Friends lived and died, if their own writings are taken seriously. Thus, in the language with which early Friends understood their calling, their original vision as described by William Penn posed a challenge to all sectarianism, documenting the rise and progress of the people called Quakers as the embodiment of *Primitive Christianity Revived*.² Even though Penn was a second-generation Friend, his vision coheres with the first-generation leaders, and he seeks to further their work in his analysis. As Isaac Penington says,

When the church comes again out of the wilderness, when the Spirit and power of God builds up again the gospel-church in its primitive glory, when the everlasting gospel is preached again to all nations, kindreds, tongues, and languages, in the authority and power of God, when the Spirit of the Lord is poured out plentifully on his sons and daughters, and they prophesy, walk, and live in it, when God dwells and walks in his people, and his

true light shines in them, dispelling the darkness thoroughly, and filling them with the glory and majesty of the Lord..., then shall there be such a day of brightness and pure heavenly glory, as shall dazzle the eyes of all beholders.³

Given that the first overview of early Quaker history was produced by William Penn, the question involves the degree to which his analysis might continue to serve as a suitable lens for viewing the original Quaker vision,⁴ and such is the focus of the present essay.

I. RECENT INTERPRETATIONS OF THE EARLY QUAKER MOVEMENT

While Friends have usually interpreted developments in the light of seeking to understand their relation to the early periods of the movement, a substantive advance was made with the commissioning of the Rowntree Series as a means of producing the "standard history" of the Friends movement from 1909-1921.⁵ Building upon previous Quaker histories,⁶ these books marked a turning point in the historical appraisal of the Quaker movement.⁷ Following the 1895 Manchester Conference of Friends, where British Quakerism came to side with modernism over and against conservatism,⁸ the vision of John Wilhelm Rowntree was to contribute a historical-critical understanding of the Quaker movement as a means of providing a basis for progressive and more liberal understandings of faith and practice. Rufus Jones served as the series editor and author or co-author of four of the six books.

As the research expertise and agenda of Rufus Jones was invested in wresting the contribution of the Spiritual Reformers of Europe and Britain from the Lutheran and Calvinist sides of the Reformation, he saw Quakerism as closer to the former than the latter. This posed a fitting correction to impressions of the Reformation, extending from the founders to later reformers and even the Radical Reformation, but it also resulted in somewhat skewing the understanding of the early Quaker movement, seeing it primarily in the light of *Continental mysticism*. Of course, the parallels are many, but in so doing, Jones failed to take into full consideration the biblical and societal thrust of Puritanism and the Radical Reformation within Britain at the time. He also made too little of the significant differences between Friends and other groups with more questionable theologies and differing convictions, which strained some of the comparisons. These oversights PRIMITIVE CHRISTIANITY REVIVED – THE ORIGINAL QUAKER VISION \bullet 7

led to a second modern interpretation of the Quaker movement, seeing it within the context of Puritan England.

With Rufus Jones having written the forewords to Braithwaite's two volumes, new understandings of the Puritan movement and its biblical orientation caused the revised editions to include new introductions by Hugh Doncaster and Frederick Tolles, edited and with added notes by Henry J. Cadbury.9 In these new introductions, the Puritan setting of 17th century England posed a more suitable backdrop for understanding the thrust and ethos of the early Quaker movement. Hugh Barbour's Yale dissertation supervised by Roland Bainton eventually won the day in seeing the early Quaker movement as a branch of the radical reformation within Puritan England.¹⁰ Indeed, some quotations of the Bible by George Fox and other early Friends show a preference for the Geneva Bible, and early Friends were certainly associated with the dissenting movements of mid 17th century England. In addition, Foxe's Book of Martyrs (1563) proved inspirational for George Fox and other early Friends, and its vision of martyrological faithfulness enabled them to sustain their biblical faith in the face of persecution.

However, Puritans were also at odds with Quakers, and James Nayler, following his infamous 1656 ride into Bristol, was tried in Parliament (a largely Puritan representation) for blasphemy. And, upon visiting Boston and preaching that Christ is come to teach his people himself, Mary Dyer was hanged in 1660 on Boston Commons in Puritan New England as the third of four Quaker martyrs. Barbour is certainly aware of the fallouts between Ouakers and the Puritans, but these tensions also demanded inquiry as to what the original Quaker vision and ethos might have been. A third interpretation follows the thesis of Arthur Roberts, developed further by Carole Spencer, that the experience of George Fox and the message of early Friends involved personal transformation by the Holy Spirit, bolstered an understanding of a holiness- and sanctification-oriented approach to renewal and reform as a better way to envision the message and mission of early Quakerism.¹¹ If Fox really did experience re-entering paradise through the flaming sword-into that place where Adam was before he fellthis would have involved a considerable departure from conventional religiosity of the day. It would also account for the traveling ministries of Friends, leading to revivalist Quakerism, which since the mid 19th century called for radical personal renewal. As Robert Barclay puts it, believers are not only freed from the penalties of sin but also from its

power.¹² Thus, societal and social transformation begins with personal spiritual renewal, and such is the key to understanding the power of early Quakerism within a holiness perspective.

Seeing the mission of George Fox and early Friends as prophetic and apocalyptic are the interpretations of Lewis Benson and Douglas Gwyn, involving a fourth interpretation.¹³ In Benson's approach, George Fox came challenging the many ways that Christianity in 17th century England was not living up to the standards of New Testament Christianity, and he lays out the four pillars of the four centers of Quakerism as being prophetic, mystical, humanitarian, and evangelical. In that sense, none of the modern branches of Friends have "got it right" entirely, and each is called to amend its ways, in Benson's view. The original Quaker vision (with Penn) thus involves embracing the way of the cross rather than institutional religion.¹⁴ Doug Gwynn continued that thrust, arguing an apocalyptic understanding of the life and message of George Fox, including an original covenant that many Friends have since transgressed.¹⁵ Seeing the Lamb's War as the culmination of history, Gwyn compares and contrasts the Quaker vision of what God was doing through them with the perspectives of other religious movements at the time. He then concludes with seeing God's covenant with Friends related to abiding in the truth as represented in the Gospel of John,¹⁶ whereas Gerard Guiton sees the prophetic Quaker vision as the embracing and furthering of the Kingdom of God.17

In addition to these four main interpretations of the early Friends movement,¹⁸ other contributions have been made along the way on the entire history of the Quaker movement. Following the Rowntree project, Neave Brayshaw produced a single-volume treatment of Quaker history and its message,¹⁹ Elbert Russell covered the movement up until 1940, and Elfrida Vipont offered a vivid anecdotal treatment of the story of Quakerism.²⁰ Walter Williams covered "the rich heritage of Quakerism" from an evangelical perspective, and Howard Brinton produced an interpretation of Quakerism especially suited to unprogrammed Friends.²¹ Elton Trueblood's treatment of "the people called Quakers" offered particular insights into the genius of the movement, and his collection of essays on "Basic Christianity" posed a new vision for consideration.²² John Punshon contributes greatly to understanding the social and political dynamics of 17th century England, improving upon the view of Christopher Hill, who simplistically lumped Friends in with proletariat dissenters seeking to overthrow the ruling classes.²³ In 2000, Rosemary Moore published

$\label{eq:primitive christianity revived - the original quaker vision \bullet 9$

her doctoral work rooted in an inductive analysis of mid-17th century Quaker writings and sources, seeking to produce an objective analysis of the birth of the Quaker movement, actually confirming Penn's assessment of the original Quaker vision.²⁴

As the collections of early Quaker writings and those of early Quaker women have been gathered and made accessible,²⁵ the work of Rosemary Moore illumines the diversity of Quaker views amongst their pamphleteers' and opponents' tracts during the first two decades of the movement.²⁶ Her methodology was to examine all materials available, including those not closely connected to central leaders of the movement. This led to a fuller appreciation for the more textured character of the emerging movement, and her inquiring of her sources along seven lines of interest yields a helpful overview of early Friends' concerns. These include: salvation, eschatology, the Church as a saved community, worship, the Bible, the life of believers, and engagements of government or civil law. Within her analysis, an overlooked thrust of the writings of George Fox comes to the surface. Other than his *Journal*, the most substantive of his books is *The Great Mystery*.²⁷ In this work, Fox answers over a hundred accusations against Friends, and not only does this volume present a defense of the Quaker position on Christian faith and practice, but it also reflects how they were perceived and misinterpreted by others. Significantly, in both the work of Fox and the introduction by Edward Burrough, the main thrust of this book articulates an understanding of New Testament Christianity that the present-day church had failed to embrace or embody. In that sense, Penn's thesis would by no means have been an isolated one; it is confirmed by Moore's analysis of the apologetic works of Fox, Burrough, and other leading first-generation Friends.

II. WILLIAM PENN'S INTERPRETATION OF THE MOVEMENT AND EARLY FRIENDS' SELF-UNDERSTANDINGS—A COMPELLING ANALYSIS

Within each of these interpretations of the early Quaker movement, a good deal of truth is to be found, and taking note of the various renderings—especially when 17th century accounts are represented fairly—will always be helpful for later interpreters. Indeed, I would recommend a broad consultation of diverse treatments of Quaker histories, including primary literature. After all, as displayed superbly in the opening chapters of the *Oxford Handbook of Quaker Studies*

edited by Ben Pink Dandelion and Stephen Angell, it is clear how differing understandings of the roots and trunk of the Quaker tree have contributed to the distinctive developments of its various branches.²⁸ Nonetheless, if there were a cohesive and compelling appraisal of the movement's origin, character, and development, the interpretation by William Penn deserves consideration as arguably the most fitting lens through which to view the way early Friends understood their movement and their vocation during its first half-century.²⁹

On several levels, William Penn's programmatic treatment of Primitive Christianity Revived in the Principles and Practices of the People Called Quakers (1696) puts forward his own apology for the movement, and this work is somewhat parallel to Robert Barclay's fuller Apology for the True Christian Divinity, though much shorter.³⁰ Penn's work builds upon the works of Barclay, Penington, Fox, and others, but it also follows on his Rise and Progress of the People Called Quakers (1694).³¹ When taken together, Penn's view of the rise and progress of the Quaker movement is tied directly to his understanding of the history of Christianity and the unfolding history of God's dispensations and time-changing workings in the world. Thus, Penn's understanding of Quaker history is eschatological. It is a function of New Testament and Apostolic Christianity being restored within a new, epoch-irrupting dispensation of grace, in which the Quaker movement played a pivotal role.³² Further, in addition to several among his over-one hundred other essays, his personal expression of Christian discipleship deserves consideration. In No Cross, No Crown (1669/1682), William Penn identifies the central fulcrum of Christian discipleship: if one is not willing to embrace the cross of Christ, neither does one deserve to expect the crown (Luke 24:27).³³

Not only does Penn's understanding of the heart of Christian faith and practice lay the groundwork for his situating the Quaker movement within God's saving-revealing irruptions into human history, but one can also discern a significant maturation of thought between his first and second editions. Moving from the subtitle of the first edition (written during his 1669 imprisonment in the Tower of London) as: Or Several Sober Reasons Against Hat Honour, Titular Respects, You to a Single Person, with the Apparel and Recreations of the Times: being inconsistent with Scripture, Reason and the Practice, as well as with the best Heathens, as well as the Holy Men and Women of all Generations; and consequently Fantastick, Impertinent, and Sinfull,³⁴ the subtitle to the second edition (1682) is far more balanced.

PRIMITIVE CHRISTIANITY REVIVED – THE ORIGINAL QUAKER VISION • 11

Obviously, Penn defends the particular actions and testimonies Friends had felt led to take in the first subtitle by confronting what they felt were misrepresentations of authentic Christianity.³⁵ Thus, the subtitle of the second edition, *The Original Exposition on the Cross* of Jesus Christ, aims more radically at the central thrust of Christian faith and practice. Penn's first edition therefore served as something of a defense regarding the message he had proclaimed in *The Sandy Foundation Shaken*, which led to his imprisonment to begin with. Yet, what one sees in the development of his writings is a steady movement from defending particular Testimonies of Friends to articulating the foundational basis of their stances, which stemmed from a radical understanding of Apostolic Christianity, itself.³⁶

Likewise, Penn's presentation of *Primitive Christianity Revived* reflects a matured synthesis of observations and convictions over the first two generations of the Quaker movement, which he had addressed in his substantive introduction to the *Journal* of George Fox. Therefore, rather than see the Quaker movement as one sect among many, he identifies it as the eschatological recovery of Apostolic Christianity. In so doing, he builds upon his previous works, and as explained in his introductory letter to readers, he describes his purpose as follows:³⁷

I have taken in hand to write this small tract of the nature and virtue of the light of Christ within man, and what and where it is, and for what end, and therein of the religion of the people called Quakers; that, at the same time, all people may be informed of their true character, and what true religion is, and the way to it, in this age of high pretences and as deep irreligion; that so the merciful visitation of the God of light and love, (more especially to these nations,) both immediately and instrumentally for the promotion of piety, (which is religion indeed,) may no longer be neglected by the inhabitants thereof, but that they may come to see and say, with heart and mouth, this is a dispensation of love and life from God to the world; and this poor people, that we have so much despised, and so often trod upon, and treated as the off-scouring of the earth, are the people of God and children of the Most High.

In seeing the early Quaker movement as a factor of "Primitive Christianity Revived," Penn argues for embracing the eschatological workings of God through the Christ Events by means of Scripture, reason, and human experience in the lives of Friends. Among the

eleven brief chapters in this work, the first seven develop an apology for the immediacy of the risen Christ—at work inwardly and universally across the bounds of time and space. Chapters VII and IX address the saving and sanctifying work of Christ within; Chapter X addresses authentic worship and inspired ministry, freely given; Chapter XI presents testimonies for holy living in keeping with biblical and apostolic standards, including: honesty, integrity, plainness of speech and living, nonviolence, and charity. Here the progression also moves from overall convictions about the character of Apostolic Christianity to Christian Testimonies as pointed correctives to particular ills and abuses within the context of 17th century England. This same progression is present in many of his other writings.

Within this approach, Chapter IV outlines the core of Penn's convictions: namely that "this Principle of Light, Life and Grace" is the key to conviction, conversion, and regeneration, and that one cannot enter the Kingdom of God without it. "That is to say, there can be no True Sight of Sin, nor Sorrow for it, and therefore no forsaking or overcoming of it, or Remission or Justification from it" without Christ's being at work within through the convicting power of the Holy Spirit. Nor can one become "Virtuous, Holy and Good, without this Principle," and "no Acceptance with God, nor Peace of Soul" is possible without it. Because people in conventional religion "Overlook this Principle, and leave it behind them," they prefer sacrifice over obedience and refuse to "take up the Cross, deny Self, and do that which God requires." This Principle is divine, universal, and efficacious, and it gives humanity the knowledge of God and oneself. It begets a true sense of sorrow for sin (leading to conviction and repentance), it enables them to forsake sin and to be sanctified from it, it applies God's mercies in Christ to forgiveness and justification, and it gives the faithful perseverance unto perfection and the assuredness of blessedness. As mentioned above, the truth of these points is bolstered by threefold evidence:

First, The Scriptures, which give an ample Witness, especially those of the New and better Testament. *Secondly*, The Reasonableness of it in it self. And *Lastly*, A General Experience, in great Measure: But particularly, *Their Own*, made credible by the good Fruits they have brought forth, and the Answer God has given to their Ministry: Which, to impartial Observers, have commended the Principle, and gives me Occasion to abstract their *History*, in divers Particulars, for a Conclusion to this little *Treatise*.

PRIMITIVE CHRISTIANITY REVIVED – THE ORIGINAL QUAKER VISION \bullet 13

Therefore, in presenting an apology for primitive Christianity revived, Penn argues first what I might call *a dynamic Christocentricity*.³⁸ Because Christ is risen, alive, and at work in the lives of persons through the Holy Spirit (John 14-16), and because the Light of Christ is at work, at least potentially, in the lives of all persons (John 1:9), believers are convicted of sin and of righteousness and led into truth by the Spirit of Christ (John 16:8-11). The *Logos* and Light of Christ (John 1:1-18) is understood to be the Divine Principle (bringing in the work of Heraclitus),³⁹ which is also understood as the source of reason and order, and God's spiritual work within the conscience of the individual is seen as the basis for transformation, empowerment, and guidance. Rather than resorting to outward religiosity, the work of Christ within is the hope of the world, and this is that to which Quakers testify as the essence of Apostolic Christianity.

In that sense, apostolic succession is not a matter of an institutional and physical succession of bishops—conveyed by the physical laying on of hands—going back to the original followers of Jesus; rather, it is a factor of openness to and encounter of the same Holy Spirit who inspired and empowered the Apostles—effected by the transformative work of the Holy Spirit within and received as a grace by faith—which is available to every, woman, man, and child who believes in Christ and is open to being mutually indwelled by Christ (John 15:1-8). These elements thus provide the bases for the Christian Testimonies of Friends, as delivered in their 17th century English contexts. An outline of themes within Penn's eleven chapters is as follows:

- Ch. I—The fundamental principle is the Light of Christ at work within the individual's life (John 1:9).
- Ch. II—This reality is scriptural, and life comes from Christ alone—our Creator and Redeemer (John 1:1-5).
- Ch. III—Inspired Scripture is only read effectively by the Light of Christ—the Holy Spirit, who illumines the text and its meaning for our lives (2 Timothy 3:16-17).
- Ch. IV—Discernment of God's guidance and truth comes by the Light of Christ, dividing truth from error and glimpsing ways of peace (John 16:8-11).
- Ch. V—The Light of God is clarified by its character, grace and truth, and the Holy Spirit's leadings are authentically seen as proceeding from God—of like character (John 15:26-27).

- 14 PAUL ANDERSON
 - Ch. VI—While all may have access to the Light of Christ, they might not be obeying it; the revelation of Jesus adds further clarity (John 3:18-21).
 - Ch. VII—The Light of Christ has been at work in all dispensations, challenging idolatries in every age (2 Corinthians 4:1-6).
 - Ch. VIII—The justification of Christ bears a twofold work: delivering humanity from the guilt of sin and also from its power and pollution (Romans 8: 1-17; Titus 2:11-14).
 - Ch. IX—It is impossible to receive the gift of Christ from without, if we do not open ourselves to his transformative work within (Colossians 1:24-29).
 - Ch. X—Authentic worship is in Spirit and in Truth, true ministry is by inspiration, Christ's ministers testify to experiential knowledge and do not charge for their service, the Spirit bears inward witness to these scriptural truths (John 4:21-24).
 - Ch. XI—Thus, with Primitive Christians, the people called Quakers testify:
 - Against governmentally enforced tithes
 - Against all swearing and oaths
 - Against war among Christians
 - Against embellished salutations and false flattery
 - For plainness of speech ("thee" and "thou" language)
 - For marriages within the fold of Christ
 - For plainness of apparel
 - Against "holy" days, festivals, and fasts
 - For holy living: caring for the poor, living peaceably with all, living with integrity in word and deed, blameless according to primitive practice.

While this outline of convictions neither presents a history of the early Quaker movement nor a compelling overview of Primitive Christianity, those tasks are performed more fully in his introduction to the *Journal* of George Fox.⁴⁰ There Penn lays out the history of Christianity in terms of divine dispensations, of which the Quaker movement is presented as a clear parallel to the experiences and ministries of the apostles, offering an eschatological view of apostolic

PRIMITIVE CHRISTIANITY REVIVED – THE ORIGINAL QUAKER VISION $\bullet~15$

succession. As it is the Holy Spirit who inspired and empowered the first apostles, it is also the Holy Spirit that imbues believers in later generations and settings with the same apostolic zeal and spiritual charisms.⁴¹ Nonetheless, Penn's treatise here lays out a biblical and reasoned defense of the faith and practice of the people called Quakers, following upon the narration of God's work in the histories of Christianity, the Quaker movement, and in the lives of Fox and others in his previous works. Contextually, Penn's treatise is thus aimed at convincing readers the Quaker movement is no mere sect seeking to perpetuate itself. Rather, it should be seen as the revival of Apostolic Christianity, and he concludes with this invitation:

Thus, *reader*, thou hast the *character* of the people called *Quakers*, in their *doctrine*, *worship*, *ministry*, *practice* and *discipline*: compare it with Scripture, and primitive example, and we hope thou wilt find, that this short discourse hath, in good measure, answered the title of it, viz.:—*Primitive Christianity Revived, in the principles and practice of the people called Quakers*.

The interest of early Friends was thus not to start a new movement or sect, nor was it to pose a distinctive approach to Christian living over and against other movements or groups. No. They sought to actualize and embody the essence of New Testament Christianity, and upon experiencing the unction and outpouring of the Holy Spirit individually and collectively, they believed the age of the Apostles had indeed been restored. That is what lay behind their proclamation that Christ is come to teach his people himself—without need of human intermediaries or cultic rites—and such is the Everlasting Gospel they sought to spread throughout the earth.

While their experiences and understandings must be seen as emerging contextually, within the Radical Reformation of 17th-century England, their ethos cannot be confined to Continental spiritual mysticism or English Puritanism; they believed a new dispensation of divine grace and transforming power had been poured out upon them and that this gift was available to all who would be open to it. While modern interpreters might quibble with whether they "got it right" in terms of how to understand New Testament Christianity, such is what they understood themselves to be embracing and extending to others, and perhaps that venture is what continues to be most relevant for those seeking to follow their lead in later generations. Seeking to understand what early Friends (and early Christians) were seeking to do might pose a different result than seeking to comprehend what

they eventually did. In that sense, the best way to emulate the revival of Primitive Christianity in the lives of early Friends might not be to copy their contributions as traditions—a second-order venture; rather, the most "Quaker" way to proceed might involve seeking, with early Friends, to *experience the source of spiritual vitality that the Apostles and early Friends themselves experienced*—a first-order spiritual encounter and a lived experience. As was the case in the words of Jesus to Nicodemus, as the wind blows where it will and cannot be seen only felt—so it is with the ways of the Spirit (John 3:8).

III. *Primitive Christianity Revived*—An Alternative to or an Embodiment of Recent Interpretations of Quakerism?

On one hand, the thesis of the present article challenges several leading interpretations of the original Quaker vision, using William Penn's judgment as a lens through which best to view it. On the other hand, such a thesis is not incompatible with any of the four leading views, as well as more general approaches to understanding the historical and theological character and originative Friends movement. For instance, within Rufus Jones' paradigm, seeing the Friends movement as emerging in the company of spiritual and mystical branches of the larger Reformation, it must be said that these leaders were also seeking to live into the spiritual vitality and transformative experience characterized by Primitive Christianity. Jakob Böhme, for instance, saw "the way of salvation" as rooted in the Person of Christ and effected by the transformative work of the Holy Spirit, contrasting the true Church of Christ (the people) to churches as buildings, even if some of his views were somewhat problematic.⁴² While the theologies of some of the spiritual reformers were somewhat at odds with those of Friends, as well as New Testament teachings overall, their opposition to institutional Christianity, whether it be Catholic or Reformed, often rooted in alternative visions of the spiritual vitality characteristic of Primitive Christianity overall.

Likewise, the concerns of the Puritans in 17th-century England, as described so effectively by Geoffrey Nuttall, Frederick Tolles, and Hugh Barbour, also reflect deep concerns to recover biblical Christianity.⁴³ While Barbour's chapter on "Debate with Puritan Pastors" shows something of the contention between Quaker and Puritan leaders, it also illumines something of their similarities.⁴⁴ After all, territoriality

PRIMITIVE CHRISTIANITY REVIVED – THE ORIGINAL QUAKER VISION \bullet 17

exists only between members of like species. In many ways, Quakers would have fit well with their Puritan counterparts, and many Friends were of Puritan stock. Nonetheless, they opposed Cromwell's and other Puritan leaders' interest in power and control, including the willingness to use force to further worldly kingdoms rather than the kingdom of Christ. By the end of their first decade, Friends had developed a relatively coherent Peace Testimony (uncharacteristic of most Puritans' views), which they delivered to Charles II in 1660. Barbour's identification of "the Lamb's War" as the central thrust of the Quaker awakening reflects an eschatological understanding of God's workings in the world, as embraced by Revelation and Primitive Christianity.⁴⁵ Thus, in challenging Anglicans, Puritans, and fellow dissenters, early Friends propounded a view of Primitive Christianity that had some overlap but also was distinctive in its embrace of the eschatological working of God in society and in the lives of individuals.

The third major interpretation of early Quakerism, that personal transformation and holiness is key to understanding the experience of and message of Fox and early Friends, also roots in a radical understanding of Primitive Christianity Revived. The language of George Fox, that he had entered paradise through the "flaming sword" that had been placed at the entrance of the Garden of Eden (Genesis 3:24) reflects an understanding of what it means to participate in the second Adam—the new humanity—availed in Christ Jesus (Romans 5-6). Therefore, the compelling points made by Arthur Roberts and Carole Spencer, that the transforming work of Christ through the power of the Holy Spirit brings hope for humanityallowing the triumph of love, goodness, and peace over hatred, evil, and violence-reflects the heart of New Testament conviction. Receiving the righteousness of God by faith is not simply a juridical action; it involves a sanctifying new reality whereby God's righteous love and character indwell the life of the believer. In Penn's view, this is precisely the experience and message of New Testament Christians, and thus, Penn would see personal transformation as part and parcel of Primitive Christianity Revived. Or, as Frederick Tolles and Gordon Alderfer put it,

Quakerism, Penn honestly believed, was a modern breaking forth of that true Church, for it refused on principle to ally itself with political coercion. The reformation of man's unregenerate spirit was the only reformation sought by all the persistent minorities who, through the generations of Europe, aimed to recover and preserve the meaning of Christ.⁴⁶

And, as an eschatological understanding of God's movement, the prophetic understanding of early Friends certainly fits with Penn's dispensational understanding of Primitive Christianity Revived. With Lewis Benson, understanding the original Quaker vision certainly includes speaking truth to power, embracing direct encounter with the divine, addressing the social needs of the day, and sharing the good news with compassion and verve. Likewise, Gwyn's understanding of the revelation of the divine Word invites a continued openness to how Christ speaks and leads through the Holy Spirit, inviting dynamic receptivity and faithful responsiveness to the present leading, whatever it may be. Compromises with culture and materialism certainly run the risk of forfeiting the covenant into which the faithful are invited, but then again, the covenant itself is a gift of grace rather than a commodity to be merited or managed. As with Paul, John, and Jesus, it is by faith that the divine gift is received, and it is also by grace that believers' faithfulness is empowered.

Finally, an inductive analysis of the thrust of the early Quaker movement confirms Penn's view that early Friends sought to recover Primitive and Apostolic Christianity in a number of ways. In the 1652 inaugural sermon of George Fox at Firbank Fell, note the parallels to Jesus in the synagogue message of Luke 4 and the Sermon on the Mount in Matthew 5-7. In his healing ministries and miracles, most of these are presented as following the healing ministries of Jesus and the Apostles,⁴⁷ and even in his Epistles, Fox imitates the authors of the New Testament, sometimes in seven-fold ways. Likewise, Edward Burrough is called a "Son of Thunder," as Jesus called James and John in Mark 3:17. Even in the scandalous example of James Nayler's riding into Bristol on a donkey as women hailed "Hosanna," the explicit intention of his solicitors was to embody a Christocentric theme as a means of heralding the arrival of New Testament Christianity within 17th century England. In these and other ways, Friends saw themselves as playing the roles of the New Testament apostles, while their adversaries were cast in the roles of the religious leaders in the days of Jesus and his followers.

Such being the case, a fundamental mistake among Friends is to try to imitate something traditionally Quaker, when early Friends were seeking to recover the spiritual reality that early Quakers encountered and furthered, which is essentially inward and spiritual, rather than outward and religious. Thus, the central Quaker Concern is always transformative rather than conformative, and such is one of the most

PRIMITIVE CHRISTIANITY REVIVED – THE ORIGINAL QUAKER VISION \bullet 19

elusive features of seeking to understand and embrace the Quaker way.⁴⁸ Even if discovering something traditional is actualized, the goal is to mind the present leading, exemplified by such faithfulness imitating Christ and following his leading—rather than imitating our predecessors, though we are greatly helped in the former by considering the latter. As Elfrida Vipont reminds us, the Friendly adventure of George Fox did not begin when he climbed Pendle Hill; it began when he *felt moved of the Lord* to climb Pendle Hill, followed by his faithful obedience.⁴⁹

In all these ways, Penn's lens for understanding the early Quaker movement might yet pose the best possible lens for grasping and appreciating its original vision, as it serves not simply as an alternative to recent interpretations of the early Friends movement but more fittingly as their embodiment. Thus, regarding the charism of God's breaking into human history in the beginnings of Christianity, Penn's closing exhortation becomes an invitation, not only to perceive, but also to receive.

Thus, *Reader*, thou hast the *Character* of the People called *Quakers*, in their *Doctrine*, *Worship*, *Ministry*, *Practice* and *Discipline*: Compare it with Scripture, and Primitive Example, and we hope thou wilt find, that this short Discourse hath, in good Measure, Answered the Title of it, *viz. Primitive Christianity Revived, in the Principles and Practice of the People called* Quakers.

Endnotes

- Thus, Jim Newby uses the language of Robert Barclay, "Basic Christianity," as the title of a second collection of Quaker essays by Elton Trueblood: *Basic Christianity: Addresses of D. Elton Trueblood*, edited by James R. Newby (Richmond, IN: Friends United Press, 1977). Jim also gathered helpfully into a published form William Penn's *The Rise and Progress of the People Called Quakers* (Richmond, IN: Friends United Press, 1979). According to John Stephenson Rowntree (John Wilhelm's uncle), with regarding to Penn's *Primitive Christianity Revived*, "The beautiful thought present in this title is one which has been cherished by Friends throughout their history. Their desire has been practically to exemplify in a human society that spiritual conception of the kingdom of Christ, which is believed to be of the very essence of Primitive Christianity." *John Stephenson Rowntree: His Life and Work*, edited by Phebe Doncaster (London: Headley Brothers, 1908) 291.
- See the important treatment of Melvin B. Endy, Jr., William Penn and Early Quakerism (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1973). For an excellent and readable translation of William Penn's work, see Paul Buckley's translation into modern English: Primitive Christianity Revived: Translated into Modern English (San Francisco: Inner Light Books, 2018).

- Isaac Penington, "Concerning the Times and Seasons, Both which have Been, and which are yet to Be," *The Works of the Long-Mournful and Sorely-Distressed Isaac Penington*, Vol. II, 2nd edn. (1679, London: Samuel Clark, 1761) 677.
- 4. According to John Stevenson Rowntree (*His Life and Work*, 354), "It is one of the merits of William Penn's introduction to Fox's *Journal* that he shows the connection between the whole history of the Christian Church and the rise of the Friends. He expands this thought in his *Primitive Christianity Revived*. Is not this the side from which the history of Friends and their whole position should be approached?"
- 5. Rufus Jones, Studies in Mystical Religion (London: Macmillan, 1909); Rufus Jones, Isaac Sharpless, Amelia Gummere, The Quakers in the American Colonies (London: Macmillan, 1911); William C. Braithwaite, The Beginnings of Quakerism (London: Macmillan, 1912); Rufus Jones, Spiritual Reformers in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries (London: Macmillan, 1914); W.C. Braithwaite, The Second Period of Quakerism (London: Macmillan, 1919); Rufus Jones, The Later Periods of Quakerism (London: Macmillan, 1921). These books were commissioned by John Wilhelm Rowntree as a series, which according to Rufus Jones in his introduction to Braithwaite's The Beginnings of Quakerism, "should adequately exhibit Quakerism as a great experiment in spiritual religion, and should be abreast of the requirements of modern research" (p. v). Indeed, it can be argued that the birth and development of the Quaker movement is an exemplary showcase of spiritual and mystical religion during the third movement of the Reformation.
- 6. See, for instance, Joseph Besse, A Collection of the Sufferings of the People Called Quakers from 1650-1689, 2 Vols. (London: L. Hinde, 1753); see also William Sewell, The History of the Rise, Increase, and Progress of the Christian People Called Quakers: Intermixed With Several Remarkable Occurrences, 2 Vols. (London: J. Sowle, 1722; translated from the 1717 Dutch, republished many times).
- 7. Hugh Doncaster, in the second introduction to Braithwaite's *The Beginnings of Quakerism*, quotes Neave Brayshaw with regard to this volume: "it is one of the most valuable of all the pieces of Quaker history that have ever appeared." (p. vi).
- See especially the 2010 Birmingham thesis of Alice Southern, *The Rowntree History Series* and the Growth of Liberal Quakerism: 1895-1925.
- 9. L. Hugh Doncaster, "Foreword to the Second Edition," *The Beginnings of Quakerism*, by William C. Braithwaite, 2nd edn. (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1955), v-viii; Henry J. Cadbury, "Preface," Frederick B. Tolles, "Introduction," *The Second Period of Quakerism* by William C. Braithwaite (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1957), v-vii, xxv-xxxvi. To these two volumes edited by Henry J. Cadbury are also added his extensive Additional Notes (1955) 543-85; (1957), 648-714.
- 10. Hugh Barbour, Quakers in Puritan England (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1964); see also Hugh S. Barbour and J. William Frost, The Quakers (Westport, CT: Greenwood, 1988). In something of a complement to Barbour's overall thesis, Ben Richmond develops an apology for Quaker faith and practice simply by building upon biblical texts and their implications: Signs of Salvation: A New Life Where Grace and Truth Meet, A Biblical Meditation (Richmond, IN: Friends United Press, 2005). Indeed, it can be argued that the overall thrust of the concerns of early Friends were entirely biblical.
- 11. Arthur O. Roberts, *Through Flaming Sword: The Life and Legacy of George Fox*, 2nd ed. (1959, Newberg, OR: Barclay Press, 2008); Carole Dale Spencer, *Holiness: The Soul of Quakerism: An Historical Analysis of Holiness in the Quaker Tradition* (Milton Keynes: Paternoster, 2008). Thus, at the core of Quaker faith and practice is the belief that at the core of the gospel is experiential and transformative encounter with the Holy Spirit, leading to salvation, sanctification, and the newness of life.
- Robert Barclay, "Maturity" (or, "Perfection"), Barclay's Apology in Modern English, edited by Dean Freiday (Elberon, NJ: Hemlock Press, 1967) 154-165.

PRIMITIVE CHRISTIANITY REVIVED – THE ORIGINAL QUAKER VISION • 21

- Lewis Benson, Prophetic Quakerism (London: Friends Home Service Committee, 1943); Catholic Quakerism (London: Friends Home Service Committee, 1966); A Universal Faith (New Foundation Fellowship, 2007); None Were So Clear: Prophetic Quaker Faith and the Ministry of Lewis Benson, edited by T.H.S. Wallace (Foundation Publications, 1996).
- Benson, Catholic Quakerism, 90-96. See also William Penn's No Cross, No Crown: Modern English Edition Revised and Edited by Ron Selleck (Richmond, IN: Friends United Press, 1981).
- 15. Douglas Gwyn, Apocalypse of the Word: The Life and Message of George Fox, 1624-1691 (Richmond, IN: Friends United Press, 1986); The Covenant Crucified: Quakers and the Rise of Capitalism (Wallingford: Pendle Hill Publications, 1995); Seekers Found: Atonement in Early Quaker Experience (Wallingford: Pendle Hill Publications, 2000).
- 16. Gwyn, Seekers Found, 377-410.
- 17. Gerard Guiton, The Early Quakers and the 'Kingdom of God'—Peace, Testimony and Revolution (San Francisco: Inner Light Books, 2012). Thus, the early Quaker movement can rightly be seen as an eschatological dispensation of the Spirit, creating a "New Age" wherein Christ has won the cosmic victory through The Lamb's War, inviting participation in that new City of God, which has love as its law, truth as its king, and eternity as its measure.
- 18. For further treatments of recent interpretations of historical Quakerism, see Paul Anderson, "An Ongoing Heritage; An Epilogue," *The Rich Heritage of Quakerism,* by Walter R. Williams (1962, Newberg: Barclay Press, 1987) 254-63; Carole Spencer, *Holiness: The Soul of Quakerism,* 39-58; Ben Pink Dandelion, *An Introduction to Quakerism,* 2-4.
- 19. Neave Brayshaw, *The Quakers: Their Story and Their Message* (1921, York and London: William Sessions, 5th impression, 1953).
- 20.Elbert Russell, *The History of Quakerism* (New York: Macmillan, 1942); Elfrida Vipont, *The Story of Quakerism: Through Three Centuries* (1954; third edition, Richmond, IN: Friends United Press, 1977).
- 21. Walter Williams, *The Rich Heritage of Quakerism* (1962; with an epilogue by Paul Anderson, Newberg: Barclay Press, 1987); Howard Brinton, *Friends for 350 Years; The History and Beliefs of the Society of Friends Since George Fox Started the Quaker Movement* (1965; with historical update and page and line notes by Margaret Hope Bacon, Wallingford, PA: Pendle Hill Press, 2002).
- 22. D. Elton Trueblood, *The People Called Quakers* (New York: Harper and Row, 1966); *Basic Christianity: Addresses of D. Elton Trueblood*, edited by James R. Newby (Richmond, IN: Friends United Press, 1977). See also his *Robert Barclay* (New York: Harper Collins, 1968).
- 23. John Punshon, Portrait in Grey: A Short History of the Quakers (London: Quaker Home Service, 1984); Christopher Hill, The World Turned Upside Down: Radical Ideas During the English Revolution (London: Maurice Temple Smith, 1972). See also Ben Pink Dandelion, An Introduction to Quakerism (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007) and Paul Anderson, "John Bellers (1654-1725)—'A Veritable Phenomenon in the History of Political Economy," in Quakers, Business and Corporate Responsibility—Lessons and Cases for Responsible Management, edited by Nicholas Burton and Richard Turnbull (London: Springer, forthcoming in 2018).
- Moore, The Light in their Consciences: The Early Quakers in Britain, 1646-1666 (University Park, PA: Penn State University Press, 2000).
- 25. Early Quaker Writings, 1650-1700, edited by Hugh Barbour and Arthur Roberts (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1973); Hidden in Plain Sight: Quaker Women's Writings, 1650-1700, edited by Mary Garman, Judith Applegate, Margaret Benefiel, Dortha Meredith (Wallingford, PA: Pendle Hill Press, 1996).

- 26. Rosemary Moore, The Light in their Consciences: The Early Quakers in Britain 1646-1666 (University Park, PA: Penn State University Press, 2000). In that sense, Moore's work should be seen within the trajectory of Braithwaite's two volumes.
- 27. Compiled in 1657-1658, this book is 614 pages in length, including the introductory Epistle by Edward Burrough, in Vol. III of *The Works of George Fox* (Philadelphia, 1831). Thus, within the writings of Penington, Fox, and Barclay, as well as those of Penn, the rise and progress of the people called Quakers is rightly seen through the lens of a vision of *Primitive Christianity Revived*. What seems clear, though, is that the foregoing interpretations fit better into this rubric than vice versa.
- 28. Stephen W. Angell and Pink Dandelion, *The Oxford Handbook of Quaker Studies* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013). Note the ways that varying interpretations of Quakerism have influenced and been influenced by the various Quaker traditions and their spokespersons: Rosemary Moore, "Seventeenth-century Context and Quaker Beginnings," 13-28; Richard C. Allen, "Restoration Quakerism, 1660-1691," 29-46; Robynne Rogers Healy, "Quietist Quakerism, 1692-1805," 47-62; Thomas D. Hamm, "Hicksite, Orthodox, and Evangelical Quakerism, 1805-1887," 63-77; J. William Frost, "Modernist and Liberal Quakers, 1887-2010," 78-92; Gregory P. Hinshaw, "Five Years Meeting and Friends United Meeting, 1887-2010," 93-107; Arthur O. Roberts, "Evangelical Quakers, 1887-2010," 108-125; Lloyd Lee Wilson, "Conservative Friends, 1845-2010," 126-137. In each of these cases, it is clear how the roots and trunk of the Quaker family tree are envisioned from the perspectives of its various branches.
- 29. The first of three sections in *The Witness of William Penn* by Frederick B. Tolles and E. Gordon Alderfer (New York: Macmillan, 1957) is aptly titled "The Apostolic Christian" (3-60). In this third of the book, the authors address "God in History" (including *The Rise and Progress of the People Called Quakers*, the divine dispensations, the restoration of Primitive Christianity, and portrait of a prophet, 3-43) and "The Ethics of Radical Christianity" (including *No Cross, No Crown*, worship and the common life, pride of ancestry, the root of all evil, of dress and recreation, and righteousness and social policy, 44-60). His analyses match my own.
- 30. Elton Trueblood regards Barclay's *Apology* and Penn's *Rise and Progress* as "the strategy of the two chief intellectuals of our movement" in seeking to articulate the central vision and thrust of the Quaker movement as a people before they had a name. D. Elton Trueblood, "The Quaker Vision," *Basic Christianity*, 119-128, citation 119.
- 31. According to William Sessions, *William Penn, Soldier of the Cross and Empire Builder: His Times, His Faith, and His Works* (London: Headley, 1905), Many of Penn's minor works were in defence of the Friends from false and slanderous accusations, and involved 'apologies' for their principles, and sometimes histories of their origins, practices and sufferings. Such were 'Primitive Christianity Revived,' Quakerism, a new nick-name for Old Christianity,' 'The Rise and Progress of the People Called Quakers,' 'The Quaker Christian and his Divine Testimony stated,' etc. (19)
- 32. Eschatos means "last" or "final," so eschatology involves the study of God's breaking into human space and time with epoch-changing finality, doing something different and new, creating a New Age. And, such an interest is a worthy one, even in looking at the Acts of the Apostles, which Matt Mikalatos argues is an unfortunate name for Luke's second volume. When one looks at what is reported in Acts, the main acting character is the Holy Spirit, rather than human protagonists (such as Peter and Paul), whereby they and others operated in response to the Spirit's directions. Matt Mikalatos, Into the Fray: How Jesus's Followers Turn the World Upside Down (Grand Rapids: Baker, 2015), 33-38. By extension, even in exploring the eschatological character of the early Quaker movement, perhaps it is wrong-headed to ask, "What were early Quakers doing?" when the more important question might be, "What was the Holy Spirit—the Spirit of Christ—doing among and through Friends and others, in the rise and progress of the Quaker movement?" Indeed, there are several levels and modes of know-

PRIMITIVE CHRISTIANITY REVIVED – THE ORIGINAL QUAKER VISION • 23

ing, and with relation to spiritual vitality, even second-order accurate information can never compare to the power of first-order encounter. As Trueblood often reminded us, knowledge about is never the same as intimate acquaintance with.

- 33. This theme is featured especially clearly in William Penn, No Cross, No Crown.
- 34. Frederick Sessions, William Penn: Soldier of the Cross and Empire Builder, 18. The subtitle used in the Collection of the Works of William Penn (London: J. Sowle, 1729) is A Discourse Shewing The Nature And Discipline Of The Holy Cross Of Christ: And That The Denyal Of Self, And Daily Beating Of Christ's Cross, Is The Alone Way To The Rest And Kingdom Of God. To Which Are Added, The Living And Dying Testimonies Of Many Persons Of Fame And Learning, Both Of Ancient And Modern Times, In Favour Of This Treatise.
- 35. Also to be noted is that having become a fully convinced Friend upon hearing the Irish Quaker, Thomas Loe, preach again in 1666, it was the dying words of Loe that inspired the title for this work. In addition to saying, "There is a faith that overcomes the world and a faith that is overcome by the world," Thomas Loe declared just a few days before he died, "Dear heart, bear thy cross, stand faithful for God and bear thy testimony in thy day and generation; and God will give thee an eternal crown of glory that none shall ever take from thee. There is not another way. Bear thy cross. Stand faithful for God. This is the way the holy men of old walked in and it shall prosper." Maria Webb, *Penns and Peningtons of the Seventeenth Century* (Philadelphia: H. Longstreth, 1881) 107-08; cited by Ron Selleck, "Introduction," *No Cross, No Crown*, vii-viii.
- 36. It is thus with good reason that Henry J. Cadbury gave his academic life to understanding the Acts of the Apostles. If the thrust of the early Quaker vision lay in recovering the vitality of early Christianity, a lifetime of inquiry into that subject coheres entirely with his concern for the Quaker movement, the American Friends Service Committee (which he and his brother-in-law, Rufus Jones co-founded, and for which he was a co-recipient of the Nobel Peace Prize in 1947), and the vitality of the Christian movement overall. See Margaret Hope Bacon, *Let This Life Speak: The Legacy of Henry Joel Cadbury* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1987). See also the following books on Luke/Acts and Jesus by Henry J. Cadbury, which I have introduced with new forewords: *The Making of Luke-Acts* (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 1999); *The Book of Acts in History* (Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock, 2004); *The Peril of Modernizing Jesus* (Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock, 2008).
- 37. Additional previous works on the subject include "Quakerism, a new nick-name for Old Christianity," "The Christian Quaker and his Divine Testimony stated," "The Great Case of Liberty of Conscience," "A Serious Apology for the Principles and Practices of the People Called Quakers," "Wisdom Justified of her Children," "A Testimony to the Truth of God, as held by the People, called Quakers," "The Christian Quaker, and his Divine Testimony, Stated and Vindicated, from Scripture, Reason and Authority," and "A Discourse of the General Rule of Faith and Practice," among others.
- See Paul Anderson, "A Dynamic Christocentricity—The Center of Faithful Praxis," *Quaker Religious Thought* #105 (2005): 20-36; also *Following Jesus*, 177-186.
- 39. Paul N. Anderson, The Christology of the Fourth Gospel: Its Unity and Disunity in the Light of John 6, WUNT 2/78 (1996, third printing with a new Introduction and Epilogue, Eugene: Cascade Books, 2010); "The Johannine Logos-Hymn: A Cross-Cultural Celebration of God's Creative-Redemptive Work," Creation Stories in Dialogue: The Bible, Science, and Folk Traditions (Radboud Prestige Lecture Series by Alan Culpepper), edited by R. Alan Culpepper and Jan van der Watt, BINS 139 (Leiden: E.J. Brill, 2016) 219-242. On Heraclitus and the divine principle, see "The Word," The New Interpreter's Dictionary of the Bible, Vol. 5, edited by Katherine Doob Sakenfeld (Nashville: Abingdon, 2009), 893-898.
- 40. William Penn, A Brief Account of the Rise and Progress of the People Called Quakers; the introduction to The Journal of George Fox, edited by Thomas Elwood (London, 1694).

- 41. On Apostolic Succession, see Paul Anderson, *Following Jesus: The Heart of Faith and Practice* (Newberg: Barclay Press, 2013) 9-13. Along these lines, if the spiritual vitality of the Apostles is considered as an eschatological succession, perhaps the Quaker explosion should most fittingly be regarded as a bridge between the Spirit's being poured out at Pentecost (Acts 2) and the birth of the modern charismatic movement (Azusa 1906). After all, as Mel (Cecil) Robek points out, several Quaker ministers—in particular, Levi Upton, pastor of Alliance Friends Church in Ohio, along with some Quaker women minsters present—were involved in leadership during the Azusa Street meetings, leading to the Pentecostal explosion of 1906. Given that there are over half a billion Charismatic Christians in the world today, one wonders if this movement might also be considered a spiritual legacy in which Friends have played a facilitative role. Cecil M. Robek, Jr., *The Azusa Street Mission and Revival: The Birth of the Global Pentecostal Movement* (Nashville: Thomas Nelson, 2006) 228-234.
- 42. Rufus M. Jones, Spiritual Reformers in the 16th and 17th Centuries, 190-207.
- 43. Geoffrey F. Nuttall, The Holy Spirit in Puritan Faith and Practice (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1946); Frederick B. Tolles, Quakers and the Atlantic Culture (New York: Macmillan, 1960); Hugh Barbour, The Quakers in Puritan England.
- 44. Barbour, 127-59.
- 45. Barbour, 33-71.
- Frederick B. Tolles and E. Gordon Alderfer, *The Witness of William Penn* (New York: Macmillan, 1957) xxvii.
- 47. Note the numerous parallels between the miracles of George Fox and the miracles of the New Testament, noted in Paul Anderson, "Foreword," *George Fox's Book of Miracles, Edited with an Introduction and Notes by Henry J. Cadbury* (Philadelphia: Friends General Conference, 2000), xviii-xxvii.
- 48. Such is the conviction of Paul Buckley, who sees the engagement of William Penn's *Primitive Christianity Revived* as the secret to recovering the spiritual vitality of the early Friends Movement: *Primitive Quakerism Revived: Living as Friends in the Twenty-First Century* (San Francisco: Inner Light Books, 2018).
- 49. Elfrida Vipont, The Story of Quakerism, 28-29.